TOX/2017/45

COMMITTEE ON TOXICITY OF CHEMICALS IN FOOD, CONSUMER PRODUCTS AND THE ENVIRONMENT

Review of potential risks from ochratoxin A (OTA) in the diet of infants aged 0 to 12 months and children aged 1 to 5 years

Background

1. The Scientific Advisory Committee on Nutrition (SACN) is undertaking a review of scientific evidence that will inform the Government dietary recommendations for infants and young children. The SACN is examining the nutritional basis for the advice. The COT was asked to review the risk of toxicity of chemicals in the diets of infants and young children. The reviews will identify new evidence that has emerged since the Government recommendations were formulated and will appraise that evidence to determine whether the advice should be revised. The recommendations cover diet from birth to age five years.

2. The Food Standards Agency (FSA) has completed a survey of 36 mycotoxins in the 2014 Total Diet Survey (TDS) – mycotoxins analysis (FSA, to be published). The results of the survey provide information on the concentrations of aflatoxins (B1, B2, G1, G2 and M1), ochratoxin A, zearalenone, fumonisins (B1, B2 and B3), 3acetyldeoxynivalenol, 15-acetyldeoxynivalenol, deoxynivalenol, diacetoxyscirpenol, fusarenon-X, HT2 toxin, neosolaniol, nivalenol, T2 toxin, sterigmatocystin, citrinin, cyclopiazonic acid, moniliformin, patulin and ergot alkaloids (ergocornine, ergocorninine, ergocristine, ergocristinine, ergotamine, ergotaminine) in relevant foods. Estimates of dietary exposures have been calculated for each mycotoxin for UK infants and young children aged 4 to 60 months using food consumption data taken from the Diet and Nutrition Survey of Infants and Young Children (DNSIYC) and the National Diet and Nutrition Survey (NDNS).

3. Details of the concentration data derived from this survey, and the subsequent exposure assessments, were presented to the Committee in a scoping paper (TOX/2017/30) at the July meetings. To aid the discussions, brief toxicology summaries for each of the mycotoxins surveyed were included, along with available health based guidance values, a risk assessment, where possible and possible conclusions. The Committee commented on the concentration data and the results of the exposure assessments, and suggested that certain mycotoxins be reviewed in more detail. This paper (TOX-2017-45) provides more toxicological information for ochratoxin A (OTA), an in depth description of the previously established Health Based Guidance Value (HBGV) by JECFA and EFSA and new in vivo toxicological data published since the 2006 EFSA opinion. In addition this paper provides an exposure assessment for OTA in breast milk using European data from the literature and an updated exposure assessment for OTA in the diet of infants and young children aged 1 to 5 years.

4. OTA is a mycotoxin produced by several fungi species in the *Penicillium* and *Aspergillus* genera, primarily *Penicillum verrucosum*, *Aspergillus ochraceus* and *Aspergilli* of the section *Nigri*, especially *A. carbonarius*. OTA has been reported in a variety of plant products such as cereals and cereal products, coffee beans, beans, pulses, cocoa products, nuts and spices and dried fruit all over the world. It has also been detected in products such as coffee, wine, beer and grape juice and occurs in kidney, liver and blood from farm animals by transfer from animal feed (EFSA, 2006; EFSA, 2010).

5. OTA has been assessed previously by the Joint FAO/WHO Expert Committee on Food Additives (JECFA) in 2001 and the European Food Safety Authority (EFSA) in 2006¹.

6. In 2010² EFSA evaluated 5 research articles providing recent data on the toxicity of OTA and concluded that the data did not alter the evaluation carried out in 2006 (EFSA, 2010).

7. The current discussion paper provides a summary of the toxicity of OTA, where data is available. The paper draws on the EFSA opinion (2006) and the EFSA statement (2010) and includes a literature review (Annex A) to identify any relevant in vivo toxicity studies published since the 2006 EFSA Opinion. The derivation of the health based guidance values (HBGVs) for the above evaluations is detailed. Exposure assessments have been carried out and risk characterisations and conclusions/discussions provided.

Toxicokinetics

8. The toxicokinetics of OTA have been previously reviewed by EFSA (2006).

9. OTA is rapidly absorbed following ingestion. Animal studies showed absorptions between 40 % (chickens) and 66 % (pigs). OTA reaches the systemic circulation, where it is primarily bound to plasma proteins. The unbound fraction of OTA is as low as 0.02 % in humans.

10. A two-compartment open model, consisting of a fast distribution and elimination phase followed by a slow elimination phase (plasma clearance) and a long half-life has been described for in vivo data. Based on limited data the longest half-life has been described in humans of 35 days based on one individual. The half-life in other species ranges from 5 days in Wister rats, 6 days in pigs and 9-21 days in non-human primates.

11. In many species, including monkeys and humans, renal elimination is the major route of excretion. In rodents, biliary excretion seems to prevail. Differences in the degree of serum protein binding and its effect on renal clearance, as well as the

¹ EFSA opinion available at: <u>https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/365</u>

² EFSA statement available at: <u>https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/1626</u>

rate of conjugation and extent of entero-hepatic re-circulation contribute largely to the inter-individual and interspecies variability of kinetic parameters.

Toxicity

Summary from previous evaluations

12. The toxicity of OTA has previously been evaluated by JECFA. JECFA concluded that none of the new data that had become available indicate any reason for the HBGV established by JECFA in 1991 and rounded in 1995 to be altered. The PTWI of 100 ng/kg bw was retained (FAO/WHO, 2007). The Scientific Committee for Food (SCF) evaluated OTA in 1996 and 1998 (EC, 1996; EC, 1998). In 1998, with concerns about potential genotoxicity of OTA the SCF recommended that exposures should be reduced as much as possible and kept to the lower end of a range of TDI's of 1.2 – 14 ng/kg bw/day, preferably below 5 ng/kg bw/day (SCF, 1998).

Studies used in the derivation of the HBGV

13. Both, JECFA and EFSA used two experimental pig studies for the derivation of their HBGVs.

14. In a study by Elling (1979) female pigs were exposed to OTA at 5 mg/kg feed (calculated by the authors to a corresponding exposure of 400 μ g/kg bw) for 5 days or at 1 mg/kg feed (no corresponding μ g/kg bw exposure was calculated by the authors) for 3 months or 2 years. In the higher dose group, desquamation and focal necrosis of epithelial cells were detected in the proximal tubule of some nephrons. The activity of various enzymes was reduced in the area of the proximal tubules that showed morphological changes. In the lower dose group the histopathological changes observed were focal degeneration and necrosis of the proximal tubular cells. The lesions after 2 years were the same as after 3 month, except the tubular atrophy and the interstitial fibrosis were more widely distributed in the renal cortex. The authors concluded that OTA induced a reduction in enzyme activity, thus appearing to cause the impairment of proximal tubular function and morphological changes observed in porcine nephropathy (Elling 1979).

15. In a study by Krogh et al. (1988) female pigs received a gelatine capsule daily containing OTA at 0.25 mg and 1.17 mg, corresponding to a feed level of 1 ppm and 0.2 ppm. Renal impairment was observed in both experimental groups after 5 weeks of exposure. Further, the activities of both cytosolic phosphoenolpyruvate carboxykinase (PEPCK) and gamma-glutamyl transpeptidase were decreased after 1 week of exposure and the enzyme activities stayed inhibited for the duration of the experiment. No light-microscopic changes could be detected in kidneys of any of the animals. Due to the correlation of an increased renal impairment and decreased enzyme activity, the authors concluded that these enzymes are sensitive indicators of OTA induced porcine nephropathy (Krogh et al. 1988).

HBGV established by JECFA and EFSA

JECFA

16. JECFA first evaluated OTA in 1991, establishing a provisional tolerable weekly intake (PTWI) of 112 ng/kg bw per day based on the deterioration of renal function in pigs as given in the studies by Elling (1979) and Krogh et al. (1988) (Paragraphs 15 and 16). The LOEL was 8 μ g/kg bw per day to which the Committee applied an uncertainty factor of 500.

17. Since then JECFA has re-evaluated OTA in 1995, 2001, 2006 and 2008 due to new toxicological data becoming available. JECFA confirmed the PTWI in each evaluation, rounding it to 100 ng/kg bw per day in 1995. For the 2006 evaluation JECFA also considered the EFSA opinion from earlier that year.

18. In order to provide additional information for the risk assessment JECFA performed BMD modelling in their 2008 evaluation, using carcinogenicity data from the rat bioassay performed by the National Toxicology Program (NTP) in 1989. JECFA considered this to be the most appropriate data for modelling due to the occurrence of combined adenomas and carcinomas in kidneys and male rats being the most sensitive species and sex for kidney carcinogenicity.

19. The lowest BMDL₁₀ had a value of 15 μ g/kg bw per day and the model having the best fit had a value of 25 μ g/kg bw per day. JECFA therefore concluded that for establishing the PTWI, the BMDL₁₀ does not provide a lower point of departure than the previously used LOEL for minimal renal toxicity in the pig.

20. JECFA concluded that the new data on nephrotoxicity, developmental toxicity, neurotoxicity or immunotoxicity do not indicate any reason to modify the previously taken approach and retained the previous PTWI of 100 ng/kg bw.

EFSA opinion, 2006

21. In its 2006 opinion, EFSA considered that there was an absence of conclusive evidence that OTA binds to DNA and therefore concluded that the hazard characterisation should be based on nephrotoxicity. The most sensitive and pivotal effects of OTA are its effects on the kidneys in rats and pigs.

22. The selected (female) pig studies were based on the 2001 JECFA opinion. The LOAEL for progressive nephropathy was 40 μ g OTA/kg bw per day, whereas the NOAEL in the same study was 8 μ g/kg bw/day in the diet for 2 years. In a 90-day feeding study in female pigs 8 μ g OTA/kg bw/day was reported to produce effects on renal enzymes and renal function tests (Elling 1979; Krogh et al. 1988).

23. EFSA concluded that 8 μ g/kg bw per day was a LOAEL representing an early marker of renal toxicity in experimental animals (i.e. female pigs) and likely to be close to a NOAEL as the observed changes in biochemical markers indicated transient changes in the kidneys (EFSA, 2006; JECFA 2001).

24. The default factor of 2.5 was used to account for toxicodynamic effects of interspecies differences; the Panel noting that there were significant differences between species, especially with regard to protein binding. A factor of 6 was applied to account for kinetic differences in consideration of the plasma half-life. The

common uncertainty factor (UF) of 10 was used to extrapolate from the general population to a potentially sensitive sub-population. In addition EFSA used a factor of 3 to take into account the extrapolation from a LOAEL to a NOAEL.

25. Using the LOAEL of 8 μ g/kg bw/day and applying a total UF of 450 EFSA established a tolerable daily intake of approximately 18 ng OTA/kg bw per day.

26. However, given the relatively long half-life of OTA, approximately 20 days in monkeys, 5 days in Wistar rats, 6 days in pigs and 35 days in one individual (human), EFSA considered that a tolerable weekly intake (TWI) of up to 120 ng/kg bw was more appropriate.

EFSA statement, 2010

27. In 2010, EFSA was asked to assess five publications with recent scientific information on the toxicity of OTA. EFSA noted that four of these publications addressed the possible co-exposure of OTA and aristolochic acid of populations in areas previously associated with higher prevalence of Balkan Endemic Nephropathy.

28. The Panel concluded that the information provided was not relevant to the overall assessment and thus would neither contradict nor change the conclusions reached in the 2006 opinion. The TWI of 120 ng/kg bw was retained.

In vivo toxicity studies published since the 2006 EFSA opinion

29. A literature search has been performed to obtain any new *in vivo* toxicity studies since the EFSA opinion in 2006. A total number of 31 studies were identified, 7 in pigs, 20 in rats, 3 in mice and one study in rabbits. Overall, the findings of these studies were in line with the 2006 EFSA opinion. Some of the studies focused their research in more detail on molecular mechanisms and mode of action than histopathological findings, some investigated carcinogenicity or teratogenicity of OTA. A more detailed overview of the studies retrieved can be found in Table 7 in Annex A. A summary of the literature search can be found in Annex B

30. None of the studies proposed new/different HBGVs. However, some of the studies such as Balogh et al. (2007), Tanaka et al. (2016), Rached et al. (2007), Patil et al. (2006) and Prabu et al. (2013) provided NAOELs/LOAELS, all of which were higher than the LOEL of 8 μ g/kg bw used by EFSA in 2006.

Human breast milk

31. Literature searches were performed to identify applicable data for OTA in breastmilk. As no data for the UK could be identified, the search was expanded to include EU studies which are summarized in Table 1 below. A summary of the literature search can be found in Annex B.

32. Most levels found in breast milk from European member states (Scandinavia, Italy, Slovakia) were in the range of 1.1 - 182 ng OTA/L. Two Italian studies however reported higher levels of OTA, from maximum levels of 405 ng/L to ranges of 1200/1700 - 6600 ng/L.

33. Three of the reported breast milk studies included questionnaires reporting dietary and consumption habits, including frequency and portion size (Biassuci et al. 2011; Galvano et al. 2008; Skaug et al 2001). All of the studies noted a correlation of OTA concentration in breast milk and (cured) pork meat (Biasucci et al, 2011; Glavano et al.; 2008) or processed meat products Skaug et al., 2001). Other food commodities correlating with OTA concentration were soft drinks, sweets and red wine (Biasucci et al., 2011), bread and bakery products (Galvano et al., 2008) and breakfast cereal, and cheese (Skaug ey al.; 2001).

Table 1 Concentrations of OTA in breastmilk available from the published literature

57	10 ± 15.6	1.1		
		1.1	≥ 75.1	Biasucci 2011
76		2.3 ± 0.99	60.3 ± 25.93	Dostal et al 2008
82	30.43 ± 66.89	< 5	405	Galvano et al 2008
13	5.6 ± 4	5.3	17	Postupolski et al 2006
80	30 (16*)	10	182	Skaug 2001
115		10	130	Skaug et al 1998
40		10	40	Breitholtz- Emanuelsson 1993
50		1200 1700	6600 6600	Micco et al 1991
				Zimmerli & Dick
	(1 sample)			1995
Women)	F (
	82 13 80 115 40	82 30.43 ± 66.89 13 5.6 ± 4 80 30 (16*) 115	82 30.43 ± 66.89 < 5	82 30.43 ± 66.89 < 5 405 13 5.6 ± 4 5.3 17 13 5.6 ± 4 5.3 17 80 $30 (16^*)$ 10 182 115 10 130 40 10 40 50 1200 6600 $10?$ $14 \pm 2 pg/g$ 1200 6600 $10?$ $14 \pm 2 pg/g$ 1200 6600 50 $5pg/g$ 1200 6600 $5pg/g$ $5pg/g$ $14 \pm 2 pg/g$ $14 \pm 2 pg/g$ 80 30 thers 10 10

^a Average concentration is the mean or median, where it is the median this has been indicated with *. Where it has been available, the standard deviation has also been provided as ±....

*unclear from the study which one of the values is correct, one reported in abstract, the other reported in the main text of the paper

Exposure Assessment

34. Levels of various mycotoxins were measured in the Total dietary Survey (TDS), including OTA. Only five food categories contained measurable residues of OTA, the rest were all below the LOQ. OTA was found in the fruit and vegetable juices, dried fruit, herbs and spices and bread (granary, brown) food categories. While the data obtained from the TDS could be used as a qualitative indicator of mycotoxins present in various food categories, it is not possible to use it for a quantitative estimation of dietary exposures for the following reasons:

35. Since analysis of the TDS samples involved a wide range of matrices (some of which have not been routinely examined previously), existing validated methods were adapted/extended to some of the new matrices. For example, the method used for grape juice or wine was used to analyse the composite sample of fruit and vegetable juices. However, the presence of other fruit & vegetables (e.g. orange, carrot etc.) in addition to grape has led to some analytical difficulties, with poor recoveries and consequently high results. The low recovery meant that the large correction inflated the result and will impact on calculated dietary exposures. Given the low recovery of 32 %, this method is not considered suitable for this food matrix. Also, the reported level of 5.62 μ g/kg OTA in the fruit and vegetable juice category was much higher than the average based on EFSA survey data (0.55 μ g/kg).

36. Further, a range of matrices was included in a single batch in the analysis of mycotoxins. This has had an impact on recoveries, since usually in a given batch, similar matrices are included and a batch average recovery is applied and the spiked samples are the same food matrix. In the above example, three very different matrices - dried fruit and herbs and spices were included in the batch with fruit and vegetable juices (each individually spiked). If a batch recovery average which is not specific to the fruit juice matrix and grape juice method is applied, it would give an average recovery of 72 % when applied to this sample. This would give a lower result but is also not a reliable approach given the differences in sensitivities of the methods and food matrices used in the TDS.

37. A multi-mycotoxin method was used in the analysis for various food groups, which is normally a screening method rather than a sensitive technique. This is reflected in generally poor recoveries, higher Limits of Quantification/Detection (LOQ/LOD) and when these were corrected for recovery, led to artificially inflated occurrence levels in some cases. This also indicates the unsuitability of using the TDS data for quantitative exposure estimates.

38. Therefore, occurrence data from the TDS are not suitable for estimating dietary exposures quantitatively. They are not sensitive enough and the methods are not sufficiently standardised and validated for this purpose.

39. Alternative OTA survey data were therefore considered for calculating dietary exposures for infants and young children. Exposures were calculated using data from foods analysed in years 1 and 2 of the four-year retail survey (FSA, 2010; FSA)

2011) and consumption data from the Diet and Nutrition Survey of Infants and Young Children (DNSIYC) and the National Diet and Nutrition Survey rolling programme (NDNS) years 1 - 6 (Bates et al., 2014; Bates et al., 2016). Exposures were assessed for infants aged 0 - < 4, $4 \ 0 < 6$, 6 - < 9 and 9 - < 12 months, and for young children aged 12 - < 15, 15 - < 18, 18 - < 24 and 24 - < 60 months. Consumption data from DNSIYC was used for children aged 4 - 18 months and from NDNS for children aged 10 - 60 months.

Human breast milk

40. Due to improved detection methodologies in recent years and the high LOD of 200 ng/L in the study by Micco et al. (1991), this study was considered of limited relevance and has therefore not been used in the exposure assessment.

41. The study by Galvano et al. (2008) has been selected for the exposure assessment. The minimum concentration (< 5 ng/L) detected is in agreement with a range of other studies, while the maximum (405 ng/L) concentration detected is the highest value reported and can therefore be considered conservative.

42. Based on the levels given by Glavano et al. (2008) OTA exposure levels were estimated for exclusively breastfed infants consuming average (800 mL) and high-level (1200 mL) volumes of breast milk (Table 2). Using the average OTA concentration of 30.43 ng/L, exposures in the 0 to < 4 month olds were 4.1 and 6.2 ng/kg bw per day for average and high consumers, respectively; for 4 to < 6 months old exposures were 3.1 and 4.7 ng/kg bw per day for average and high consumers, respectively.

Table 2 OTA exposure (ng/kg bw per day) from exclusive breastfeeding estimated
for average and high level consumption of breast milk

	Exposure (ng/kg bw/day)							
OTA	Average co (800 mL		High consumer (1200 mL/day)					
concentration (ng/L)	0 to < 4 months	4 to < 6 months	0 to < 4 months	4 to < 6 months				
Minimum < 5	< 0.68	< 0.51	< 1.02	< 0.77				
Maximum 405	55	42	82	62				
Average 30.43	4.1	3.1	6.2	4.7				

Infant exposure is based on consumption of 800 mL or 1200 mL per day, and expressed on a bodyweight (5.9 kg for infants aged 0-4 months and 7.8 kg for infants aged > 4-6 months) basis Values rounded to 2 significant figures (SF)

43. Based on the levels given by Glavano et al. (2008) OTA exposure levels were also calculated for non-exclusive breastfed infants using consumption data from DNSIYC. An OTA average concentration in breast milk of 30.43 ng/kg could lead to mean OTA exposures of 0.77 to 2.8 pg/kg bw per day and 97.5th percentile exposures of 1.8 to 4.7 μ g/kg bw per day (Table 3) in infants aged 4 to 18 months.

Table 3 OTA exposure (pg/kg bw per day) from non-exclusive breastfeeding.

OTA	Exposure (pg/kg bw/day)

concentration (ng/L)	4 to < 6 months				9 to < 12 months		12 to < 15 months		15 to < 18 months	
	Mean	97.5 th	Mean	97.5 th	Mean	97.5 th	Mean	97.5 th	Mean	97.5 th
Minimum < 5	<0.46	<0.77	<0.33	<0.80	<0.19	<0.58	<0.12	<0.38	<0.13	<0.26
Maximum 405	37	63	27	64	15	47	12	30	10	21
Average 30.43	2.8	4.7	2.02	4.8	1.2	3.5	0.89	2.3	0.77	1.8

Values rounded to 2 SF

Other dietary sources

44. The FSA recognises the need to monitor foodstuff for the levels of mycotoxins and undertook two FSA retail surveys in 2010 and 2011 (FSA, 2010; FSA, 2011). A total of 225 products, were collected on behalf of FSA, samples were purchased from major and independent supermarkets, independent and specialist retailers and online. The products tested comprised of foods based on maize, wheat, rye and barley and commercial infant and young children foods.

45. Year 1 of the UK retail survey investigated the presence of mycotoxins in a range of cereals and cereal based products. 75 samples of maize (corn) products were analysed for OTA, 92 % (69 samples) were below the LOQ (0.1 μ g/kg). 75 samples of wheat products were analysed for OTA, 47 % (35 samples) were below the LOQ (0.1 μ g/kg). 35 samples of rye and barley products were analysed for OTA, 66 % (23 samples) were below the LOQ (0.1 μ g/kg).

46. Year 2 of the UK retail survey investigated the presence of mycotoxins in food produced for infants and young children. 77 samples of commercial infants and young children foods were analysed for OTA. 83% (64 samples) were below the LOQ ($0.05 \mu g/kg$); 2.6% (2 samples) were above the LOD ($0.02 \mu g/kg$) but below the LOQ and 14% (11 samples) were at or above the LOQ. These analytical data were used for calculating the exposures provided in Tables 4, 5 and 6 as lower bound (LB) and upper bound (UB) estimates.

47. For children aged 4 to 18 months (Table 4 and 5) mean total UB exposures ranged from 0.63 - 1.3 ng/kg bw per day; the 97.5th percentile total UB exposures ranged from 2.5 - 3.2 ng/kg bw per day (UB).

48. For children aged 18 to 60 months (Table 6) the total mean UB exposures ranged from 0.99 - 1.3 ng/kg bw per day (UB). The corresponding 97.5th percentile UB total exposures ranged from 2.3 - 3.4 ng/kg bw per day.

49. Wheat products made the main contribution to total exposure in all age groups.

Table 4 Estimated OTA chronic exposure to children aged 4 to 12 months using data from foods analysed in years 1 and 2 of the four - year surveillance programme (retail survey)

	Exposure LB-UB (ng/kg bw/day)										
Food Groups	4 to	<6 m-olds (n=	116)	6 to	6 to <9 m-olds (n=606)			9 to <12 m-olds (n=686)			
• •	Number of consumers	Mean	97.5th Percentile	Number of consumers	Mean	97.5th Percentile	Number of consumers	Mean	97.5th Percentile		
Commercial Infant & young children Foods (77 samples)	100	0.12-0.58	0.49-2.4	578	0.14-0.72	0.53-2.6	618	0.14-0.69	0.51-2.6		
Maize (corn) products (75 samples)	15	0.0041- 0.041	0.024-0.24	150	0.0025- 0.025	0.011-0.11	250	0.0035- 0.035	0.014-0.14		
Wheat products (75 samples)	21	0.13-0.18	0.47-0.66	383	0.36-0.50	1.4-1.9	607	0.52-0.73	1.5-2.1		
Rye and barley products (35 samples)	7	0.016-0.020	0.041-0.053	32	00.036- 0.045	0.18-0.23	65	0.060-0.076	0.22-0.28		
TOTAL of 4 groups above	100	0.15-0.63	0.53-2.5*	599	0.37-1.0	1.2-2.9*	685	0.58-1.3	1.6-3.2*		

* Determined from a distribution of consumption of any combination of categories rather than by summation of the respective individual 97.5th percentile consumption value for each of the three food categories

NOTE: Please note that consumption or exposure estimates made with a small number of consumers may not be statistically reliable. As a guide, estimates based on less than 60 consumers should be treated with extreme caution

Table 5 Estimated OTA chronic exposures to children aged 12 to 18 months using data from foods analysed in years 1 and 2 of the four - year surveillance programme (retail survey)

			Exposure LB-U	B (ng/kg bw/day)			
Food Groups	12	to <15 m-olds (n=6	670)	15 to <18 m-olds (n=605)			
	Number of consumers	Mean	97.5th Percentile	Number of consumers	Mean	97.5th Percentile	
Commercial Infant & young children Foods (77 samples)	471	0.10-0.48	0.41-2.0	338	0.066-0.33	0.26-1.3	
Maize (corn) products (75 samples)	302	0.0045-0.045	0.016-0.16	296	0.0049-0.05	0.018-0.18	
Wheat products (75 samples)	649	0.68-0.96	1.9-2.7	597	0.75-1.1	1.7-2.4	
Rye and barley products (35 samples)	47	0.16-0.20	0.71-0.90	25	0.15-0.19	0.62-0.78	
TOTAL of 4 groups above	667	0.74-1.3	2.0-3.2*	602	0.79-1.3	1.8-2.9*	

* Determined from a distribution of consumption of any combination of categories rather than by summation of the respective individual 97.5th percentile consumption value for each of the three food categories

NOTE: Please note that consumption or exposure estimates made with a small number of consumers may not be statistically reliable. As a guide, estimates based on less than 60 consumers should be treated with extreme caution

Table 6 Estimated OTA chronic exposure to children aged 18 to 60 months using data from foods analysed in years 1 and 2 of the four - year surveillance programme (retail survey)

			Exposure LB-U	B (ng/kg bw/day)			
Food Groups	18	to 24 m-olds (n=1	18)	24 to 60 m-olds (n=688)			
	Number of consumers	Mean	97.5th Percentile	Number of consumers	Mean	97.5th Percentile	
Commercial Infant & young children Foods (77 samples)	43	0.058-0.29	0.21-1.0	78	0.028-0.14	0.19-0.94	
Maize (corn) products (75 samples)	56	0.0059-0.059	0.025-0.25	301	0.0056-0.056	0.019-0.19	
Wheat products (75 samples)	118	0.81-1.1	2.3-3.2	678	0.68-0.96	1.6-2.2	
Rye and barley products (35 samples)	6	0.08-0.10	0.19-0.24	27	0.08-0.10	0.20-0.26	
TOTAL of 4 groups above	118	0.84-1.3	0.23-3.4*	685	0.68-0.99	0.16-2.3*	

* Determined from a distribution of consumption of any combination of categories rather than by summation of the respective individual 97.5th percentile consumption value for each of the three food categories

NOTE: Please note that consumption or exposure estimates made with a small number of consumers may not be statistically reliable. As a guide, estimates based on less than 60 consumers should be treated with extreme caution

Risk characterisation

Human breast milk

50. Assuming a low or average concentration of OTA, all estimated exposures for infants under the age of 6 month, feed exclusively on breast milk are below the TWI. These exposures are not of toxicological concern.

51. Assuming a high OTA concentration (405 ng/L) exposures for low consumption (800 mL) are 2.5 – 3 times the TWI and for high consumption (1200 mL) 3.5 – 5 times the TWI. The high concentration used here might not be representative, other studies report maximum occurrence values well below 405 ng/L. The likelihood of exposure to such concentrations is therefore unlikely. In addition, the TWI is set on lifetime consumption and due to the relatively short duration of breastfeeding, infants would not be expected to be exposed to these levels for a prolonged period of time.

52. All mean and 97.5th percentile exposures for infants under the age of 18 months, fed non-exclusively on breast milk are below the TWI. These exposures are not of toxicological concern.

Other dietary sources

53. In infants and young children all mean and 97.5th percentile exposures were below the TWI. These exposures are not of toxicological concern.

Uncertainties in the risk characterisation

54. The study by Galvano et al. (2008) found concentrations of OTA in breastmilk ranging from < 5 to 405 ng/L, with an average of 30.43 ng/L. High levels of OTA in other studies were in the range of 60 -182 ng/L, the chosen highest value for exposure might therefore be conservative and not representative. It is also unlikely that infants would be continuously exposed to high levels.

55. No information on LODs or LOQs were given in the study and while the higher concentrations in breast milk were linked to high consumption of bread and cereal based foods as well as alcoholic beverages in a few cases, no clear reason was provided for the high maximum value or it's possible link to consumption.

Conclusions

- 56. Assuming a low or average concentration of OTA, all estimated exposures for infants under the age of 6 month, fed exclusively on breast milk are below the TWI. Assuming a high concentration, infants exceed the TWI by up to 5 fold.
- 57. The high concentration used here might not be representative, as other studies report maximum occurrence values well below 405 ng/L. The likelihood of exposure to such concentrations is therefore unlikely. In addition,

it is unlikely that infants would be exposed to such high values continuously throughout their life. Overall, an effect on health cannot be entirely excluded in the short term; chronic effects on health are unlikely.

58. Respective exposures for infants up to 6 months, fed non-exclusively with breast milk and mean and 97.5th percentile dietary exposures for infants at all age groups are below the TWI. These exposures are of no toxicological concern.

Questions to be asked to the Committee

- i) Do the Committee endorse the TWI established by EFSA in 2006 and reconfirmed in 2010?
- ii) If not, do the Committee think the studies used by EFSA and JECFA are the most appropriate studies or are there any newer studies that might be more appropriate?
- iii) Do the Committee have any other comments on this discussion paper?

Secretariat

November 2017

Abbreviations

DNSIYC FSA NDNS TDS OTA EFSA JECFA FAO WHO HBGV PTWI SCF EC TDI PEPCK NTP BMD BMDL bw LOEL LOAEL NOAEL UF TWI LOQ LOD UB LB IL NF-kB eNOS iNOS SOD FB1 TNF-α HO-1 ASAT ALAT MDA AST ALP TP BUN	Diet and Nutrition Survey of Infants and Young Children Food Standards Agency National Diet and Nutrition Survey Total Diet Survey Ochratoxin A European Food Safety Authority Joint FAO/WHO Expert Committee on Food Additives Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations World Health Organisation Health based guidance value Provisional tolerable weekly intake Scientific Committee for Food Standards Agency European Community Tolerable daily intake Phosphoenolpyruvate carboxykinase National Toxicology Program Benchmark dose modelling Benchmark dose lower confidence limit Body weight Lowest observed adverse effect level Lowest observed adverse effect level Uncertainty factor Tolerable weekly intake Limit of quantification Limit of detection Upper bound Lower bound Interleukin Nuclear factor kappa beta Endothelial nitric oxide synthase Inducible nitric oxide synthase Superoxide dismutase Fumonisin B1 Tumour necrosis factor α Heme oxygenase Aspartate aminotransferase Alanine aminotransferase Alkaline phosphatase Total serum protein Blood urea nitrogen
ALP	Alkaline phosphatase
TP	Total serum protein
CREA	Creatinine
TG	Triacylglycerol
LDH	Lactate dehydrogenase
GLU	Glucose
ALB	Albumin

PCNA Proliferating cell nuclear antigen DSB Double strand break HDL High density lipoprotein MOA Mode of action CLU Clusterin OPN Osteopontin 5-bromo-2-deoxyuridine BdrU+ Thiobarbituric acid-reactive substances TBARS Dopamine DA Tyrosine hydroxylase TΗ Median effective dose ED50 Intraperitoneal ip AFB1 Aflatoxin B1 OTB Ochratoxin B OTC Ochratoxin C GD Gestation day Postnatal day PND

References

Arbillaga L, Vettorazzi A, Gil AG, van Delft JHM, Garcia-Jalon JA, Lopez de cerain A (2008). Gene expression changed induced by ochratoxin A in renal and hepatic tissues of male F344 rat after oral repeated administration. Toxicology and Applied Pharmacology. 230: 197-207

Balogh K, Hausenbalsz J, Weber M, Erdelyi M, Fodor J, Mesez M (2007). Effects of ochratoxin A on some production traits, lipid peroxide and glutathione redox status of weaned piglets. Acta Veterinaria hungarica. 55(4): 463-470

Bates B, Lennox A, Prentice A, Bates C, Page P, Nicholson S, Swan G (2014). National Diet and Nutrition Survey Results from Years 1, 2, 3 and 4 (combined) of the Rolling Programme (2008/2009 – 2011/2012) <u>https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/59436</u> <u>0/NDNS_Y1_to_4_UK_report_executive_summary_revised_February_2017.pdf</u>

Bates B, Cox L, Nicholson S, Page P, Prentice A, Steer T Swan G (2016). National Diet and Nutrition Survey Results from Years 5 and 6 (combined) of the Rolling Programme (2012/2013 – 2013/2014) https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/55135 2/NDNS Y5 6 UK Main Text.pdf

Bernardini C, Grilli E, Duvigneau JC, Zannoni A, Tugnoli B, Gentilini F, Bertuzzi T, Spinozzi S, Camborata C, Bacci MA, Piva A, Forni M (2014). Cellular stress marker alteration and inflammatory response in pigs fed with an ochratoxin contaminated diet. Research in veterinary Science. 97: 244-250

Bertholtz-Emanuelsson A (1993). Ochratoxin A in cows milk and human milk with corresponding human blood samples. Journal of AOAC International. 76(4): 842-846

Biasucci G, CalabreseG, Di Guiseppe R, Carrara G, Colombo F, Mandelli B, Maj M, Bertuzzi T, Pietri A, Rossi F (2011). The presence of ochratoxin A in cord serum and in human milk and its correspondence with maternal dietary habits. European Journal of Nutrition. 50(3): 211-218

Bondy GS, Caldwell DS, Aziz SA, Coady LC, Armstrong CL, Curran IHA, Koffman RL, Kapal K, Lefebvre DE, Mehta R (2015). Effects of chronic ochratoxin A exposure on p53 heterozygous and p53 homozygous mice. Toxicologic Pathology. 43: 715-729

Brown AL, Odell EW, Mantle PG (2007). DNA ploidy distribution in renal tumours induced in male rats by dietary ochratoxin A. Experimental and Toxicologic Pathology. 59: 85-95

Domijan AM, Rudes K, Peraica M (2005). The effect of ochratoxin A on the concentration of protein carbonyls in rats. Arhiv za higijenu rada i toksikologiju. 56(4): 311-316

Dostal A, Jakusova L, Cajdova J, Hudeckova H (2008). Results of the first studies of occurrence of ochratoxin A in human milk in Slovakia. Bratislavske lekarske listy. 109(6): 276-278

European Community (1996). Opinion of the Scientific Committee for Food on aflatoxins, OTA and patulin, expressed on 23 September 1994, Food Science and techniques, 1996, European Commission, Directorate General Industry, p 45-50.

European Community (1998). Opinion on of the Scientific Committee on Food (SCF) on ochratoxin A. Expressed on 17 September 1998. <u>http://europa.eu.int/comm/food/fs/sc/scf/out14_en.html</u>.

EFSA (2006). Opinion of the Scientific Panel on Contaminants in the Food Chain on a request from the Commission related to ochratoxin A in food. *The EFSA Journal* **365**: 1 – 56. Available at: <u>https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/365</u>

EFSA (2010). Statement on recent scientific information on the toxicity of Ochratoxin A. EFSA Panel on Contaminants in the Food Chain. *EFSA Journal* **8(6):** 1626. Available at: <u>https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/1626</u>

Ellig F (1979). Ochratoxin A-induced mycotoxic porcine nephropathy: alterations in enzyme activity in tubular cells. Acta pathologica et microbiologica. 87A(4): 237-243

FAO/WHO (2007). Evaluation of certain food additives and contaminants (Sixtyeighth report of the Joint FAO/WHO Expert Committee on Food Additives). WHO Technical Report Series, No. 947 http://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/10665/43823/1/9789241660594_eng.pdf

FSA (2010). Food Survey Information Sheet 04/10. Surveillance Programme for mycotoxins in foods. Year 1: Cereals and cereal products.

FSA (2011). Food Survey Information Sheet: 02/11. Surveillance Programme for mycotoxins in foods. Year 2: Mycotoxins in foods for infants and young children, patulin in apple juice and ergot alkaloids in cereal products.

Galvano F, Pietr A, Bertuzzi T, Gagliardi L, Ciotti S, Luisi S, Bognanno M, La Faci L, Iacopino AM, Nigro F, Li Volti g, Vanella L, Giammanco G, Tina GL, Gazzolo D (2008). Maternal dietary habits and mycotoxin occurrence in human mature milk. Molecular Nutrition & Food Research. 52(4): 496-501

Jennings P, weiland C, Limonciel A, Bloch KM, Radford R, Aschauer L, McMorrow T, Wilmes A, Pfaller W, Ahr HJ, Slattery C, Lick EA, Ryan MP, Ellinger-Ziegelbauer H (2012). Transcriptomic alterations induced by ochratoxin A in rat and human renal proximal tubular in vitro models and comparison to a rat in vivo model. Archieves of Toxicology. 86(4): 571-589

Kamp HG, Eisenbrand G, Janzowski C, Kiossev J, Latendresse JR, Schlatter J, Turesky RJ (2005). Ochratoxin A induces oxidative DNA damage in liver and kidney after oral dosing to rats. Molecular Nutrition & Food Research. 49: 1160-1167 Krogh P, Gyrd-Hansen N, Hald B, Larsen S, Nielsen JP, Smith M, Ivanoff C, Meisner H (1988). Renal enzyme activities in experimental ochratoxin A-induced porcine nephropathy: diagnostic potential of phosphoenolpyruvate carboxykinase and gamma-glutamyl transpeptidase activity. Journal of Toxicologyand Environmental health. 23: 1-14

Kuroda K, Hibi D, Ishii Y, Takasu S, Kijima A, Matsushita K, Masumura K-I, Watanabe M, Sugita-Konishi Y, Sakai H, Yanai T, Nohmi T, Ogawa K, Umemura T (2014). Ochratoxin A induced DNA double-strand breaks and large deletion mutations in the carcinogenic target site of gpt delta rats. Mutagenesis. 29(1): 27-36

Mally A, Pepe G, Ravoori S, Fiore M, Gupta RC, Dekant W, Mosesso P (2005a). Ochratoxin A causes DNA damage and cytogenetic effects but no DNA adducts in rats. Chemical Research in Toxicology. 18: 1253-1261

Mally A, Volkel W, Amberg A, Kurz M, Wanek P, Eder E, Hard G, Dekant W (2005b). Functional, biochemical, and pathological effects of repeated oral administration of ochratoxin A to rats. Chemical research in Toxicology. 18: 1242-1252

Mantle PG (2009). Minimum tolerable exposure period and maximum threshold dietary intake of ochratoxin A for causing renal cancer in male dark Agouti rats. Food and Chamical Toxicology. 47: 2419-2424

Mantle PG, Kulinskaya E (2010). Lifetime, low-dose ochratoxin A dietary study on renal carcinogenesis in male Fischer rats. Food Additives and Contaminants. 27(11): 1566-1573

Mantle P, Kulinskaya E, Nestler S (2005). Renal tumourigenesis in male rats in response to chronic dietary ochratoxin A. Food Additives and Contaminants, Supplemetn 1: 58-64

Mantle PG, Nolan CC (2010). Pathological outcomes in kidney and brain in male fisher rats given dietary ochratoxin A, commencing at one year of age. Toxins. 2: 1100-1110

Marin DE, Braicu C, Gras MA, Pistol GC, Petric RC, Neagoe IB, Palade M, Taranu I (2017a). Low level of ochratoxin A affects genome-wide expression in kidney of pig. Toxicon. 136: 67-77

Marin DE, Pistol GC, Gras MA, Palade ML, Taranu I (2017b). Comparative effect of ochratoxin A on inflammation and oxidative stress parameters in gut and kidney of piglets. Regulatory Toxicology and Pharmacology 89: 224-231

Micco C, Ambruzzi MA, Miraglia M, Brera C, Onori R, benelli L (1991). Contamination of human milk with ochratoxin A. IARC scientific publications. 115: 105-108

Mor F, Sengul O, Topsakal S, Kilic MA, Ozmen O (2017). Diabetogenic effects of ochratoxin A in female rats. Toxins 9(144): 1-10

Paradells S, Rocamonde B, Llinares C, Herranz-Perez V, Jimenez M, Garcia-Verdugo JM, Zipancic I, Soria JM, Garcia-Esparza MA (2014). Neurotoxic effects of ochratoxin A on the subventricular zone of adult mouse brain. Journal of Applied Toxicology. 35(7): 737-751

Patil RD, Dwivedi P, Sharma AK (2006). Critical period and minimum single oral dose of ochratoxin A for inducing developmental toxicity in pregnant Wistar rats. Reproductive Toxicology. 22: 679-687

Pleading J, Persi N, Mitka M, Terzic S, Milic D, Vulic A, Brstilo M (2012). Biochemical Changes in pig serum after ochratoxin A exposure. Bulletin of environmental Contamination and Toxicology. 88(6): 1043-1047

Postupolski J, Karlowski K, Kubik P (2006). Ochratoxin A in maternal and foetal blood and in maternal milk. Roczn Pzh. 57(1): 23-30

Prabu PC, Dwivedi P, Sharma AK (2013). Toxicopathological studies of the effects of aflatoxin B₁, ochratoxin A and their interaction in new Zealand White rabbits. Experimental and Toxicologic Pathology 65(): 277-286

Qi X, Yu T, Zhu L, Gao J, He X, Huang K, Luo Y, Xu W (2014). Ochratoxin A induces rat renal carcinogenicity with limited induction of oxidative stress responses. Toxicology and Applied Pharmacology. 280(3): 543-549

Rached E, Hard GC, Blumback K, Weber K, Draheim R, Lutz WK, Ozden S, Steger U, Dekant W, Mally A (2007). Ochratoxin A: 13-week oral toxicity and cell proliferation in male F344/N rats. Toxicological Science. 97(2): 288-298

Sava V, Reunova O, Velasquez A, Harbison R, Sanchez-Ramos J (2006). Acute neurotoxic effects of the fungal metabolite ochratoxin A. NeuroToxicology. 27: 82-92

Skaug MA, Helland I, Solvoll K, Saugstad OD (2001). Presence of ochratoxin A in human milk in relation to dietary intake. Food Additives and Contaminants. 18(4): 321-327

Skaug MA, Stormer FC, Saugstad OD (2998). Ochratoxin A: a naturally occurring mycotoxin found in human milk samples from Norway. Acta Paediatrica. 87(12) 1275-1278

Stoev SD, Gundasheva D, Zarkov I, Mircheva T, Zapryanova D, Denev S, Mitev Y, Dasaklov H, Dutton M, Mwanza M, Schneider YJ (2012). Experimental mycotoxin nephropathy in pigs provoked by a mouldy diet containing ochratoxin A and fumonisin B1. Experimental and Toxicologic Pathology. 64: 733-741

Tanaka T, Hasegawa-Baba Y, Watanabe Y, Mizukami S, Kangawa Y, Yoshida T, Shibutani M (2016). Maternal exposure to ochratoxin A targets intermediate progenitor cells in hippocampal neurogenesis in rat offspring via cholinergic signal downregulation and oxidative stress responses. Reproductive Toxicology 65: 113-122 Taniai E, Yafune A, Nakajima M, Hayashi SM, Nakane F, Itahashi M, Shibutani M (2014). Ochratoxin A induces karyomegaly and cell cycle aberrations in renal tubular cells without relation to induction od oxidative stress responses in rats. Toxicology Letters. 224(1): 64-72

Zhang Z, Gan F, Xue H, Liu Y, Huang D, Khan AZ, Chen X, Huang K (2016). Nephropathy and hepatopathy in weaned piglets provoked by natural ochratoxin A and involved mechanisms. Experimental and Toxicologic Pathology. 68: 205-213

Zhu L, Yu T, Qi x, Gao J, Huang K, He X, Luo H, Xu W (2016). Limited link between oxidative stress and ochratoxin A – induced renal injury in an acute toxicity rat model. Toxins 8(12): 373

Zimmerli B, Dick R (1995). Determination of ochratoxin A at the ppt level in human blood, serum, milk and some foodstuffs by high-performance liquid chromatography with enhanced fluorescence detection and immuneaffinity column cleanup: methodology and Swiss data. Journal of Chromatography. B, Analytical technologies in the biomedical and life sciences. 666(1): 85-99

Annex A

Table 7 Summary of *in vivo* toxicity studies since the EFSA opinion in 2006

Species	Number	Exposure concentration & purification	Exposure	Feed Intake	Results	NOAEL/LOAEL	Comments	Reference
Studies in pi	gs							
Female crossbreed weaned piglets (TOPICS- 40)	Total N=12 N=6 / group	0.05 mg OTA/kg feed Control feed 2.52 ppb OTA feed 49.62 ppb OTA was purchased	Daily via diet 30 days		Concentrations 6.25, 26.4 and 26 times higher in kidney, duodenum and colon of animals exposed to OTA Effects on immune response and anti- oxidant self-defence at gut and kidney level Down regulation of gene expression of markers of inflammation -IL-6, IL-8, IL-12, IL-17A, IL-18 in the colon ^a -IL-17A and IL-10 in the kidney Decrease of markers for signalling pathway -NF-kB ^a and eNOS ^a in duodenum -iNOS ^a in colon -No sign effect in kidney OTA increased SOD ^a activity in kidney	LOAEL * 0.05 mg/kg feed For immune response and anti-oxidant self-defence	Other mycotoxins below LOD	Marin et al. 2017b
Female crossbreed weaned piglets (TOPICS-4-)	Total N=12 N=6 / group	0.05 mg/kg feed Control feed 2.52 ppb	Daily via diet 30 days		(127.6%) and duodenum (106%) Renal toxicity - correlated with activation of immune response pathways, ox stress response and early carcinogenic events OTA was 6.25 times higher in kidney	LOAEL* 0.05 mg/kg feed For renal toxicity,	All other mycotoxins below LOD, except FB1 ^a (88 ppb)	Marin et al. 2017a

Species Nur		Exposure concentration & purification	Exposure	Feed Intake	Results	NOAEL/LOAEL	Comments	Reference
Weaned Tota piglets N=3 ([Landrace N=4 x Yorkshire] x Duroc)	tal 36 4 / oup	OTA feed 49.62 ppb OTA was purchased 0, 0.4 (OTA-L) or 0.8 (OTA-H) mg/kg <i>A. ochraceus</i> in shredded corn ~20 mg OTA/kg corn substrate	Daily via diet 42 days	OTA-L 790.7 ± 43.71 g/day OTA-H 724.67 ± 25.0 g/day	of exposed animals In the kidney gene expression of 74 transcripts increased and 31 genes decreased -expression of genes involved in renal necrosis, kidney failure, renal proliferation, renal dysplasia and renal hypoplasia -expression of some genes involved in ox stress response OTA increased the SOD activity in the kidney Polyuria & polydipsia in both groups Severe wasting Decreased growth performance (time & dose-dependent manner) Day 28 and 42 OTA sign increased in serum and in kidney and liver on day 42 (higher in OTA-H) Degenerative changes in kidney & liver Hyperchromatic nuclei & cytoplasm, nuclei atrophy, necrosis & exfoliation in epithelial cells of proximal tubules Reduced antioxidant ability -SOD activity was sig decreased on	immune response, ox stress and early carcinogenic events LOAEL* 0.4 mg/kg	Low concentrations of OTB ^a & OTC ^a Exposure** 0.32 mg/day (OTA-L) 0.58 mg/day (OTA-H)	Zhang et al. 2016

Species	Number	Exposure concentration & purification	Exposure	Feed Intake	Results	NOAEL/LOAEL	Comments	Reference
Castrated male Large White weaned pigs	Total N=60 N=30/ group	Experimental 181 ± 34 ng/g feed Control 0.45 ± 0.05 ng/g feed	Diet 43 days	Average daily intake Experimental 708 ± 43 g Control 711 ± 24 g	Growth performance was not affected No pathological signs in kidney and liver Sign decrease in level of serum protein Sign increase in TNF- α^a (12.2 fold) and IL-10 (5.2 fold) in blood Significant decrease in expression of HO-1 ^a in kidney Indications for increased cell stress, possibly associated with increased systematic inflammatory status	LOAEL* 181 ng/g feed For cellular stress/ochrato xicosis	Exposure** Experimental 128 μg/day 0.32 μg/day	Bernardini et al. 2014
Male pigs (Zegers hyprid)	Total N=8 N=4 / group	300 ug OTA/kg of feed (300 ppb) OTA was purchased	Daily via diet/capsul e directly in pigs mouth 30 days		Indicative of impaired liver & kidney function - Changes in serum biochemical parameters Increase in serum levels of creatinine, urea (kidney damage), potassium and ALP ^a (liver damage) Levels of glucose and total protein were decreased. Significant decrease in glucose concentration observed on day 10 pointed to early kidney damage	Changes of biochem parameters indicate kidney/liver damage as early as 10 & 20 days LOAEL* 300 ug/kg feed at 10 days exposure For biochem parameters indicating kidney and	Small number of animals Unclear from text weather animals were exposed via diet or through capsule directly into pigs mouth	Pleadin et al. 2012

Species	Number	Exposure concentration & purification	Exposure	Feed Intake	Results	NOAEL/LOAEL	Comments	Reference
						liver damage No effect after		
						1 day		
Pigs Landrace x Bulgarian	Total N=24	0.5 ppm Moulded	Daily via diet		Degenerative changes in proximal tubules & fibrosis in kidneys	LOAEL* 0.5 ppm	Separate and simultaneous exposure to OTA and fumonisin FB1 ^a (10 ppm)	Stoev et al. 2012
white	N=6 / group OTA	shredded wheat OTA ~2mg/g	3 months		Slight degenerative changes in duodenum or jejunal mucosa Liver showed staining and fatty	For pathological changes in the kidney	Data presented here is for individual exposure to OTA only	
	N=6				changes	And disturbance in	Only one group of animals	
					Increase in serum creatinine & urea level	humoral immune	(N=6) exposed to OTA only	
					Increased activity of enzymes (ASAT ^a and ALAT ^a) Disturbance in humoral immune	response	No other mycotoxins present	
					response			
Hungarian Large White x Hungarian	Total N = 24 N=12 /	Experimental 379.6 & 338.1 ug/kg feed	Diet 42 days	Experimental 0.894 kg/day/piglet	Daily weight gain significantly lower in OTA contaminated feed group Increased MDA ^a in liver	NOAEL* 0.4 mg/kg	The published tables only report control and OTA exposure group, no differentiation between the	Balogh et al. 2007
Landrace F1 weaned	group 2x control	Control 1.5 & 2.6 ug/kg feed		Control 1.117 kg/day/piglot	Moderate level; (0.4 mg/kg) of OTA in feed does not result in clinical signs of		concentrations given in the methods Samples/Groups pooled?	
piglets	group	leeu		kg/day/piglet	toxicity		Samples/Groups pooled?	
(Sex ratio 1:1)	2x exposure group	OTA extracted from maize using						
	N=6 / group	Aspergillus westerdijkiae strain NRRL						

Species	Number	Exposure concentration & purification	Exposure	Feed Intake	Results	NOAEL/LOAEL	Comments	Reference
		3174						
Studies in ra		- 1				1		1
Female Wistar rats	Total N=42 N=7 / group	3 mg OTA/kg food 45 μg/day in their food 45 g OTA/rat/day	Daily via diet 6, 9 & 24 weeks	20 g/rat/day	 Toxic effects on endocrine pancreatic function as early as 6 weeks Significant decrease in insulin levels Significant increase in blood glucagon & glucose levels Slight to moderate degeneration in Langerhans islet cells; vacuolization, megalocytosis, karyomegaly 		Poorly reported study. I calculated dose, see below: 3 mg OTA/kg feed 20 g per rat = 60 μg OTA/20g feed?	Mor et al. 2017
Female CrI:CD (SD) rats – mated Offspring 6 male + 2 female pups	Total N=48 N=12 / group	0, 0.12, 0.6, 3.0 ppm Based on mean values of food consumption: Gestation 8.0, 76.0, 206.6 μg/kg bw per day Lactation 16.1, 76.0, 378.6 μg/kg bw per day OTA concentration in diet until exposure:	Diet Gestation Day (GD) 6 to Post- natal day (PND) 21 on Remaining offspring kept through PND 77 without OTA exposure		At 3.0 ppm offspring showed transient bw decrease after weaning Changes in hippocampal neurogenesis related parameters measured in male PND 21 offspring Maternal OTA exposure reversibly disrupts neurogenesis in rat offspring	NOAEL 0.6 ppm 39.3-76 ug/kg bw/day For offspring neurogenesis (Maternal oral exposure)	Preliminary feeding study -exposure to 0, 1 ppm (N=3) or 3 ppm (N=4) 3 ppm decreased brain weight of male offspring on PND 21 Selected as highest dose expected to show slight offspring toxicity	Tanaka et al. 2016

Species	Number	Exposure	Exposure	Feed Intake	Results	NOAEL/LOAEL	Comments	Reference
		concentration						
		& purification						
		under limit of						
		detection of 5						
		ppb						
		OTA was						
		purchased						
Male	N=6 /	0, 1 (L) or 4 (H)	Daily by		Decrease in bw		Number of animals only	Zhu et al. 2016
Wistar rats	treatment	mg/kg bw	gavage (in		-day 4 (H)		given below tables	2110 et al. 2010
	treatment	IIIg/ Kg DW	corn oil)		-day 7 (L)		given below tables	
			com on)					
			7 days		(H) ^a			
			, days		Increased levels of AST, ALP, TP, BUN,			
					CREA, TG, LDH, GLU			
					Increase in ALP, AST, ALB indicative of			
					hepatic injury			
					(L) ^a			
					Increased levels of ALB, TP, BUN			
					(H) and (L)			
					Impairment of renal function			
					(indicators: CREA ^a ,BUN)			
					Hydropic degeneration, swelling,			
					vacuolization & necrosis in epithelial			
					cells of renal tubules			
					Dose dependent increase in positive			
					PCNA ^a signals (indication for			
					increased cell proliferation) in the			
					kidneys			
Male	N=10 /	Exp I	Exp I		Indication DSBs ^a induction at		210 μg/10mL/kg/day by	Kuroda et al. 2014
F344/NSIc-	group	5 ppm	Daily via		carcinogenic target sites		gavage is equivalent to 5	
Tg (<i>gpt</i>			basal diet		-DSBs predominantly repaired by HR		ppm dietary exposure	

Species	Number	Exposure concentration & purification	Exposure	Feed Intake	Results	NOAEL/LOAEL	Comments	Reference
delta) rats		Exp II 70, 210 or 630 µg/10mL/kg/da y OTA was extracted from a culture of <i>Aspergillus</i> <i>ochraceus</i> (BD- 5) Purity > 95%	Exp II Daily by gavage 4 weeks		-consequently leads to large deletion mutations Sign reduced kidney weights (Exp I & II) Sign decrease bw at 630 ug/kg (Exp II)		Dosing level based on 2 year carcinogenicity study in rats	
Male F344 rats	N=6 / group	0, 70 or 210 μg/kg bw	5 days per week by gavage (in corn oil) 4 or 13 weeks		Apparent kidney damage within 13 weeks -cytoplasmic vacuolisation, karyomelagy 13 weeks -decrease in HDL ^a , AST, LDH -some implications for carcinogenicity Changes in AST, LDH, ALP suggest liver damage Increase in PCNA Limited effect on ox stress parameters			Qi et al. 2014
Male F344/NDlc rats	Total N=16 N=4 /	210 ug/kg bw (see Taniani et al 2012a – not	Daily by gavage 28 days	Average 14.46 ± 0.30 g/day/animal	Increased cell proliferation activity, apoptosis & immunohistochemical cellular distributions of molecules suggestive of induction of DNA		Combination study with antioxidants Data presented here is for	Taniani et al. 2014

Species	Number	Exposure concentration & purification	Exposure	Feed Intake	Results	NOAEL/LOAEL	Comments	Reference
	group	available online)			damage & cell cycle aberrations Increased number of proximal tubular cells with karyomegaly Limited effect on ox stress		individual exposure to OTA only	
Male Wistar rats		3 mg/kg Ota was purchased	Daily by gavage (in corn oil) 1, 3 or 7 days		parameters Results point to an epigenetic action of OTA Further evidence supporting non- genotoxic mechanism of carcinogenicity		DNA array data mined from a previous study (Luhe et al 2003) -results provide molecular basis for interpretation of nephrotoxicity - transcriptional changes were detected for genes involved in DNA damage response and apoptosis, response to oxidative stress and inflammatory reactions -culture model comparable to in vivo data	Jennings et al. 2012
Fischer F344 rats	Total N=34 N=5 / cage	50 μg OTA/kg bw Fermentation product of <i>A.</i> <i>ochraceus</i> (D2306) 5-6 mg OTA/g	Daily via diet (aluminiu m vessel in powdered diet) Up to 2 years	20 g per animal	Renal carcinomas (unilateral) (4/34) First (large) renal carcinoma at 76 weeks Renal adenoma at weeks 93 and 105 (recognition of early tumourigenesis)		Not most useful study? Design virtually the same as Mantle et al. 2005 Dose calculated based on dietary intake from initial weight Dietary OTA of 1 mg/kg Mononuclear leukemia (47%) (67% in controls)	Mantle and Kulinskaya 2010

Species	Number	Exposure	Exposure	Feed Intake	Results	NOAEL/LOAEL	Comments	Reference
		concentration						
		& purification						
		OTA B					- this seems to be a	
		5-10% of total					common appearance in rats	
		ΟΤΑ					at a higher stage in life	
		No other						
		mycotoxins						
		were						
		biosynthesised						
Male Dark	Total	5 ppm	Daily via	90 g per group	Renal tumours	NOEL		Mantle 2009
Agouti rats	N=80		diet	of 5 animals	- 9 months – 20% of animals	~7 ug		
		400 ppb			-None in group exposed for only 3	OTA/day (feed		
	N=5 /	putative	5 ppm for	18 g/animal	month	containing		
	group	threshold diet	3, 6 & 9 month,		-Non in group given threshold dose	400 ppb)		
		From initial	animals		Latency between ceasing toxin	Mean daily		
		weight dietary	kept for		exposure and tumour discovery was	dose		
		intake of OTA	natural life		35-97 weeks	commenced		
		~90 ug/day				at ~50 ug/kg		
			400 ppb			For adults 30-		
		3 month	For up to 2			20 ug/kg		
		exposure	years					
		~640 ug/kg				3 month		
		declining to				exposure -		
		450 ug/kg daily				Threshold for		
						malignant		
		Fermentation				renal disease		
		product of A.						
		ochraceus				Mean		
		(D2306)				tolerable daily		
						dose ~ 85 ug		
		5-6 mg OTA/g				(3month		
		(~5000 ppm)				exposure to		
						5ppm diet) –		

Species	Number	Exposure concentration & purification	Exposure	Feed Intake	Results	NOAEL/LOAEL	Comments	Reference
		OTA B 5-10% of total OTA				threshold exposure for renal carcinoma		
Male F344 (Fisher) rats	Total N=24 N=3 / group	100 ug 5 ppm in contaminated diet (from 50 weeks of age on) Rats ~2 years -1 group 35 weeks exposure -1 group exposure until end Fermentation as described in previous papers	Daily via diet 35 or 51 weeks Total of ~2 years	20 g	No renal carcinomas occurred 4 renal adenomas were found in the 6 rats surviving for 110 weeks		Authors comment: First adenoma found after six months of continuous OTA exposure, at an age close to the normal endpoint of NTP toxicological studies. The other three small adenomas all occurred in rats given only the basic 35 weeks of OTA exposure, but found at an age beyond a classical two year endpoint Mononuclear leukaemia (38%) -distributed across last quarter of life - this seems to be a common appearance in rats at a higher stage in life	Mantle and Nolan 2009
Male Fisher 344 rats	N=10 / group 5 / cage	0.5 mg/kg bw Purchased	Daily by gavage 7 & 21 days		Time dependent increase of OTA in plasma, liver, kidney Signs of nephrotoxicity -Histopathological changes in the kidney -single cell necrosis, karyomegalic		Unclear from paper if N=10 is per treatment group or the total number of animals	Arbillaga et al. 2008

Species	Number	Exposure concentration & purification	Exposure	Feed Intake	Results	NOAEL/LOAEL	Comments	Reference
					nuclei			
					-most pronounced after 21 days			
					Day 7 - 1 rat very slight			
					tubulonephrosis			
					Day 21 - 3 of the 5 treated animals			
					showed signs of tubulonephrosis			
					Ox stress response pathways & genes			
					involved in mechanisms & transport inhibited			
					Genes implicated in cell			
					survival/proliferation up-regulated at			
					day 21			
Male	N=5 /	Approx. 5 ppm	Daily via	20 g	Renal tumours		Concentration in feed was	Brown et al. 2007
Fischer F-	group		diet		-adenomas & carcinomas		adjusted every 2 weeks	
344 rats		Exp I					according to weight changes	
		Initially	Up to 2		Renal histopathological change (at		during animal growth	
		300 μg/kg bw	years		dose without clinical abnormalities)			
		(weight 175 g)			– karyomegalic nuclei in proximal			
		After	Exp I		tubule epithelial			
		100 μg/rat (wheight 333g)	2 years		No evidence of necrosis, apoptosis,			
		(wheight 555g)	Exp II		fibrosis			
		Exp II	2 years					
		50 or 300 μg	2 years		Some cases mononuclear leukemia			
		OTA/kg bw for	Exp III		/testicular tumours			
		2 years	10 month		-typical in some aging rats			
		Exp III	Exp IV		Exp I			
		300 µg/kg bw	9 month		Tumour incidence 16/64			
		for 10 month			(rats 1-4 & 9)			

Species	Number	Exposure	Exposure	Feed Intake	Results	NOAEL/LOAEL	Comments	Reference
		concentration						
		& purification						
		from puberty						
					Exp II			
		Exp IV			Tumour incidence 6/35 and 7/12			
		100 μg/rat			(rats 5 & 10, rats 6 & 7)			
		starting at 1						
		year for 9			Exp III			
		month			Tumour incidence 5/5			
					(rat 8)			
		Fermentation						
		as described in			Exp IV			
		previous			Tumour incidence 4/24			
		papers			(rats 11 & 12)			
		5-6 mg OTA/g						
Male	N=5 /	0, 21, 70 or 210	5 days per		OTA produced renal alterations	NOEL		Rached et al.
F344/N	group	µg/kg bw	week by		-single cell death of lining cells	21 ug/kg bw		2007
rats			gavage (in		-enlarged nuclei, karyomegaly	_		
		OTA was	corn oil)		-lesions progressed with increasing	For		
		purchased			dose & time	nephrotoxicity		
		99%	14, 28 or		-as early as 2 weeks (210 μg/kg bw)	(kidney		
			90 days		-28 and 90 days for 70 μg OTA/kg bw	pathology &		
						renal cell		
					Increase of cell proliferation (70 &	proliferation)		
					210 μg/kg bw)			
					No clinical signs of toxicity were			
					observed			
					No signs of nephrotoxicity were			
					evident by serum/urine analysis			
					4 weeks			
					Decreased number pf reticulocytes			
					$(70 \text{ or } 210 \ \mu\text{g/kg bw}); \text{ not detected}$			
					I (10 01 210 µg/kg nw), not detected			1

Species	Number	Exposure concentration & purification	Exposure	Feed Intake	Results	NOAEL/LOAEL	Comments	Reference
					after 90 days			
					≥ 4 weeks Increase in leucocytes			
Female Wistar rats (sexually mature)	N=10 On each gestationa I day (GD) N=11 on GD 6 & 7 (due to abortion)	2.0, 2.5, 2.75, 3.0, 3.5 or 4 mg/kg bw OTA extracted from <i>Aspergillus</i> <i>ochraceus</i> (NRRL-3174) Purity 94%	Single exposure by gavage Between GD 6 & 15 Treatment volume 0.1mL / 100 g bw		 GD 6 & 7 most critical for induction of teratogenicity Between GD 6 & 15 4 mg/kg bw Maternotoxic, embryocidal, fetotoxic Maternal deaths (15%) Foetal resorption (up to 55.75%) Post implementation loss (69.5%) Reduction foetal bw (up to 54.72%) 3.0 & 3.5 mg/kg bw Teratogenic Reduction in maternal bw Developmental defects 2.75 mg/kg bw Multiple foetal abnormalities in many organ systems of individual foetuses 2.5 mg/kg bw No maternal toxicity No developmental embryotoxicity 	2,75 mg/kg bw was found to be min effective teratogenic dose Sub-threshold level of OTA for induction of teratogenicity by oral single dose	Authors speak of a preliminary study first thing in the result section -unclear if the following results are the preliminary study or the actual study	Patil et al. 2006
Female Wistar rats (adult)	Total N=30 N=5 /	0.5 mg/kg bw OTA was purchased	Daily by intraperito neal injection		Foetal abnormalities less severe Ox stress involved in mechanism of OTA toxicity Increased protein carbonyls in		No indication how many of the 6 groups are control and exposure	Domijan et al. 2005
	group	99%	injection		kidney/liver		Focuses on ox stress only	

Species	Number	Exposure concentration & purification	Exposure	Feed Intake	Results	NOAEL/LOAEL	Comments	Reference
			7, 4 & 21		-highest level was found after day 14			
			days		(kidney) & day 21 (liver)			
Male F344	Total	0, 0.03, 0.1 or	Daily by		No effect on basic DNA damage	Oxidative		Kamp et al. 2005
rats	N=20	0.3 mg/kg bw	gavage			damage in		
					OTA mediated ox damage detected in	liver/kidney as		
	N=5 / group	Purchased	4 weeks		kidney/liver of all dose groups	low as 0.03 mg/kg bw		
	•				Histopathological changes in kidney			
					(0.3 mg/kg)			
					-apoptosis & karyomegaly in			
					epithelium of proximal convoluted			
					tubules			
					To a lesser degree swelling,			
					vacuolisation,			
					Proteinurea, Glucosuria, Polyuria (0.3 mg/kg)			
					Ox damage in kidney/liver at 0.03 & 0.3 mg/kg bw			
					Oxidative damage in 0.1 mg/kg group not stat sign			
Male F344	N=3 /	0, 250, 500,	5 days per		Data suggest OTA may cause genetic		Small number	Mally et al. 2005a
Fischer rats	group	1000 or 2000	week by		damage in target/nontarget tissues		No mention how many	
		µg/kg bw	gavage (in		-Independent of direct covalent		animals in total/repeats of	
			corn oil)		binding to DNA		doses	
		OTA was			-Mechanisms may involve ox stress			
		purchased	2 weeks					
					Significant (but small) dose-			
					dependent increase in DNA breakage			
					in liver and spleen; more prominent			
					in lower doses in kidneys			

Species	Number	Exposure concentration & purification	Exposure	Feed Intake	Results	NOAEL/LOAEL	Comments	Reference
Male F344 rats	N=3 / group	0, 0.25, 0,5, 1 or 2 mg/kg bw	5 days per week by		Characteristic pathological alterations in the kidney -karyomegaly, polyploidy, increased apoptosis & mitosis No histopathological changes in liver Kidney pathology was present at all dose levels administered		Small number No mention how many	Mally et al. 2005b
	0.04	Purchased	gavage (in corn oil) 2 weeks		 (clear dose dependent increase) Increase in expression of PCNA Changes in clinical chemical parameters indicative of nephrotoxicity only observed at end of study (1 & 2 mg/kg bw) No liver damage Significant reduction in bw gain only at highest dose (2 mg/kg bw) 		animals in total/repeats of doses	
Male Fisher-344 rats	N=5 / group	Approx 100 μg OTA/day (300 μg OTA/kg bw until weight of 333 g was reached, thereafter 100 μg/rat) Fermentation	Daily via diet Up to 2 years	100 g	Renal carcinoma (20%, unilateral) -first renal tumor at 75 weeks (animal was losing weight and was euthanized) -rate of discovery increased from ~90 weeks		No mention of total number/replication of dosing Mononuclear leukaemia (50%) - this seems to be a common appearance in rats at a higher stage in life	Mantle et al. 2005

Species	Number	Exposure concentration & purification	Exposure	Feed Intake	Results	NOAEL/LOAEL	Comments	Reference
		product 5-6 mg OTA/g						
		OTA B 5-10 % of total OTA						
Studies in m	lice		4				•	-
Male p53 +/- mice (P53N5-T) Male p53 +/+ mice (P53N5-W)	Total N = 80 N=40 / strain 4 x N=10 / dose / strain	Weeks 1 & 2 1, 15 or 40 mg/kg diet Due to rapid weight loss Weeks 3-26 0.5, 2 or 10 mg/kg diet OTA was purchased Purity > 98%	Daily via diet 26 weeks	Mean daily OTA consumption based on recovery from diet Week 1 & 2 0.8, 10.2, or 31.7 mg OTA/kg bw/day (20-30% lower than at preparation) Week 3-26 0.03, 0.20, or 1.46 mg/kg bw/day	Renal damage; no tumours -renal lesions, cellular proliferation, karyomegaly, apoptosis, tubular degeneration, anisokaryosis in epithelium of proximal tubules -consistent with ochratoxicosis Lesion in the lung, consistant wirh eosinophilic crystalline pneumonia Dose dependent increase in PCNA- positive epithelial cells on proximal tubules (sign higher in 10 mg/kg diet) Expression of kidney injury biomarkers CLU ^a & OPN ^a in proximal tubules was significantly increased in p53+/+ mice (10 mg /kg) and	LOEL 200 µg/kg bw per day Equivalent to 2 mg/kg diet	LOEL – derived based on literature? No mention of derivation based on experimental results in text Authors interpreted results as suggestive of primarily nongenotoxic (epigenic) MOA OTA not detected in control diet LOQ 6 ng/g LOD 1.6 ng/g	Bondy et al. 2015
Male	Total	3.5 mg/kg bw	1, 2, 3 or 6		p53+/- mice (2 & 10 mg/kg) Significant alteration in the			Paradells et al.
C57BL/6 mice	N=26 OTA1-3	In a volume of 2.8 μL/g bw	cumulative doses by intraperito		proliferation process Suggest that OTA exposure can affect			2014
	N=4 (for each	OTA was	neal injection		the brain development, alter the regulation of adult neurogenesis,			

Species	Number	Exposure concentration & purification	Exposure	Feed Intake	Results	NOAEL/LOAEL	Comments	Reference
	dose)	purchased Purity 99%	(OTA1, OTA2,		acting as a detrimental factor of the neuroregenerative capacity of the			
	OTA6	-	OTA3,		brain			
	N=8		OTA6)					
					Decrease in ^a BrdU ⁺ in OTA2,3&6			
	Control		Each dose					
	N=6		separated		Maximum proliferation impairment			
			by 3 days		OTA6			
			to min					
			toxic					
			effects					
Male Swiss	N=70	Neurotoxicity	Single		3.5 mg/kg i.p.			Sava et al. 2006
ICR mice	Experime	0-6 mg/kg bw	exposure		-Ox stress in all brain regions			
	ntal	2 E malka	by		-TBARS ^a levels increased			
	N=20	3.5 mg/kg	intraperito neal		-upregulation of SOD activities (peak values after 24h)			
	Control	Purchased	injection		-reduction of striatal DA ^a , DA			
	control	Turchased	injection		turnover & TH ^a immunoreactivity			
			Endpoints					
			6, 24 or 72		0-6 mg/kg i.p.ª			
			hours after		Dose dependent decrease in striatal			
			injection		content & turnover with an ED_{50}^{a} of			
					3.2 mg/kg			
Study in rab	bits						-	
Male New	Total	1 ppm	Diet		Dullness, lethargy, marked		Combination study with	Prabu et al. 2013
Zealand	N=32				depression, anorexia and dehydration		AFB1 ^a	
white			30 & 60		at 60 days.			
rabbits	N=4 /		days					
	group				Significant decrease in bw from day			
					30 up to day 60 days			
					Significant nephrotoxicity			
					- degeneration of the proximal			

Species	Number	Exposure concentration & purification	Exposure	Feed Intake	Results	NOAEL/LOAEL	Comments	Reference
					convoluted tubules			
					Testes were atrophic			

*LOAEL/NOAEL not given by the authors but derived from the information given in the paper **Exposures not given by authors but derived from levels of OTA in feed and the feed intake a Please find full names in abbreviation list on pages 15 and 16

Annex B

59. Systematic literature searches were performed to retrieve appropriate information on OTA toxicity and occurrence in breast milk. The search engine used was pubmed.

Toxicity data

- 60. A literature search was performed in September 2017 to retrieve new *in vivo* toxicological studies since the EFSA opinion in 2006. To ensure that no publications were missed, the literature search was set from 2005 until the present date.
- 61. Using Boolian characters, the literature search was conducted using the search terms "ochratoxin a" AND toxic*. 791 hits were recorded and the abstracts were scanned for *in vivo* toxicity/studies. The relevant studies were retrieved or where necessary ordered.
- 62. The relevant studies have been summarized in Table 7 in Annex A.

Breast milk

- 63. A separate literature search was performed for ochratoxin a AND breastmilk. No limitations were set for said search and 54 hits were recorded. The abstracts were scanned and the relevant publications were retrieved or where necessary ordered. Publications from outside the European member states were excluded.
- 64. The relevant studies are summarized in Table 1 in the main body of the text.