

COMMITTEE ON TOXICITY OF CHEMICALS IN FOOD, CONSUMER PRODUCTS AND THE ENVIRONMENT

Review of the implications for risk management based on the EFSA opinion on “Risk for animal and human health related to the presence of dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs in feed and food”

Introduction

1. In November 2018, the European Food Safety Authority’s (EFSA) Panel on Contaminants in the Food Chain (CONTAM) published a new scientific opinion on the “risk for animal and human health related to the presence of dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs in feed and food”, which is attached in Annex 1 of this review. This EFSA opinion has been previously discussed by the COT in September 2019¹, where it was decided “it was not reasonable to dismiss the conclusions of EFSA regarding acceptable intake”.
2. The CONTAM panel established a Tolerable Weekly Intake (TWI) of 2 pg WHO-TEQ/kg bw, which is 7-fold lower than the previous Tolerable Daily intake (TDI) of 2 pg WHO-TEQ/kg bw. This has implications on the UK population where exposures for most of the population prior to the new TWI were below a level of concern exposure but could now at or above a level of concern. This suggests that current risk management measures for dioxin in food, which include regulatory limits and precautionary advice to consumers and are based on the previous TDI, may be inadequate.
3. It would be helpful to the FSA to understand whether the newly proposed TWI is relevant to all consumers and to place the various risks associated with exposure into perspective against other health risks, as well as nutritional benefits from food consumption. Furthermore, the food groups most implicated in exposure to dioxins are also the main dietary sources for a range of other environmental contaminants including several groups that are currently under consideration by EFSA (brominated flame retardants, perfluorinated alkyl substances, chlorinated paraffins).

¹ Minutes of the discussion paper presented in the September 2019 COT meeting can be accessed at:
<https://webarchive.nationalarchives.gov.uk/20200803163214/https://cot.food.gov.uk/sites/default/files/september2019minutes.pdf>

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

Toxicity

4. Various toxicological endpoints from the animal and epidemiological studies presented in the EFSA opinion are shown in Table 1 and 2.

Table 1. Toxic endpoints of TCDD in animal studies with a reported NOAEL and/or LOAEL body burden (adapted from CONTAM, 2019).

Congener	Toxic endpoints	Dose/ Exposure Level/ POD	Species	Comments/ References
	Systemic toxicity			
TCDD			Rodent	
	Decreased body weight at 100 ng/kg bw per day. Hypertrophy, dose related toxic hepatic lesions at 46 ng/kg bw/day. Hepatopathy at 100 ng/kg bw/day	Doses (oral): 0, 3, 10, 22, 46, 100 ng/kg bw/day (5 days per week) 0, 2.1, 7.1, 15.7, 32.9 and 71.4 ng/kg bw/day (7 days per week) Duration: 105 weeks NOAEL: 3ng/kg bw/day	Rat (Sprague Dawley) (F)	NOAEL based hepatopathy at 105 weeks. NTP (2006)

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

TCDD		NOAEL body burden: 85 ng/kg bw		
	<p>Inhibited body weight gain at 1,000 ng/kg bw/day.</p> <p>Dose-dependent increase in liver-to-body weight % and thymus-to-body weight % compared with control.</p> <p>Significant decreased spleen-to-body weight % observed at 1000ng/kg bw/day.</p> <p>Dose dependent increases in various serum clinical chemistry (ALP, AST, TBIL, TBA, TP GLOB, CHOL) and haematological parameters (i.e. RBC, haemoglobin and hematocrit).</p> <p>Dose dependent decrease in clinical chemistry (TRIG and GLUC) and haematological parameters (MCV, MCH and PLT).</p> <p>Histopathological changes were observed in liver at ≥ 22 ng/kg</p>	<p>Doses: 0, 3, 22, 100, 300, 1000 ng/kg bw per day</p> <p>Duration: 28 days</p> <p>NOAEL: 100 ng/kg bw per day</p> <p>NOAEL body burden: 789 ng/kg bw</p>	Rat (Sprague Dawley) (F)	<p>NOAEL based on bile duct hyperplasia and thymus atrophy.</p> <p>Harrill et al. (2016)</p>

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

TCDD	<p>bw/day, where dose-related increases in severity of hepatocellular vacuolation consistent with fatty change and inflammatory cell foci. Moderate hepatocellular hypertrophy at 1000 ng/kg bw/day and mild hepatocellular hypertrophy at 22-300 ng/kg bw/day.</p> <p>Histopathological changes were observed in the thymus at ≥ 300 ng/kg bw/day. Changes included a loss of cellularity in the cortex of the thymus.</p>			
	Immunotoxicity			
			Rodent	
	<p>Suppression of the percentage of LPS-induced IgM+ cells, yet an increment of (ex vivo LPS-induced) proliferation, indicating a dysregulation of the humoral immune response with an effect level in the wild type rats receiving 100 ng/kg.</p> <p>Also there was a decrease percentage in natural killer cell at 100 ng/kg.</p>	<p>Doses (oral): 0, 3, 22, 100, 300, 1000 ng/kg/day (5 days)</p> <p>Duration: 4 weeks</p> <p>NOAEL: 22 ng/kg bw/day</p> <p>NOAEL body burden: 250 ng/kg bw</p>	Rat (Sprague Dawley) (M+F)	<p>NOAEL based on distribution of lymphocytes and NK cells.</p> <p>Phadnis-Moghe et al. (2016).</p>
	Reproductive Toxicity			
		Rodent		

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

TCDD	<p>Reduced daily sperm production in male offspring on PND 70 and 170 and sperm number in epididymis was also reduced.</p>	<p>Doses (s.c): Initial loading dose: 25, 60, 300 ng kg/bw followed by a weekly maintenance dose of 5, 12 or 60 ng/kg bw</p> <p>NOAEL body burden: 25 ng/kg bw</p>	Rat (Wistar) (M)	<p>NOAEL based on decreased sperm production.</p> <p>Faqi et al. (1998)</p>
	<p>Decrease in the no. of alive pups on day 1 and the number of pups surviving between days 1-4 the 530 ng/kg diet dose group</p> <p>Decreased body weight in the F1 generation 93 and 530 ng/kg diet</p> <p>Delayed balanopreputial separation in F1 generation in all dose groups.</p>	<p>Doses (oral): 0, 28, 93, 530 ng/kg diet</p> <p>0, 2.4, 8 or 46 ng/kg bw/ day (Average dose)</p> <p>Duration: Acute</p> <p>LOAEL: 2.4 ng/kg bw/day</p> <p>LOAEL body burden: 42 and 50 ng/kg bw on GD16 and GD21)</p>	Rat (Wistar) (F)	<p>Bell et al. (2007a)</p> <p>LOAEL based on delayed balanopreputial separation</p>

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

TCDD	<p>Significantly lower litter size (12% lower) in the 1000 ng/kg bw group compared to the control group during lactation (PND21)</p> <p>Reduced body weight gain in the F1 generation in the 1000 ng/kg bw dose group up to PND21.</p> <p>Slightly reduced body weight in F1 generation in the 200 ng/kg bw dose group up to PND7.</p> <p>In the 1000 ng/kg bw dose group there was a slight decrease in testes weight at PND70 and 120 and lower brain weight on PND120 and liver to body weight ratios were increased across all dose groups.</p>	<p>Doses (oral): 0, 50, 200, 1000 ng/kg bw (single dose on GD15)</p> <p>Duration: 15 weeks</p> <p>LOAEL: 200 ng/kg bw</p> <p>NOAEL: 50 ng/kg bw</p> <p>NOAEL body burden (GD16): 56.2 ng/kg bw</p> <p>NOAEL body burden (GD21): 58.5 ng/kg bw</p>	Rat (Han Wistar) (F)	<p>Bell et al. (2007b)</p> <p>NOAEL/LOAEL based on decreased pup weight from PND1 to PND7</p>
	<p>Delayed puberty development of male F1 rats.</p> <p>F1 males at PND70 and PND120 had a proportion of abnormal sperm at the highest dose at PND70.</p>	<p>Doses: 0, 2.4, 8 or 46 ng TCDD/kg bw per day (diet)</p> <p>LOAEL: 2.4 ng/kg bw per day</p>	Rat (Han Wistar) (M)	Bell et al. (2007c)

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

TCDD	~10% decrease in testes weight at PND70.	LOAEL body burden: 42 and 50 ng/kg bw on GD16 and GD21 respectively)		
	Embryo loss possibly due to accumulation of TCDD in the uterus.	Doses: 0, 2, 50, 100 ng/kg bw (oral exposure) Duration 8 days NOAEL: 2ng/kg bw NOEL body burden: 9 ng/kg bw (GD1-3) NOAEL body burden: 25 ng/kg bw (GD 1-8)	Mouse (NIH) (F)	Li et al. (2006)
	Carcinogenicity			
			Rodent	
Significant increase in hepatocellular adenomas and cholangiocarcinomas at 100 ng/kg bw/day.	Doses: 0, 3, 10, 22, 46, 100 ng/kg bw/day (5 days per week)	Rat (Sprague-Dawley) (F)	NOAEL based on hepatopathy at 105 weeks. NTP (2006)	

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

		<p>0, 2.1, 7.1, 15.7, 32.9 and 71.4 ng/kg bw/day (7 days per week)</p> <p>Duration: 105 weeks</p> <p>NOAEL: 3 ng/kg bw/day</p> <p>NOAEL body burden: 85 ng/kg bw</p>		
TCDD	Tooth and bone development			
			Rodent	
	<p>Decreased tibial length in LE rats at $\geq 17 \mu\text{g/kg}$ and in HW rats at $170 \mu\text{g/kg}$.</p> <p>Dose-dependent decrease in bone cross sectional size in LE rats from $1.7 \mu\text{g/kg}$.</p> <p>Breaking forces of tibia and other bone parameters were reduced by TCDD in HW rats at $170 \mu\text{g/kg}$ and $17 \mu\text{g/kg}$ in LE rats.</p>	<p>Doses (s.c.):</p> <p>Cumulative doses: 0.17, 1.7, 17, 170 $\mu\text{g/kg}$ via loading doses of 0.035, 0.35, 3.5 and 35 ng/kg bw/day.</p> <p>Followed by weekly maintenance doses:</p>	<p>Rat (Han wistar and long evans) (F)</p>	<p>NOAEL based on decreased tibia length, tibia geometry parameters, tibia ash weight and increased plasma ALP activity.</p> <p>Jämsä et al. (2001)</p>

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

TCDD		0.007, 0.07, 0.7 and 7ng/kg bw/day. Calculated daily doses: 1, 10, 100, 1000 ng/kg bw/day Duration: 20 weeks NOAEL: 1ng/kg bw/day NOAEL body burden: 28 ng/kg bw		
-------------	--	---	--	--

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

Table 2. Toxic endpoints of dioxin congeners (TCDD, PCDDs, PCDFs, DL-PCBs) (Adapted from CONTAM, 2018)

Congener	Toxic endpoints	Dose/ Exposure Level/ POD	Species	Comments/ References
TCDD	Immunotoxicity			
			Human	
	A study in the Seveso area showed subjects from the zones contaminated by TCDD showed lower plasma IgG levels compared to subjects from the surrounding reference area. Plasma IgG decreased with increasing lipid-adjusted TCDD plasma concentration (r =-0.53; p=0.0002).	Exposure: 3.5 – 90 pg/g fat in blood (plasma) Duration: 20 years after exposure	Human (sex not specified)	Seveso study (Italy, Seveso) Baccarelli et al. (2004)
	Reproductive Toxicity			
		Rodent		
	Repeated dosing of TCDD resulted in reduced ventral prostrate weight in F1 rats and a decreased male/female ratio in their F2 offspring.	Doses Loading dose (administered to dams prior to mating): 400 ng/kg bw Weekly maintenance doses (administered during mating, pregnancy, lactation):	Rat (Holtzman rats) (F)	Ikeda et al. (2005)

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

	80 ng/kg bw NOAEL: not stated		
TCDD	Gestational TCDD exposure resulted in abolished gender differences in the anteroventral periventricular nucleus expression of enzyme; glutamic acid decarboxylase 67.	Doses: 1 µg/kg NOAEL: n/a	Rat (M +F) Hays et al. (2002)
	A dose dependent reduction in male/female ratio was recorded when male mice were treated with TCDD prior to mating.	Initial loading dose: 2 or 2000 ng/kg Weekly maintenance dose: 0.4, 400 ng/kg NOAEL: not stated	Mouse (M) Ishihara et al. (2007)
	At the two-cell embryo stage, the proportion of male embryos was significantly lower compared to the control group, suggesting a diminished ability of Y-bearing sperm to conceive the ova.	Initial loading dose: 2000 ng/kg Followed by a weekly maintenance dose: 400 ng/kg (TCDD2000/400 group). NOAEL: n/a	Mouse (M) Ishihara et al. (2010)

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

		Human	
TCDD	<p>Children (1-9 years) exposed to TCDD had negative associations with sperm concentration (53.6 vs 72.5 million/mL), progressive motility 33.2 vs 40.8%, motile sperm count 44.2 vs 77.5 x10⁶.</p>	<p>Measurement of exposure:</p> <p>TCDD</p> <p>Median TCDD at time of explosion: 210 pg/g fat (blood)</p> <p>Median TCDD in control group: ≤15 pg/g fat.</p> <p>Duration: 22 years</p>	<p>Human (M)</p> <p>Seveso Cohort (Italy, Seveso) Mocarelli et al. (2008)</p>
	<p>Impaired semen quality in men born and breastfed to mothers exposed in the Seveso incident.</p> <p>Sons who were breastfed by mothers who had TCDD levels of 19 pg/g after exposure had lower sperm concentration (36.3 vs 86.3 million/mL), total sperm count (116.9 vs 231.1 x 10⁶), progressive motility (35.8 vs 44.2%) and total motile count (83.7 vs 98 million) compared to breastfed controls.</p>	<p>Measurement of exposure:</p> <p>TCDD</p> <p>Median TCDD (at conception calculated for 20-42 years of age using a TCDD half-life of 4 years)</p> <p>Mothers who breastfed: 19 pg/g fat (maternal blood)</p> <p>Duration: 18-26 years</p>	<p>Human (M+F)</p> <p>Seveso Cohort (Italy, Seveso) Mocarelli et al. (2011)</p>

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

<p>TCDD</p>	<p>Every 10-fold increase in serum TCDD resulted in a 25% increase in time to pregnancy and a doubling in odds of infertility.</p>	<p>Measurement of exposure: TCDD Median TCDD at time of exposure: 50 pg/g fat Extrapolated to time of conception: 13.4 pg/g fat Duration: >20 years</p>	<p>Human (M+F)</p> <p>Seveso Women's Health Study (SWHS) Eskenazi et al. (2010)</p>
	<p>Increased probability of female births (lower sex ratio) with increasing serum TCDD concentrations from fathers (p=0.008).</p>	<p>Measurement of exposure: TCDD Median TCDD levels in blood – Fathers: 96.5 pg/g fat Median TCDD levels in blood - Mothers:</p>	<p>Seveso study (Italy, Seveso) Mocarelli et al. (2000)</p>

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

TCDD		62.75 pg/g/fat Duration: n/a		
	Endocrine mediated activity			
			Rodent	
	Significant Decreased T4 levels by 14 weeks at 22 ng/kg bw/day.	Doses (oral): 0, 3, 10, 22, 46, 100 ng/kg bw/day (oral) 0, 2.1, 7.1, 15.7, 32.9 and 71.4 ng/kg bw/day (7 days per week) Duration: 105 weeks NOAEL: 3ng/kg bw/day NOAEL body burden: 85 ng/kg bw	Rat (F) (Sprague Dawley)	NOAEL based on hepatopathy at 105 weeks. NTP (2006)
			Human	
Women who were premenarcheal at time of explosion, a 10-fold increase in serum TCDD level was associated with a lengthening of the menstrual cycle by 0.93 days and reduction of the odds of scanty menstrual flow.	Measurement of exposure: TCDD Median plasma TCDD levels: 67.5 pg/g fat Duration: 20-21 years		Seveso Women's Health Study (SWHS) (Italy, Seveso) Eskenazi et al. (2002)	

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

TCDD	<p>Higher proportion of children with neonatal blood thyroid-stimulating hormone (b-TSH) that was $\geq 5 \mu\text{U/mL}$ who were born to mothers highly exposed in Seveso (Zone A).</p> <p>The proportion of children in Zone A with b-TSH levels $\geq 5 \mu\text{U/mL}$ was 16.1% compared to 4.9% in Zone B and 2.8% in the reference area (Zone R).</p> <p>TSH decreased with order of siblings in zone A and B, but not in Zone R.</p> <p>In a subgroup, neonatal blood TSH was significantly associated with TCDD levels.</p>	<p>Measurement of exposure:</p> <p>TCDD 17 PCDD/Fs 12 DL-PCBs</p> <p>Median TCDD levels in individuals 1-2 year after the accident (1977-1978):</p> <p>Zone A (very high contamination) = 447 pg/g fat (blood)</p> <p>Zone B (high contamination) = 94 pg/g fat (blood)</p> <p>Zone R (non-contaminated area) = 48 pg/g fat (blood)</p> <p>Mean TCDD levels in newborns with b-TSH $\geq 5 \mu\text{U/mL}$: 39 pg/g fat (blood)</p> <p>Mean total TEQ levels in newborns with b-TSH $\geq 5 \mu\text{U/mL}$:</p>	Human (M+F)	<p>Seveso Cohort (Seveso, Italy)</p> <p>Data on timing of TSH blood is missing, making quantitative association between TCDD and TSH uncertain in subgroup, as TSH can decrease by a factor of 5-10 in the first 2-3 days after birth.</p> <p>Baccarelli et al. (2008)</p>
-------------	--	--	-------------	--

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

TCDD		84.5 pg/g fat (blood)		
		Duration: 25 years		
	Increased levels of dioxin-like substances in adipose tissue in patients with deep infiltrating endometriosis (DIE) .	Measurement of exposure: TCDD 17 PCDD/Fs 12 DL-PCBs Median TCDD (cases): 0.70 pg/g fat (adipose tissue) Median TCDD (controls): 0.40 pg/g fat (adipose tissue) Duration: n/a OR (TCDD): 1.41	Human (F)	Spain, Catalonia Martinez-Zamora et al. (2015)
	Carcinogenicity			
			Human	
Increased SMR for total cancer mortality; 1.41	Measurement of exposure: TCDD Mean TCDD: 101.3 pg/g fat	Human (M)	Hamburg, Germany Becher et al. (1998)	

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

TCDD	<p>For workers exposed to TCDD dermally the SMR (all cancers combined) = 1.13. No marked specificity for any one cancer type was noted.</p> <p>Statistically significant positive linear trends in SMRs with increasing exposure for all cancer combined and for lung cancer.</p> <p>Regression analyses showed a significant trend for cancer with a 15-year lag time. The excess cancer was limited to the highest exposure group who were likely exposed to 100-1000 times the concentrations of the general population.</p>	<p>A cumulative exposure score of 20,000, which was the cut-off between septiles 6 and 7 would correspond to estimated exposure of:</p> <p>38,000 pg/g-years (lipid adjusted)</p> <p>(e.g. mean serum TCDD level: 2,000 pg/g fat (over a 20-year period) *Cumulative exposure scores were calculated for each production plant exposure scores based on Job Exposure Matrix, calibrated against serum TCDD in subgroup.</p> <p>Duration/ Follow up: 15-57 years</p>	Human (M)	<p>USA</p> <p>Steenland et al. (1999)</p>
	<p>Mortality in men in Zones A and B increased for: all cancers (RR = 1.3), rectal cancer (RR = 2.4), lung cancer (RR = 1.3)</p> <p>RR increased after 15 years for lung and rectal cancer.</p>	<p>Measurement of TCDD: TCDD</p> <p>Median TCDD levels - (Zone A): 447 pg/g fat (1976-77)</p>	Human (M+F)	<p>Seveso study (Italy, Seveso)</p> <p>Bertazzi et al. (2001)</p>

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

TCDD	<p>Excess of lymphohaematopoietic neoplasms in both genders (RR=1.7)</p> <p>Risk of Hodgkin's disease elevated in the first 10 years observation period (RR=4.9), whereas the highest increase for non-Hodgkin's lymphoma (RR=2.8) and myeloid leukaemia (RR=3.8) occurred after 15 years.</p>	<p>73.7 pg/g fat (1993-94)</p> <p>Median TCDD levels (blood) - Zone B:</p> <p>94 pg/g fat (1976-77) 12.4 pg/g fat (1993-94)</p> <p>Median TCDD levels (blood) -Zone R:</p> <p>48 pg/g fat (1976-77)</p> <p>Median TCDD levels (blood) – Reference: 5.5 pg/g fat (1993-4)</p>		
	<p>A positive trend between increasing cumulative TCDD exposure and cancer mortality.</p> <p>Excess lifetime risk of dying of cancer at an intake of 1 pg/kg bw/day was 0.05-0.9% above a background lifetime risk of cancer death of 12.4%.</p>	<p>Measurement of exposure:</p> <p>TCDD</p> <p>Estimated mean cumulative serum TCDD levels at end of follow-up: 343 pg/g</p> <p>Estimated mean cumulative serum TCDD levels at end of exposure: 1,589 pg/g</p>	Human (M)	<p>USA</p> <p>Steenland et al. (2001)</p>

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

TCDD	<p>Individual serum TCDD levels in women aged 20 to ≥50 years correlated with breast cancer incidence at 20 years after the incident.</p> <p>Hazard ratio (HR) for breast cancer in women with a mean age of 50.8 years increased to 2.1 and was associated with a 10-fold increase in serum TCDD (Warner et al., 2002).</p> <p>The adjusted HR of 1.8 associated with a 10-fold increase in serum TCDD for all cancers combined significantly increased.</p> <p>For breast cancer, the adjusted HR of 1.44 was increased but not significantly and the increased risk for breast cancer seen in earlier studies not sustained.</p>	<p>Measurement of exposure:</p> <p>TCDD</p> <p>Warner et al. (2002): Median blood (serum) TCDD levels in breast cancer cases: 71.8 pg/g fat</p> <p>Median blood (serum) TCDD levels in non-cancer cases: 55.1 pg/g</p> <p>Warner et al. (2011): Mean blood TCDD levels in cancer cases: 95.3 pg/g fat.</p> <p>Mean blood TCDD levels in non-cancer cases: 67.9 pg/g fat</p>	Human (F)	<p>Seveso Women's Health Study</p> <p>Warner et al. (2002); Warner et al. (2011)</p>
	<p>Increased risk of lymphatic and haematological cancer in both TCDD exposed zones. Zone A (6 deaths): RR=2.23 Zone B (28 deaths): RR=1.59</p>	<p>Measurement of exposure:</p> <p>TCDD</p> <p>Median TCDD levels (blood) - Zone A:</p>	Human (M+F)	<p>Seveso Cohort (Italy, Seveso)</p> <p>Consonni et al. (2008)</p>

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

TCDD		<p>447 pg/g fat (1976-77) 73.3 pg/g fat (1992-96)</p> <p>Median TCDD levels (blood) – Zone B: 94.0 pg/g fat (1976–77) 12.4 pg/g fat (1992–96)</p> <p>Median TCDD levels (blood) – Zone R: 48 pg/g fat (1976-77)</p> <p>Median TCDD levels (blood) -Reference: 5.5 pg/g fat (1992-96)</p> <p>Duration/ follow up: 25 years</p>		
	<p>Increased risk of lymphatic and haematological cancer in both exposed zones: Zone A – RR=1.39 Zone B – RR=1.56</p> <p>Increased risk of breast cancer in zone A after 15 years since the accident: RR=2.57</p>	<p>Measurement of exposure: TCDD</p> <p>Median TCDD levels (blood) - Zone A: 447 pg/g fat (1976-77) 73.3 pg/g fat (1992-96)</p>	Human (M+F)	<p>Seveso Cohort (Italy, Seveso) Pesatori et al. (2009)</p>

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

TCDD	<p>94 pg WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/g fat (1993-94)</p> <p>Median TCDD levels (blood) – Zone B:</p> <p>94 pg/g fat (1976–77) 12.4 pg/g fat (1992–96) 43.2 pg WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/g fat (1993-94)</p> <p>Median TCDD levels (blood) – Zone R: 48 pg/g fat (1976-77)</p> <p>Median TCDD levels (blood) -Reference: 5.5 pg/g fat (1992-96) 38.8 pg WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/g fat (1993-94)</p> <p>Duration/follow-up: 20 years</p>		
	<p>Greater number of death from NHL (SMR =1.3), leukaemia (SMR = 1.9) than expected and there were 4 deaths from soft tissue sarcoma (SMR= 4.1).</p>	<p>Measurement of exposure:</p> <p>TCDD</p> <p>TCDD levels (blood) - workers in trichlorophenol units: 15.9 pg/g fat</p>	<p>Human (sex not stated)</p>

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

TCDD		TCDD levels (blood) in-worker referents =6.5 pg/g fat		
	There was an increase in the (SMR = 2.4) for NHL .	Measurement of exposure: TCDD TCDD levels (blood) - workers in trichlorophenol units: 15.9 pg/g fat TCDD levels (blood) in-worker referents: 6.5 pg/g fat	Human (sex not stated)	Michigan, US Collins et al. (2009b)
	Sufficient evidence in humans for carcinogenicity of TCDD (Group 1 carcinogen).		Human (M+F)	Based on data from experimental animals, epidemiological studies, and from the common mechanism of action. IARC, 2012
	Exposure to TCDD in a herbicide plant was associated with increased standardised mortality ratio (SMR) for respiratory cancer (SMR =1.64), oesophageal cancer (SMR = 2.56) and rectum cancer (SMR = 1.96) in men. In	Measurement of exposure: TCDD Median TCDD levels: 77 pg/g fat	Human (M+F)	Germany, Hamburg Manuwald et al. (2012)

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

TCDD	women, exposure was associated with an increased in breast cancer in women (SMR = 1.86).	Duration/ follow up: 23 year		
	Neurotoxicity			
			Human	
	Increased risk of children not being able to perform each milestone in mothers who had exposure >38 pg CALUX-TEQ/g lipid. Significant odds ratio identified between one developmental milestone (i.e. cannot crawl) at 6 months of age and dioxin -like activity >38 pg CALUX-TEQ/g lipid in plasma.	Measurement of exposure: CALUX determined bioanalytical equivalent (BEQ) levels 7, 19.6, 38.2, 56.6, 134.6pg CALUX-TEQ/g lipid (5th, 25th, 75th and 95th percentiles of plasma samples pg BEQs/g fat Duration: n/a	Human	Danish National Birth Cohort (Denmark) Authors stated that bioassay results may be confounded by PAHs Halldorsson et al. (2009)
	Tooth and bone development			
			Rat	
In utero exposure on GD15 or lactational exposure to TCDD, resulted in reduced size or prevented the development of	Doses (oral): 0.03, 0.1, 0.3, 1 µg/kg bw (single dose) NOAEL = not stated	Rat (Han Wistar) (F)	Kattainen et al. (2001)	

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

TCDD	the third lower molars of rat pups.	Duration: 5-10 weeks		
	Administration of TCDD to lactating dams on day 1 after delivery resulted in half of pups lacking one or more third molars by day 22 and total lack of mineralisation in third molar cusps.	Doses (i.p injection): 50, 1000 µg/kg bw (single dose) NOAEL: not stated	Rat (Han Wistar) (F)	Lukinmaa et al. (2001)
	TCDD administered to dams resulted in absence of third molars in pups exposed in utero and via lactation. The frequency of missing molars was greater the earlier the dam was exposed: 100%, 88% and 50% of the offspring exposed on GD11, GD 13 and GD19 respectively.	Doses: 1 µg/kg bw NOAEL: n/a	Rat (Dioxin-sensitive line C rats) (F)	Miettinen et al. (2002)
	Cariogenic lesions were detectable in the enamel of pup molars who received 0.03 µg/kg.	Doses (oral): 0.03, 0.1, 0.3, 1 µg/kg (single dose) NOAEL: not stated	Rat (Dioxin-sensitive line C rats) (F)	Miettinen et al. (2006)
			Monkey	

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

TCDD	<p>Tooth abnormalities observed in the 300 ng/kg group when exposed during gestation (on GD20) and lactation.</p>	<p>Doses (s.c injection): 0, 30, 300 ng/kg</p> <p>Duration: 3-10 years</p> <p>NOAEL: not stated</p>	<p>Monkey (Rhesus macaque) (F)</p>	<p>Yasuda et al. (2005)</p>
	<p>Enamel defects: 24% (27/113) of all subjects had enamel defects. 93% of subjects (25/27) with enamel defects were <5 years of aged at the time of the accident.</p> <p>Zone ABR subjects and zone non-ABR subjects had prevalence of tooth defects in those <5 years of age was 42% (15/36) and was 26% (10/39) respectively.</p> <p>Enamel defects in zone ABR correlated with TCDD levels: T1 = 1/10, T2 = 5/11, T3=9/15 (p=0.016).</p> <p>OR = 2.4 (for enamel defects in T2 and T3, with non-ABR children as referent population)</p> <p>Hypodontia:</p>	<p>TCDD concentration in zone ABR</p> <p>Median: 476 pg/g fat</p> <p>T1: 31-226 pg/g fat T2: 238-592 pg/g fat T3: 700-26,000 pg/g fat</p> <p>TCDD concentration in zone non-ABR Concentration was indicated by 2 pooled samples from children with 33.4 and 47.6 ng TCDD/g fat</p> <p>*T1-T3 = Tertile 1-3</p> <p>Duration/ follow up: 25 years</p>	<p>Human</p> <p>Human (M+F)</p>	<p>Seveso Cohort (Italy, Seveso)</p> <p>Alaluusua et al. (2004)</p>

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

TCDD	<p>Lateral incisors or second premolars were missing in 12.5% (6/48) of subjects from zone ABR and in 4.6% (3/65) of non-ABR subjects. Frequency increased with serum TCDD level (p=0.005).</p> <p>*Zone A and B = contaminated areas. *Zone R = lightly contaminated areas.</p>			
Carcinogenicity				
			Human	
TCDD/ PCDD/Fs	<p>The total cancer SMR was 1.41, with TCDD showing a significant trend in SMR and elevated risk of total cancer with increasing PCDD/F exposure.</p>	<p>Measurement of exposure:</p> <p>TCDD, PCDD/Fs</p> <p>Mean TCDD:</p> <p>Males: 108 ng/kg fat (blood) Females: 110.5 ng/kg fat (blood)</p> <p>Mean TEQO:</p>	Human (M+F)	

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

TCDD/ PCDD/Fs		Males: 142 ng/kg fat (blood) Females: 62.7 ng/kg fat (blood) *PCDD/F calculated as TEQO		
PCDD/Fs/ DL-PBCs	Genotoxicity			
			Cow	
	Higher levels of dioxin in milk of exposed cows (Farm A) than both those permitted (i.e. 6 pg/g fat) and those reached in the control (Farm B). Increase in chromosome aberrations but no significant effect on sister chromatid exchange (SCE) in cows in Farm A	Measurement of exposure: 17 PCDD/Fs 12 DL-PCBs Doses - Sum of PCDDs, PCDFs and DL-PCBs in exposed (Farm A): 21.79 pg/g fat (milk) Doses - Sum of PCDDs, PCDFs and DL-PCBs in control (Farm B): 1.3 pg/g fat (milk) NOAEL: not stated	Ruminant (buffalo Cow)	Genuardo et al. (2012)

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

PCDD/Fs/ DL-PBCs	Increase in chromosome aberrations and slight increase in SCE in lymphocytes in cows from two farms with higher levels dioxin than those permitted (6.0 pg/g fat) and those in controls groups.	<p>Measurement of exposure 17 PCDD/Fs 12 DL-PCBs</p> <p>Doses (Sum of PCDDs, PCDFs and DL-PCBs in Group B - control):</p> <p>1.75 pg/g fat – Iannuzzi et al. (2009); Di Meo et al. (2011)</p> <p>Doses (Sum of PCDDs, PCDFs and DL-PCBs in Group A):</p> <p>18.56 pg/g TEQ/g fat – Iannuzzi et al.(2009)</p> <p>Doses (Sum of PCDDs, PCDFs and DL-PCBs in Farm B: 8.56 pg/g TEQ/g fat (milk) – Di Meo et al. (2011)</p>	Buffalo cows	Iannuzzi et al. (2009); Di Meo et al. (2011)
	Reproductive toxicity			
Human				
A prospective cohort study found an association of	Measurement of exposure:	Human (M+F)		

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

<p>PCDD/Fs /DL-PCBs</p>	<p>maternal dietary exposure to dioxins and PCBs during pregnancy and increased risk of the occurrence of wheeze and upper respiratory infection in young children.</p> <p>A reduced antibody response to measles vaccination was also identified.</p>	<p>17 PCDD/Fs 12 DL-PCBs</p> <p>Median dietary intake of PCDD/Fs, and DL-PCBs:</p> <p>0.58 pg WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/kg bw/day</p> <p>Duration/follow up: 1 year</p> <p>Stolevik et al., (2011)</p> <p>Median dietary intake of PCDD/Fs, and DL-PCBs:</p> <p>0.59 pg WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/kg bw/day</p> <p>Duration/follow up: 3 years</p> <p>Stolevik et al., (2013)</p>		<p>BraMat (MoBa subcohort, Norway)</p> <p>Stolevik et al. (2011, 2013)</p>
	<p>Changes in time of pubertal onset (timing and growth) and sexual maturity and altered</p>	<p>Measurement of exposure:</p> <p>17 PCDD/Fs</p>	<p>Human (M+F)</p>	<p>The Russian Children's Study.</p> <p>The CONTAM panel considered that there was</p>

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

<p>PCDD/Fs and/DL-PCBs</p>	<p>semen parameter in boys born to mothers exposed to dioxin.</p> <p>An association between sum of dioxins and PCBs in boys at the time of enrolment (aged 8-9 years) and earlier onset of genitalia stage 2 in offspring at ages 11-12.</p> <p>PCDD was associated with decreased sperm parameters (sperm concentration, sperm count and motile sperm count) in men.</p>	<p>10 DL-PCBs (-77, -81, -126, -169, -105, -118, -156, -157, -167, -189)</p> <p>Median sum of PCDD/Fs and PCBs in blood of boys aged 8-9 years (pg WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/g fat):</p> <p>Q1 = 4-14.5 Q2 = 14.6-21 Q3 = 21.1-33.2 Q4 = 33.3-174.7 Median = 21.1</p> <p>– Burns et al. (2016)</p> <p>Mean total TEQ levels in boys at age of enrolment (8-9 years old) pg WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/g fat (blood)</p> <p>Total TEQ=27.7 PCDD = 10.6 PCDF = 7.0 PCB = 8.1 – Korrick et al. (2011)</p>	<p>insufficient information to conclude on causal associations.</p> <p>(Korrick et al. (2011); Burns et al., 2016; Minguez-Alarcón et al. (2017)</p>
-----------------------------------	---	---	--

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

PCDD/Fs/ DL-PCBs		Median TEQ levels pg WHO ²⁰⁰⁵ -TEQ/g fat in (blood) PCDD = 8.7 - Minguéz-Alarcón et al. (2017)		
	Perinatal BEQ exposure associated with increased growth between 0 and 24 months.	Measurement of exposure: CALUX determined BEQ levels Mean (FLEHS I): 31.2 pg BEQ/g fat (cord serum) Mean (HUMIS): 7.9 pg BEQ/g fat (milk) Mean (Slovak PCB): 15.5 BEQ/g fat (milk)	Human (M+F)	Pooled analysis of 3 European birth cohorts: HUMIS (Norway) FLEHS I (Belgium) Slovak PCB (Slovakia) Iszatt et al. (2016)
	Significant inverse associations between birth weight for total PCDD-TEQ, PCDF-TEQ and PCB-TEQ levels in maternal blood from the Yusho cohort among male infants but not females.	Measurement of exposure: 17 PCDD/Fs 4 DL-PCB (-77, -81, -126, -169) Mean total TEQ:	Human (M+F)	Yusho Cohort (Japan, Western Japan) Tsukimori et al. (2012)

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

PCDD/Fs and/DL- PCBs	<p>68.92 pg/g fat (maternal blood - Yusho) 23.36 pg/g fat (blood - general pop.)</p> <p>Mean total PCDDs TEQ:</p> <p>16.01 pg/g fat (maternal blood - Yusho) 10.66 pg/g fat (blood - general pop.)</p> <p>Mean total PCDFs TEQ:</p> <p>41.98 pg/g fat (maternal blood - Yusho) 4.09 pg/g fat (blood – general pop.)</p> <p>Mean total PCB TEQ:</p> <p>10.93 pg/g fat (maternal blood – Yusho) 8.49 pg/g fat (blood - general pop.)</p>		
	<p>A negative trend reported with current exposure to PCDD/Fs and DL-PCBs for age of first</p>	<p>Measurement of exposure:</p> <p>17 PCDD/Fs</p>	Human (M)

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

PCDD/Fs and/DL-PCBs	<p>ejaculation in boys aged 14-19 years.</p>	<p>3 DL-PCBs (-77, -126, -169)</p> <p>Median PCDD/F-TEQ: 28.6 pg I-TEQ/g fat (milk)</p> <p>Median current PCDD/F-TEQs exposure: 2.3 pg WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/g fat (blood)</p> <p>Median current DL-PCB-TEQs exposure: 1.5 pg WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/g fat (blood)</p>		
	<p>DL-PCBs were negatively correlated with breast development in girls (p=0.04, OR =0.56)</p>	<p>Measurement of exposure:</p> <p>CALUX determined BEQ levels</p> <p>Mean DL-PCBs: 32.1 pg BEQ/g fat (blood)</p>	Human (F)	<p>Flemish Environment and Health Study (FLEHS II)</p> <p>Croes et al. (2014)</p>
	<p>Immunotoxicity</p>			
			Human	

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

<p>PCDD/Fs/ DL-PBCs</p>	<p>PCDD/Fs and PCBs showed an inverse relationship with atopic dermatitis and rhinitis.</p>	<p>Measurement of exposure:</p> <p>17 PCDD/Fs 12 DL-PCBs</p> <p>Percentiles (WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/g fat): 5% = 4.8 25% = 9.7 50% = 16 75% 25 95% = 45</p> <p>Duration: 8 years</p>	<p>Human (M+F)</p>	<p>(Japan)</p> <p>Nakamoto et al. (2013)</p>
	<p>Prenatal exposure of PCDFs were associated with a significantly increased risk of otitis media, especially among male infants (OR=2.5). Whereas exposure of PeCDF were associated with significantly increased risk of otitis media (OR=5.3).</p> <p>Weak association between dioxin-like compounds levels and allergic symptoms in infancy.</p>	<p>Measurement of exposure:</p> <p>17 PCDD/Fs 4 DL-PCBs (-77, -81, -126, -169)</p> <p>Median total TEQs: 13.89 pg WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/g fat</p> <p>Median PCDDs-TEQ: 6.92 pg WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/g fat</p> <p>Median PCDFs-TEQ:</p>	<p>Human (M+F)</p>	<p>Hokkaido Study on Environment and Children's Health (Japan)</p> <p>The CONTAM panel considered that due to the extended number of outcomes measures, chance findings are likely.</p> <p>Miyashita et al. (2011)</p>

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

	2.38 pg WHO ₂₀₀₅ -TE/g fat		
	Duration: 3 years		
Endocrine mediated activity			
		Human	
PCDD/Fs/ DL-PCBs	<p>Play behaviour in children in the Dutch cohort showed that higher PCDD/Fs in maternal milk was associated with higher scores on the feminine subscale scale of the Pre-School Activity Inventory (PSAI) in both sexes, indicating more feminized play behaviour in both sexes.</p> <p>Sum of PCBs in milk was associated with masculine play behaviour.</p>	<p>Measurement of exposure:</p> <p>17 PCDD/Fs 6 DL-PCBs (-77, -126, -169, -105, -118, -156)</p> <p>Median PCDD/Fs</p> <p>Breast-fed boys: 36.6 WHO₁₉₉₈-TEQ ng/kg fat</p> <p>Breast-fed girl: 36 WHO₁₉₉₈-TEQ ng/kg fat</p> <p>Median DL-PCBs</p> <p>Breast-fed boys: 28.8 TEQ ng/kg fat</p> <p>Breast-fed girls: 28.8 TEQ ng/kg fat</p>	<p>Human (M+F)</p> <p>Dutch PCB/dioxin cohort (Rotterdam, The Netherlands)</p> <p>Vreugdenhil et al. (2002)</p>

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

PCDD/Fs/ DL-PCBs	<p>Increased exposure to DL-compounds was associated with endometriosis in a case control women.</p> <p>Age adjusted OR = 2.44 for patients with low concentrations and group with high concentrations of DL-compounds OR (for moderate and severe endometriosis) =3.0</p>	<p>Measurement of exposure:</p> <p>CALUX determined BEQ levels</p> <p>Controls: 19.4 pg BEQs g/fat (in blood plasma)</p> <p>Endometriosis: 21.2 pg BEQ g/fat (in blood plasma)</p> <p>Duration: n/a</p>	<p>Human (F)</p> <p>(Belgium, Leuven)</p> <p>Simsa et al. (2010)</p>
	<p>DL-PCB and PCDD/Fs were positively correlated with free T4 hormone.</p>	<p>Measurement of exposure:</p> <p>CALUX determined BEQ levels</p> <p>Mean PCDD/Fs: 108 pg BEQ/g fat (blood)</p> <p>Mean PCBs: 32.1 BEQ/g fat (blood)</p>	<p>Human (M+F)</p> <p>Flemish Environment and Health Study (FLEHS II)</p> <p>Croes et al. (2014)</p>
	<p>ORs for deep infiltrating endometriosis (DIE) and ovarian endometrioma (OvE):</p> <p>DIE vs controls = 1.82</p>	<p>Measurement of exposure:</p> <p>17 PCDD/Fs 12 DL-PCBs</p>	<p>Human (F)</p> <p>France</p> <p>Ploteau et al. (2017)</p>

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

PCDD/Fs and/or DL-PCBs	<p>DIE + OvE vs controls = 2.86 DIE only vs controls = 1.39</p>	<p>(Median) Controls: 9.88 pg WHO₂₀₀₅- TEQ/g fat (adipose tissue)</p> <p>Median (DIE): 8.94 pg WHO₂₀₀₅- TEQ/g fat (adipose tissue)</p> <p>Median (DIE+OvE): 14.36 pg WHO₂₀₀₅- TEQ/g fat (adipose tissue)</p>		
	<p>Significantly increased risk of deep endometriotic (adenomyotic) nodules (DEN) (OR= 3.3) for an increment of 10 pg in total TEQ levels/g fat.</p> <p>A marginal significant increased risk found for peritoneal endometriosis (PEND) (OR=1.9) for total TEQ levels and for PCDD/Fs alone (OR=3.2)</p>	<p>Measurement of exposure: 17 PCDD/Fs 12 DL-PCB</p> <p>PCDD/F-TEQs in blood: Controls: 15.5 pg WHO₁₉₉₈- TEQ/g fat (blood)</p> <p>PEND: 20.9 pg WHO₁₉₉₈- TEQ/g fat (blood)</p>	Human (F)	Belgium Heilier et al. (2005)

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

PCDD/Fs /DL-PCBs		<p>DEN: 26 pg WHO₁₉₉₈-TEQ/g fat (blood)</p> <p>DL-PCBs-TEQs</p> <p>Control: 8.5 pg WHO₁₉₉₈-TEQ/g fat (blood)</p> <p>PEND: 11 pg WHO₁₉₉₈-TEQ/g fat (blood)</p> <p>DEN: 12.4 pg WHO₁₉₉₈- TEQ/g fat</p>		
	<p>Placental dioxin levels were higher in women (age ≥ 19 years) with irregular menstrual cycles compared to women (≤ 18 years) with regular menstrual cycle at 18 years old.</p> <p>Placental DL-PCB-TEQ level was higher in women with menstrual cycles longer than 33 days vs. less than 33 days (p=0.006).</p>	<p>Measurement of exposure:</p> <p>17 PCDD/Fs 12 DL-PCBs</p> <p>Mean PCDD/F-TEQ (placenta): 10.7 pg WHO-TEQ/g fat</p> <p>Mean DL-PCB-TEQs (placenta): 2.92 WHO-TEQ/g fat</p>	Human (F)	<p>Taiwan, Central Taiwan, Taichung</p> <p>Chao et al. (2007)</p>

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

PCDD/Fs /DL-PCBs		Mean Total TEQs (placenta): 13.6 pg WHO-TEQ/g fat		
	Positive associations between total TEQs (PCDD/Fs and DL-PCBs) and T3 and thyroxine binding globulin (TBG) in female newborns who were exposed in utero.	Measurement of exposure: 17 PCDD/Fs 12 DL-PCBs Mean PCDD/Fs and DL-PCBs TEQs: 16.2 pg WHO ₁₉₉₈ -TEQ/g fat (placenta)	Human (F)	Part of a prospective study of dioxins/PCBs for the general population (Taiwan) Wang et al. (2005)
	Significant interactions between sex and exposure, increased feminine behaviour was observed in boys (O= 3.24, whereas girls had decreased feminine behaviour (B=-3.59 when exposed to increases sum of PCDD/Fs and DL-PCB in maternal milk.	Measurement of exposure: 17 PCDD/Fs 12 DL-PCBs 21.5 pg WHO ₂₀₀₅ -TEQ/g fat (maternal blood): 20.5 pg WHO ₂₀₀₅ -TEQ/g fat (milk)	Human (M+F)	A follow up study of the Duisburg birth Cohort Winneke et al. (2014)
Carcinogenicity				
			Human	

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

PCDD/Fs/ DL-PCBs	<p>Total PCDFs were associated with a 3.5-fold increased risk for NHL in the highest quartile compared to lowest quartile and a significant trend across quartiles was observed (P=0.006).</p> <p>PCB congeners: PCB-156, PCB-180 and PCB-194 were also associated with increased risk of NHL ranging from 2.7 to 3.5-fold in the highest quartile compared to the lowest quartile.</p>	<p>Measurement of exposure:</p> <p>17 PCDD/Fs 4 DL-PCBs (-77, -81, -126, -169)</p> <p>Levels divided into quartiles:</p> <p>Total PCDFs pg WHO₁₉₉₈-TEQ/fat (blood): ≤2.94 >2.94-4.75 >4.75-6.89 >6.89</p> <p>Total PCBs pg WHO₁₉₉₈-TEQ/fat (blood): ≤6.40 >6.40-8.69 >8.69-13.17 >13.17</p>	Human (M+F)	<p>(USA - Iowa, Los Angeles County, metropolitan areas of Detroit and Seattle)</p> <p>De Roos et al. (2005)</p>
	Immunotoxicity			
			Human	
	<p>DL-PCBs were positively associated with the development of animal allergy (p=0.02, OR=1.46).</p>	<p>Measurement of exposure:</p>	Human (M+F)	<p>Flemish Environment and Health study (FLEHS II)</p> <p>Croes et al. (2014)</p>

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

	<p>Higher levels of PCDD/Fs were associated with a higher risk for development of animal allergy (p=0.03, OR=1.60) and asthma (p=0.004, OR = 1.42).</p>	<p>CALUX determined BEQ levels</p> <p>Mean PCDD/Fs: 108 pg BEQ/g fat (blood)</p> <p>Mean DL-PCBs: 32.1 pg BEQ/g fat (blood)</p>		
<p>PCDD/Fs/ DL-PCBs</p>	<p>Association found between exposure to PCDD/Fs and DL-PCBs in mothers breast milk and an increased ratio of CD4/CD8 cells, as well as an increased percentage of CD3 cells in children.</p>	<p>Measurement of exposure:</p> <p>17 PCDD/Fs 3 DL-PCBs</p> <p>Median: 23 pg WHO₁₉₉₈-TEQ/g fat (human milk)</p>	<p>Human (M+F)</p>	<p>The CONTAM panel concluded the clinical relevance of this finding to be unclear.</p> <p>Nagayama et al. (2007b)</p>
	<p>Negative effect on polymorphic neutrophils found in adolescents with higher current DL-PCB levels (p=0.021). In the neonatal period this negative effect was seen with prenatal PCDD/F exposure.</p>	<p>Measurement of exposure:</p> <p>17 PCDD/Fs 3 DL-PCBs (-77, -126, -169)</p> <p>Mean prenatal exposure: 32.6 pg I-TEQ/g fat</p> <p>Mean current DL-PCB exposure:</p>	<p>Human (M+F)</p>	<p>Amsterdam/Zaandam Cohort (The Netherlands)</p> <p>Leijs et al. (2009)</p>

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

		2.2 pg WHO ₂₀₀₅ -TEQ/g fat (serum)		
Neurotoxicity				
Human				
PCDD/Fs/ DL-PCBs	Boys and girls aged 3 years who had mothers with high maternal dietary exposures of PCDD/Fs and DL-PCBs was associated with higher odds of incomplete grammar (OR =1.1) in boys and severe language delay (OR=2.9) in girls.	Measurement of exposure: 17 PCDD/Fs 12 DL-PCBs High maternal dietary exposure: >14 pg WHO ₂₀₀₅ -TEQ/kg bw per week Low maternal dietary exposure: ≤14 pg WHO ₂₀₀₅ -TEQ/kg bw per week	Human (M+F)	Norwegian Mother and Child Cohort study (MoBa) Cohort (Norway) Caspersen et al. (2016)
Reproductive toxicity				
Human				
PCDD/Fs, DL-PCBs and NDL-PCBs	Boys born to mothers exposed to TCDD had an association with maternal sum PCBs and earlier onset of genitalia stage	Measurement of exposure: 17 PCDD/Fs	Human (M+F)	The Russian Children's Study (Humblet et al. (2011))

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

PCDD/Fs, DL-PCBs and NDL-PCBs	<p>2 in offspring at age 11 to 12 years.</p> <p>Boys breast fed for >6 months there was a dose related delay in pubertal onset assessed by genital staging 2 and increasing quartiles of maternal total</p>	<p>10 DL-PCBs (-77, -81, -126, -169, -105, -118, -156, -157, -167, -189) NDL-PCBS</p> <p>Median Maternal Total TEQ:</p> <p>25 (pg WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/g fat (blood))</p> <p>Duration: 3 years</p>		
PeCDF and HxCDF	Tooth development			
			Human	
	<p>Parents reported bearing teeth during the neonatal period in 9.6% (7/73) of children in the exposed group and none in the control group.</p> <p>The percentages of children with congenitally missing tooth germ and rotated teeth were significantly increased in the exposed group (P=<0.05).</p> <p>The developmental defects combined (fusion,</p>	<p>Measurement of exposure: 2,3,4,7,8-PeCDF, 1,2,3,4,7,8-HxCDF</p> <p>Control: 12 pg TEQ/g fat (blood)</p> <p>Mean (PeCDFs and HxCDF) - low cases: 233 pg TEQ/g fat (blood)</p> <p>Mean (PeCDFs, HxCDF) - high cases:</p>	Human (M+F)	<p>Yucheng cohort (Taiwan, Qigu District, Yucheng)</p> <p>Wang et al. (2003)</p>

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

PeCDF and HxCDF	microdontia, pigmentation, enamel hypoplasia, and impaction) increased with exposure (P=0.01).	1780 pg TEQ/g fat (blood)		
Carcinogenicity				
			Human	
DL-PCBs	Sufficient evidence in humans for carcinogenicity of PCB-126 (Group 1 carcinogen).		Human	Based on data from experimental animals, epidemiological studies, and from the common mechanism of action. IARC, 2012

- (F) Female; (i.p) intraperitoneal; (LOAEL) lowest observed adverse effect level; (M) Male; (NOAEL) no observed adverse effect level; (POD) point of departure; (s.c.) subcutaneous.

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

5. In the [EFSA opinion](#) the term PCDD/Fs is used to refer to dioxins; PCDDs and PCDFs (EFSA, 2018).
6. Both animals and epidemiological studies reviewed by the CONTAM panel have reported dioxin to have adverse acute and chronic health effects in in males and females. For animal studies the CONTAM panel only considered studies that were not evaluated by the Scientific Committee on Food (SCF) in 2001 and that could potentially show effects at lower body burdens than that used to set the TWI (LOAEL of 40 ng/kg bw) in their assessment. With regards to human studies the CONTAM panel considered studies which analysed tissues (e.g. blood, human milk, adipose tissue) of subjects under study for TCDD or any other congener dominating the toxic equivalents (TEQ). For example due to a contamination incident, (ii) the 17 PCDD/Fs and 12 DL-PCBs, (iii) the 17 PCDD/Fs and 4 non-ortho DL-PCBs, (iv) the 17 PCDD/Fs and 3 non-ortho DL-PCBs (including PCB-126), or (v) the total TEQs (or BEQs analysed by, e.g. CALUX).
7. The toxicity and epidemiological data discussed below are derived from studies in the EFSA opinion that reported adverse health effects and were considered suitable for use in the risk assessment for human health (CONTAM, 2018). The epidemiological studies have been conducted in subjects/cohorts exposed to TCDD, PCDD/Fs and DL-PCBs at different life stages under different exposure conditions, e.g. from industrial accidents such as the Seveso Cohort or contamination incidents (Yusho or Yucheng Cohorts), from occupational exposure or from background levels mainly via the diet in the general population (Duisburg Cohort, Russian Children's study and others). More information on these cohorts is provided in Section 3.1.4 of the Opinion.

TCDD toxicity in humans

Reproductive toxicity

Environmental exposure (via industrial accident):

8. Adverse effects of females in the SWHS exposed to TCDD in an industrial accident (i.e. explosion) at a mean age of 17 years had median levels of 13.4 pg/g fat (blood), which were extrapolated from levels measured near to the explosion to the time of conception attempt. Each 10-fold increase in TCDD concentration was associated with a 25% increased time to pregnancy and a doubling in odds of infertility, defined as conception \geq 12 months of trying (Eskenazi et al., 2010). In the Seveso study a lower male to female sex ratio in births occurred with mothers and fathers that were exposed to TCDD in an industrial accident between the ages of 3 and 45; mother and fathers had median levels of 62.75 and 96.5 pg/g fat (blood) respectively (Mocarelli et al., 2000).
9. TCDD exposure in males in the Seveso Cohort (aged 1-9 years at the time of explosion in 1976) with median TCDD levels of 210 pg/g fat (blood) was

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

associated with reduced sperm concentration, progressive motility and motile sperm count (Mocarelli et al., 2008). Other reproductive effects were observed in breastfed males who were born to and breastfed by mothers with median TCDD levels of 19 pg/g fat (blood) at the time of conception. These males had impaired semen quality consisting of lower sperm concentration, total sperm count, progressive motility and total motile count (Mocarelli et al., 2011).

Endocrine mediated effects

Environmental exposure (via industrial accident):

10. Additional adverse effects TCDD has been associated with in women in the SWHS, include endocrine mediated effects such as lengthening of the menstrual cycle and reduction in the odds of scanty menstrual flow. These effects occurred in those (aged ≤ 30 years of age at time of explosion) with median plasma levels of 67.5 pg/g fat (blood). It is important to note that in this study co-exposure to other dioxins and DL-PBCs were not accounted for (Eskenazi et al., 2002).
11. A recent case-control study in Spain reported higher concentrations of dioxins and PCBs in the adipose tissue of deep infiltrating endometriosis (DIE) cases than controls. The cases were aged 32 years on average and had median TCDD levels of 0.70 pg/g fat in adipose tissue. The source of exposure of the women was solely background. They had a mixed diet which included meat and fish and had no occupational exposure. In this study other congeners measured included PCDD/Fs and DL-PCBs (Martinez-Zamora et al. 2015).
12. Further to this, children (male and female) of mothers in the Seveso Cohort who were highly exposed to TCDD via an industrial accident had levels of neonatal blood- thyroid stimulating hormone (b-TSH) hormone of ≥ 5 $\mu\text{U/mL}$. The proportion of children with b-TSH ≥ 5 $\mu\text{U/mL}$ was 16.1% in Zone A (very high contamination), 4.9% in Zone B (high contamination) and 2.8% in (Zone R). Additionally, the levels of TSH decreased with order of siblings in Zone A and B, but not in Zone R. Mothers in Zone A had median TCDD levels of 447 pg/g fat (blood), measured 1-2 years after the accident. Newborn infants with b-TSH ≥ 5 $\mu\text{U/mL}$ had median TCDD levels of 39 pg/g fat (blood). Other exposures measured in this cohort were PCDD/Fs and DL-PCBs (Baccarelli et al., 2008).

Carcinogenicity

Occupational exposure:

13. Further effects of TCDD exposure in humans is carcinogenicity. As outlined in Annex 5 the committee on carcinogenicity (COC) reviewed TCDD in 1998, following the publication of the IARC monograph which concluded that TCDD

should be considered as a definite human carcinogen. The COC agreed that the information from the most heavily occupationally exposed cohorts suggested that there was, at most, only a weak carcinogenic effect in these individuals. It therefore concluded that there were insufficient epidemiological and toxicological data on TCDD to conclude a causal link with cancer in humans, but it would be prudent to consider TCDD as a “probable weak human carcinogen” (COT, 2001). IARC later classified TCDD as a group 1 carcinogen in 2012 (IARC, 2012).

14. Men in the USA occupationally exposed to TCDD had a positive trend between increasing cumulative TCDD exposure and risk of cancer mortality. Estimated serum TCDD levels at the end of the exposure period (1 year on average for Ranch Hand workers and a mean of 3 years for NIOSH workers) was 1,589 pg/g. Using a model based on the log of cumulative serum level lagged 15 years, lifetime excess risk (up to age 75 years), an excess lifetime risk of dying of cancer at an intake of 1 pg/g bw/day over 75 years was estimated to be 0.05-0.9%, above a background lifetime risk of cancer death of 12.4% (Steenland et al., 2001).
15. Males who were occupationally exposed and had mean TCDD levels of 101.3 pg/g fat (blood) had an increased SMR total cancer mortality of 1.41 (95% CI, 1.17-1.68) (Becher et al., 1998). The relative risk ratio (RR) for all cancers, rectal cancer, lung cancer in men part of the Seveso study were 1.3 (95% CI, 1.0-1.7), 2.4 (95% CI 1.2-4.6) and 1.3 (95%CI, 1.0-1.7) respectively in Zone A males with median TCDD levels of 447 pg/g fat (blood) between 1979-77 and 73.7 pg/g fat (blood) between 1993-94. As for Zone B males median TCDD levels were 94 pg/g fat (blood) between 1976-77 and 12.4 pg/g fat (blood) between 1993-94 (Bertazzi et al., 2001).
16. Additionally, male workers dermally exposed to TCDD had a SMR of 1.13 for all cancer. A cumulative exposure score of 20,000 (the cut-off between septiles 6 and 7) would correspond to estimated exposure of 38,000 pg/g-years (Steenland et al., 1999). Other cancers that occurred in male workers exposed to TCDD include the following: respiratory cancer, oesophageal cancer and rectum cancer with SMRs of 1.64 (95% CI 1.32-2.03), 2.56 (95% CI 1.27-4.57) and 1.96 (95% CI, 0.98-3.51) respectively. Median TCDD levels were 77 pg/g fat (Manuwald et al., 2012).
17. Both males and females in the Seveso study with occupational TCDD exposure had an RR of 1.7 (95% CI 1.2-2.5) for lymphohaematopoietic neoplasms, whereas other cancers observed were Hodgkin’s disease, with a RR of 4.9 (95% CI, 1.5–16.4), in the first 10-year observation period. Non-myeloid leukaemia and myeloid leukaemia were observed after 15 years and had RR of 2.8 (95% CI, 1.1-7.0) and 3.8 (95% CI, 1.2-12.5). In this cohort median blood TCDD levels in residents in Zone A were 447 pg/g fat between 1979-77 and 73.7 pg/g fat between 1993-94. As for those in Zone B median

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

TCDD levels in blood were 94 pg/g fat between 1976-77 and 12.4 pg/g fat between 1993-94 (Bertazzi et al., 2001).

18. For non-hodgkin's lymphoma (NHL), leukaemia and soft tissue sarcoma the standardised mortality ratio (SMR) amongst workers with occupational TCDD exposure was reported to be 1.3 (95% CI, 0.6-2.5), 1.9 (95% CI, 1.1-3.2), 4.1 (95% CI, 1.1-10.5) respectively, although TCDD blood levels in exposed workers were 15.9 pg/g fat (Collins et al., 2009a).

Environmental exposure (via industrial accident):

19. Males and females (of various ages) apart of the Seveso Cohort accidentally exposed to TCDD also experienced an increased risk of lymphatic and haematological cancers in those exposed to TCDD. Relative risk ratios of those exposed in Zones A and B were reported to be 2.23 (95% CI, 1.00-4.97) and 1.59 (95% CI, 1.09-2.33) respectively by Consonni et al., 2008. However, Pesatori et al., 2009 reported RRs of those exposed in Zone A and B as 1.39 (95% CI, 0.52-3.71) and 1.56 (95% CI, 1.07-2.27) respectively. The median TCDD blood levels of those in Zone A were 447 pg/g fat between 1976-1977 and decreased to 73.3 pg/g fat between 1992-1996. In Zone B, median TCDD blood levels were 94 pg/g fat between 1976-1977 and 12.4 pg/g between 1992-1996.
20. Women exposed to TCDD in Zone A of Seveso had an increased risk of breast cancer 15 years after the incident, with a RR of 2.57 (95% CI, 1.07-6.20). The median blood TCDD levels between 1976-1977 and 1992-1996 were the same those mentioned above (Pesatori et al., 2009). Additionally, women in the SWHS aged between 20 and ≥ 50 years accidentally exposed to TCDD via explosion had median blood TCDD levels of 71.8 pg/g fat and an increased hazard ratio (HR) for breast cancer of 2.1 (95% CI, 1.0-4.6) (Warner et al., 2002). However, for all cancers combined the adjusted HR was 1.8 (95% CI 1.29–2.52) in women (Warner et al., 2011). Ultimately female workers exposed to dioxin in a chemical plant showed an increased risk of breast cancer, with an SMR of 1.86 (95% CI, 1.12-2.91) and median TCDD levels of 77 pg/g fat (Manuwald et al., 2012).

Immunotoxicity and neurotoxicity

Environmental exposure (via industrial accident):

21. Other possible adverse effects of TCDD exposure include immunotoxicity and neurotoxicity. In the Seveso study, subjects exposed to TCDD via an industrial accident had lower plasma IgG levels compared to subjects in the reference area when assessed 20 years after the accident. Blood levels of TCDD ranged between 3.5 and 90 pg/g fat (Baccarelli et al., 2004).

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

Background exposure (via diet):

22. As for neurotoxicity, this occurred in children born to mothers in the Danish National Birth Cohort study. Out of six infant developmental milestones, children experienced a two-fold increased risk of being unable to perform one developmental milestone ("cannot crawl"). Mothers of these children who were unable to perform this developmental milestone had CALUX determined bioanalytical equivalent (BEQ) maternal blood levels above the median (>38 pg CALUX-TEQ/g lipid), compared to children whose mother had exposure below the median. In this study the mid-pregnancy diet of mothers was assessed in order to identify dietary predictors of plasma dioxin-like activity. It was concluded that high fat intake may lead to increased plasma dioxin-like activity and thereby increased in utero exposure and the aforementioned effects relating to early infant development (Halldorsson et al., 2009).

Tooth development

Environmental exposure (via industrial accident):

23. Final chronic effects of accidental industrial TCDD exposure includes tooth development which occurred in both sexes in the Seveso Cohort, with median TCDD levels shortly after the accident of 476 pg/g fat (blood). When studied 25 years later, enamel defects were apparent in 24% of all subjects, with the majority of subjects (93%) being <5 years old at the time of the accident. Additionally, there was a higher prevalence of tooth defects in children <5 years old (OR = 2.4) (95% CI, 1.3-4.5) in contaminated areas compared to non-contaminated areas. Hypodontia (missing teeth) was also occurred where lateral incisors or second premolars were missing in 12.5% of subjects from zone ABR (Alaluusua et al., 2004).

TCDD and PCDD/F toxicity in humans

Carcinogenicity

Occupational exposure:

24. PCDD/Fs have been classed as Group 1 carcinogen (IARC, 2012). Males and females who were former herbicide and insecticide workers had an all cancer SMR of 1.41 (95% CI, 1.17-1.68), with TCDD showing a significant trend in SMR with increasing cumulative PCDD/Fs. Mean TCDD blood levels of 108 and 110.5 ng/kg fat were measured in males and females respectively. However, PCDF blood levels of 142 and 62.7 ng TEQO/kg fat were measured in males and females respectively (Flesch-Janys et al., 1998).

Dioxin and DL-PCB toxicity in humans

25. In order to assess and compare the toxicity of a mixture of congeners analysed in complex samples, the CONTAM Panel applied the concept of toxic equivalents (TEQs) based on different toxicity equivalency factors (TEFs) for the toxic congeners. It should be noted that the TEFs are order of magnitude estimates of the toxicity of TCDD, which adds uncertainty to the risk assessment.
26. In the European legislation, all regulatory levels for PCDD/Fs and DL-PCBs in food are presently expressed as TEQs using the WHO₂₀₀₅-TEFs proposed by the World Health Organization (WHO) in 2005 (van den Berg et al., 2006). As for older data generated before 2005 are generally reported as WHO₁₉₉₈-TEQs (van den Berg et al., 1998), I-TEQs (NATO/CCMS, 1988). EFSA (2010a) estimated a decrease by 14% following the switch from WHO₁₉₉₈-TEFs to WHO₂₀₀₅-TEFs, which is within the interval of 10–25%, estimated by van den Berg et al. (2006).

Reproductive toxicity

Background exposure (via diet):

27. Prenatal exposure to PCDD/Fs and DL-PCBs via maternal diet was associated with reproductive effects in male and female children in the birth cohort BraMat; a sub-cohort of the Norwegian Mother and Child Cohort Study (MoBa). The children's mothers had an estimated median maternal dietary intake of 0.58 and 0.59 pg WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/kg bw/day. Seafood was determined to be a major source of PCDD/Fs and DL-PCBs exposure. Additionally, cereals, eggs and milk also contributed to exposure. Children of these mothers who were aged between 1 and 4 years had increased risk of wheeze and upper respiratory infection as well reduced antibody response to measles vaccination (Stolevik et al., 2011, 2013).

Environmental exposure (via contamination):

28. Male children of the Russian Children's Study who were exposed to dioxins via environmental contamination from previous manufacture of chemical warfare agents, chlorine-containing industrial and agricultural chemicals, displayed further reproductive effects such as changes in time of pubertal onset and sexual maturity. These effects occurred between the ages of 8 and 18 years with median blood levels of 21.1 pg WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/g fat (Burns et al., 2016).
29. Male children between the ages of 8 and 12 in the Russian Children's study also showed early pubertal onset (i.e. genitalia in stage 2 or higher or testicular volume >3mL on the puberty scale) with mean PCDD, PCDF and

PCB blood levels of 10.6, 7 and 8.1 pg WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/g fat (Korrick et al., 2011). Alternatively, in the subgroup of male infants that were breast fed by their mothers for at least 6 months, with a median maternal blood sum of PCDD/Fs and DL-PCBs of 25 pg WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/g fat had a delay in pubertal onset assessed by genital staging 2, compared those that were breast-fed less (Humblet et al., 2011).

30. Other reproductive effects observed in the Russian Children's Study was a reduction in semen parameters (sperm concentration, sperm count and motile sperm count) in men aged 18-19 years with median PCDD blood levels of 8.7 pg WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/g fat respectively (Minguez-Alarcón et al., 2017). Further effects observed in males aged 14-19 years was a negative trend in current median PCDD/Fs and DL-PCBs exposure (2.3 and 1.5 pg WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/g blood fat respectively) and occurrence of first ejaculation (Leijs et al., 2008).
31. A subset (n=355) of boys in the Russian Children's Study had high co-exposure indicated by high concentrations of organochlorine pesticides: hexachlorobenzene (HCB), beta-hexachlorocyclohexane (β -HCH) and dichlorodiphenyldichloroethylene (DDE). HCB was also associated with later pubertal onset whereas HCB and β -HCH was associated with later sexual maturity (Lam et al., 2014, 2015). The correlation between Spearman rank organochlorine pesticides and total TEQ was high (0.72, β -HCH) to moderate (0.51, DDE and 0.53, HCB). The correlations between serum PCBs and organochlorine pesticides were in similar range (0.71-0.49), making it difficult to create categories of high vs low co-exposure to multiple organochlorine compounds. However, as adjustment for these compounds was possible and these organochlorine pesticides were not strongly associated with semen quality, uncertainty due to such co-exposure is considered low, but if present it would lead to overestimation of the risk (CONTAM, 2018).
32. In the Flemish Environment and Health Study (FLEHS II) subjects were exposed to environmental pollution pressure in selected hotspot areas, signs of hindered sexual development was noted in females aged between 13 and 17 years who experienced negatively correlated breast development with estimated median DL-PCB levels of 32.1 pg BEQ/g fat (Croes et al., 2014).
33. Final reproductive effects occurring in both sexes were increases in birth weight. Perinatal environmental exposure to the bioanalytical equivalent of dioxin was associated with increased growth between the ages of 0 and 24 months across three different cohorts. Mean exposure via breast milk was 7.9 and 15.5 pg BEQ/g fat in the HUMIS and Slovak PCB cohorts, whereas mean exposure via cord blood was 31.2 pg BEQ/g fat in the FLEHS I cohort (Iszatt et al., 2016).

Accidental exposure (via diet):

34. Alternatively, an inverse association was identified between birth weight of male infants and PCDD/F and PCB exposure. Mothers of the Yusho Cohort

who were accidental exposed to rice oil contaminated with dioxins between the ages of 0-35 years had mean maternal blood exposures of PCDD, PCDF and PCB of 16.01, 41.98 and 10.93 pg TEQ/g fat respectively. These levels were higher than the general population evident in those with a lower birth weight (Tsukimori et al., 2012).

Endocrine mediated effects

Environmental exposure:

35. Additional adverse effects associated with environmental exposure to PCDD/Fs and DL-PCBs is endocrine mediated effects. Females exposed to dioxin-like compounds with blood levels of 21.2 pg BEQ/g fat displayed an increased risk of endometriosis compared to controls (Simsa et al., 2010). In a later study, females demonstrated increased risk for deep infiltrating endometriosis (DIE) and ovarian endometrioma (OvE) compared to controls. Individuals with increased risk of DIE had PCDD/F blood levels of 8.94 pg WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/g fat, as for risk of DIE occurring concurrently with OvE PCDD/F blood levels were 14.36 pg WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/g fat (Ploteau et al., 2017).
36. Females environmentally exposed to dioxin and DL-PCBs also had an increased risk of other types of endometriosis such as peritoneal endometriosis (PEND) and deep endometriotic nodules (DEN) when compared to controls. Those with increased risk of PEND has PCDD/F and DL-PCB blood levels of 20.9 and 11 pg WHO₁₉₉₈-TEQ/g fat. Whereas those with increased risk of DEN had PCDD/F and DL-PCBs blood levels of 26 and 12.4 pg WHO₁₉₉₈-TEQ/g fat respectively (Heilier et al., 2005).
37. Additional endocrine effects affecting females ≥ 19 years of age with irregular menstrual cycles were found to have, higher placental dioxin levels compared to females with regular menstrual cycle at ≤ 18 years old. Women environmentally exposed to PCDD/F and DL-PCBs with irregular menstrual cycles had mean placental PCDD/F and DL-PCBs levels of 10.7 and 2.92 pg WHO-TEQ/g fat respectively (Chao et al., 2007).
38. Endocrine mediated effects also occurred in male and female adolescents in FLEHS II, where subjects were environmentally exposed to dioxin and DL-PCBs via industrial hotspot areas. A positive correlation with PCDD/Fs and DL-PCBs with free T4 hormone was identified. Blood levels of PCDD/Fs and DL-PCBs were 108 and 32.1 pg BEQ/g fat respectively (Croes et al., 2014). In a further prospective study with pregnant mothers from the general population, positive associations between T3 and thyroxine binding globulin (TBG) were identified in female new-borns (<3 months of age) that had transplacental exposure to mean PCDD/Fs and DL-PCBs levels of 16.2 pg WHO₁₉₉₈-TEQ/g fat (Wang et al., 2005).

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

39. In the Dutch PCB/dioxin cohort with mothers exposed to environmental levels of PCBs and dioxins, an association with higher exposure to PCDD/Fs in maternal milk and higher scores on the feminine subscale of the Pre-School Activity Inventory (PSAI) was identified. This indicated feminised play behaviour amongst male and female children. On the contrary, higher exposure to DL-PCBs was associated with masculine play behaviour. Estimated mean PCDD/F exposure levels in breast-fed boys and girls were 36.6 and 36 ng TEQ /kg fat respectively. Whereas the estimated median of the sum of planar and mono-PBC levels in breast-fed boys and girls was 28.8 ng WHO₁₉₉₈-TEQ /kg fat (Vreugdenhil et al., 2002).
40. In the follow up study of Duisburg birth cohort findings of increased feminine behaviour in boys was also reported but decreased feminine behaviour in girls exposed to a mean sum of PCDD/Fs and DL-PLBs in breast milk at 21.5 pg WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/g fat was apparent (Winneke et al., 2014). The CONTAM determined that there was insufficient information about co-exposure to determine confounding variables.

Carcinogenicity

Environmental exposure:

41. PCB-126 is classified as a group 1 carcinogen, with sufficient evidence in humans (IARC, 2012).
42. In a population-based case control study blood levels of PCDFs were also found to be associated with a 3.5-fold increased risk of NHL in those with the highest quartile (>6.89 pg WHO₁₉₉₈-TEQ/fat) exposure compared to the lowest quartile. PCBs were also associated with an increased risk of NHL ranging between 2.7 to 3.5-fold in the highest quartile exposure group (>13.7 pg WHO₁₉₉₈-TEQ/fat) (De Roos et al., 2005).

Immunotoxicity

Occupational exposure:

43. Other adverse effects of PCDD/Fs and PCBs in males and females include immunotoxicity. In a cross-sectional study with male and female subjects with background exposure to dioxin PCDD/Fs and PCBs had an inverse relationship with rhinitis and atopic dermatitis, with a 50th percentile of 16 pg WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/g fat in the blood (Nakamoto et al., 2013).

Environmental exposure:

44. Additionally, in the Hokkaido Study on Environment and Children's Health, prenatal exposure to environmental levels of PCDD/Fs increased risk of otitis media in young male infants where PCDDs and PCDFs were present in blood at 6.92 and 2.38 pg WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/g fat respectively. In this study the frequency of fish and meat consumption during pregnancy (the main sources

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

of exposure to dioxins in Japan) was found to not be related to total dioxin TEQs as adjustments made for the frequency of fish and meat intake did not change the relationships in this study (Miyashita et al., 2011).

Environmental exposure (via contamination):

45. Risk of development of animal allergies in male and female adolescents in the FLEHS II with environmental exposure from industrial hotspots were positively associated with DL-PBCs and PCDD/Fs with blood levels of 32.1 and 108 pg BEQ/g fat respectively (Croes et al., 2014). Further immune-related effects were identified amongst adolescents in the Amsterdam/Zaandam Cohort that were exposed to background levels of PCDD/Fs and DL-PCBs. These adolescents had higher current DL-PCBs blood levels of 2.2 pg WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/g fat, and negative effects on polymorphic neutrophils were observed (Leijds et al., 2009).
46. Further associations were identified by Nagayama et al., 2007b, where median exposure to PCDD/Fs and DL-PCBs at 23 pg WHO₁₉₉₈-TEQ/g fat (breast milk), increased ratio of CD4/CD8 cells and percentage of CD3 cells in male and female infants. Prenatal PCDD/F exposure of 32.6 pg I-TEQ/g fat (blood) was also associated with occurrence of this effect during the neonatal period (Leijds et al., 2009).

Neurotoxicity

Background exposure (via diet):

47. The CONTAM panel also addressed neurotoxicity associated with PCDD/F and DL-PCB exposure (CONTAM, 2018). Male and female children aged 3 years whose mothers in the MoBa cohort had high maternal dietary exposure to PCDD/Fs and DL-PCBs (i.e >14 pg WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/kg bw) were associated with high odds of incomplete grammar in boys and language delay in girls which was assessed using grammar ratings and the Ages and Stages Questionnaire. In the majority of Norwegian pregnant women participating in this cohort oily fish was the main source of dioxin and PCB exposure (Caspersen et al., 2016a).

Tooth development

Accidental exposure (via diet):

48. Final adverse effects of dioxins in humans was on tooth development, which was observed in the Yucheng cohort, where ingestion of rice oil used for cooking was contaminated with dioxins. Parents reported that 9.6% of children (with a mean age of 9 years at the outcome assessment) had bearing teeth during the neonatal period. The exposed group also had higher percentages of congenitally missing tooth germ. Overall, developmental tooth defects increased with exposure compared to the control group. The exposure group had mean PeCDF and HxCDF levels of 233 and 1780 pg TEQ/g fat for

low and high cases respectively, whereas the control group had a level of 12 pg TEQ/g fat (Wang et al., 2003).

TCDD toxicity in animals

Systemic toxicity

49. Systemic effects of TCDD observed in animal studies consisted of body weight reductions observed in female Sprague Dawley rats orally administered with TCDD at 100 ng/kg per day although the NOAEL body burden of 85 ng/kg bw/day was based on hepatopathy (NTP, 2006). When calculating the NOAEL body burden, it was assumed the liver accounted for 4.5% of body weight and adipose tissue accounted for 8%, which gives an estimate of $681 + 0.045 + 505 + 0.08 = 71$ ng/kg bw. A dose level of 2.1 ng/kg bw, the fraction residing in the liver and adipose tissue after repeated exposure in the rat is given by: fractional body burden = $1.9349 \ln(2.1) + 82.39$, which gives 83.8%. The estimate of the body burden corresponding at the 105 week NOAEL of 2.1 ng/kg bw per day was therefore $71/0.84 = 85$ ng/kg bw (CONTAM, 2018).
50. In a later study reduced body weight gain was observed in female Sprague Dawley rats receiving 100 ng/kg bw per/day, but the NOAEL body burden of 789 ng/kg bw was based on bile duct hyperplasia (Harrill et al., 2016). The NOAEL body burden was calculated by assuming the liver and adipose tissue account for 8 and 4.5% of the body weight which gives an estimate for the body burden of $3.2 \times 0.008 + 10.3 \times 0.045 = 720$ ng/kg bw. Accounting for the fraction residing in the liver and adipose tissues after repeated exposure at a dose level of 71 ng/kg bw gives a fractional burden of $1.9349 \ln(71) + 82.39$, which gives 90.6%. The estimate of the body burden corresponding at the 4-week NOAEL of 71 ng/kg bw per day therefore is $720/0.91 = 789$ ng/kg bw (CONTAM, 2018).
51. TCDD also dose-dependently increased organ-to-body weight % for liver and thymus from as low as 3 ng/kg bw, but decreased spleen-to body weight % at 1000 ng/kg bw/day. The NOAEL body burden of 789 ng/kg bw was based on bile duct hyperplasia and thymus atrophy (Harrill et al., 2016).
52. Other effects of TCDD were dose dependent changes to clinical chemistry and haematological parameters were also observed in female Sprague Dawley rats receiving TCDD between 3 and 100 ng/kg bw per day. The NOAEL body burden of 789 ng/kg bw established was based on bile duct hyperplasia and thymus atrophy (Harrill et al., 2016). Histopathological changes were also evident.

Reproductive toxicity

53. Male and female rats gestationally exposed to a single dose 1 µg/kg of TCDD had abolished gender differences in the anteroventral periventricular nucleus expression of enzyme; glutamic acid decarboxylase 67 (Hays et al., 2002).
54. Reproductive effects observed in male rat (Han Wistar) offspring were abnormal proportion of sperm and around a ~10% decrease in testes weight. Mothers were calculated to have LOAEL body burdens of 42 and 50 ng/kg bw on GD16 and GD21 (Bell et al. 2007c). LOAEL body burdens were calculated after correcting the experimentally determined LOAELs of 35.4 and 42.4 ng/kg bw per day on GD16 and GD21. These body burdens were corrected for the fraction of the body burden residing in the liver and adipose tissue (0.84, as calculated with $y = 1.934\ln(2.4) + 82.39$), which gave subchronic body burdens of $35.4/0.84 = 42.1$ ng/kg bw (GD16), and $42.4/0.84 = 50.4$ ng/kg bw (GD21) (CONTAM, 2018).
55. Further to this, administration of a 400 ng/kg bw TCDD loading dose and weekly TCDD maintenance doses 80 ng/kg bw resulted in reduced ventral prostrate weight in F1 Holtzman rats and decreased male/female ratio in their F2 (Ikeda et al., 2005).
56. Pregnant female Han Wistar rats exposed to 530 ng/kg of TCDD via their diet had decreases in the number of pups born alive on day 1 and the number of pups surviving days 1-4, in addition to decreased body weight in the F1 generation which was also observed at 93 ng/kg/diet. Male rats in the F1 generation also showed delayed balanopreputial separation, LOAEL body burdens of 42 and 50 ng/kg bw on GD15 and GD21 respectively was based on this endpoint (Bell et al., 2007a). The LOAEL body burdens were calculated the same as Bell et al., 2007c).
57. Other effects reported in F1 male generations whose mothers were exposed to TCDD include reduced body weight gain and a 12% reduction in litter size and a slight decrease in testes weight at PND 70 and PND 21 in groups receiving 1000 ng/kg bw. Groups receiving 1000 ng/kg bw of TCDD also had decreases in testes weight at PND70 and PND120 and decreased brain weight at PND120. Whereas decreased liver to body weight ratios were increased across all doses. The NOAEL body burdens of 56.2 and 58.5 ng/kg bw on GD16 and GD12 were based on decreased pup weight from PND1 to PND7 (Bell et al. 2007b). The NOAEL body burden was experimentally determined as 18.8 and 19.6 ng/kg bw, which were based on summation of liver, adipose tissue and fetal deposition. Correcting these body burdens for the fraction of the body burden residing in the liver and adipose tissue ($(0.87, \text{ as calculated from } y = 0.7548\ln(0.05) + 88.77)$), then gives a GD16 body burden of $18.8/0.87 = 21.6$, GD21 body burden of $19.6/0.87 = 22.5$ ng TCDD/kg. Extrapolating the acute exposure to chronic exposure, applying a

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

factor 2.6 (SCF, 2001), then results in an estimated chronic GD16 body burden of $21.6 \times 2.6 = 56.2$ ng/kg bw, and GD21 body burden of $22.5 \times 2.6 = 58.5$ ng/kg bw (CONTAM, 2018).

58. Further discussion of the aforementioned Bell et al studies by the COT can be found in Annex 4 (COT, 2007).
59. Other reproductive toxicities were identified in other species such as ICR mice, male mice given an initial loading dose of 2000 ng/kg bw followed by a weekly maintenance dose of 400 ng/kg bw resulted a lower proportion of male embryos at the two-cell embryo stage, suggesting a diminished ability of Y-bearing sperm to conceive the ova (Ishihara et al., 2010).
60. Pregnant mice encountered embryo loss and had a NOAEL body burden of 9 and 25 ng/kg bw in GD1-3 and GD1-8 respectively (Li et al., 2006). For calculations of the NOAEL body burden it was assumed that the body burden increased linearly with the exposure duration which as 3 days for GD1-3 and 8 days from GD1-8 and absorption fraction of 0.6 was assumed. Additionally, a factor of 2.6 was used to extrapolate a single acute dose to equivalent chronic fetal exposure. Hence, the corresponding chronic body burden ranged from $2 \times 3 \times 0.6 \times 2.6 = 9.4$ ng/kg bw to $2 \times 8 \times 0.6 \times 2.6 = 25$ ng/kg bw at the end of the GD1–3 and GD1–8 exposure period (CONTAM, 2018).

Endocrine mediated effects

61. Endocrine mediated effects observed in female Sprague Dawley rats included decreased T4 levels 14 weeks after receiving TCDD at 22 ng/kg bw/day. The NOAEL body burden for this study was 85 ng/kg bw, although this was based on hepatopathy (NTP, 2006). When calculating the NOAEL body burden, it was assumed the liver accounted for 4.5% of body weight and adipose tissue accounted for 8%, which gives an estimate of $681 + 0.045 \times 505 + 0.08 \times 71 = 71$ ng/kg bw. A dose level of 2.1 ng/kg bw, the fraction residing in the liver and adipose tissue after repeated exposure in the rat is given by: fractional body burden = $1.934 \times \ln(2.1) + 82.39$, which gives 83.8%. The estimate of the body burden corresponding at the 105 week NOAEL of 2.1 ng/kg bw per day was therefore $71/0.84 = 85$ ng/kg bw (CONTAM, 2018).

Carcinogenicity

62. Female Sprague Dawley rats exposed to TCDD showed a significant increase in hepatocellular adenoma and cholangiocarcinoma at 100 ng/kg bw day, the estimated NOAEL body burden (based on hepatopathy) was 85 ng/kg bw (NTP, 2006). The NOAEL body burden was calculated the same as in **paragraph 49**.

Immunotoxicity

63. Administration of TCDD to male and female wild-type rats showed suppression of the percentage of Lipopolysaccharide (LPS)-induced IgM+ cells compared to AhR knockout rats. An increment of (ex vivo LPS induced) proliferation was also observed, which indicated a dysregulation of the humoral immune response. A decrease in the percentage of natural killer cell (Phadnis-Moghe et al., 2016). The NOAEL body burden for this study was 250 ng/kg bw.
64. The study by Phadnis-Moghe et al. (2016) is based on the same animal study as Harrill et al. (2016), but with a focus on immunological effects. The NOAEL body burden was calculated from the NOAEL of 22 ng/kg bw per day which corresponds to a daily exposure of $22 \times 5/7 = 15.7$ ng/kg bw per day. According to Harrill et al. (2016), this dose results in concentrations in adipose tissue and liver to around 1.5 and 2.2 ng/g tissue. Assuming the liver and adipose tissue to account for 8% and 4.5% of the body weight then gives an estimate for the body burden of $1.5 \times 0.08 + 2.2 \times 0.045 = 0.22$ ng/g (220 ng/kg bw). At a dose level of 15.7 ng/kg bw, the fraction residing in the liver + adipose tissue after repeated exposure in the rat is given by: fractional body burden = $1.934 \times \ln(15.7) + 82.39$, which gives 87.7%. The estimate body burden $220/0.88 = 250$ ng/kg bw.

Tooth and bone development

65. Female Han Wistar rats exposed to single TCDD doses between 0.03 and 1 µg/kg bw in utero or via lactational exposure resulted in reduced size or prevented the development of their third lower molars (Kattainen et al., 2001).
66. Another study also demonstrated the effects of TCDD on tooth development, administration of single doses 50 and 1000 µg TCDD/kg bw to lactating rats on day 1 after delivery resulted in half of pups lacking one or more third molars by day 22 and total lack of mineralisation in third molar cusps (Lukinmaa et al., 2001).
67. Absence of third molars in pups was also evident in the Miettinen et al., 2002 study where pregnant Dioxin-sensitive line C rats received a single dose of TCDD at 1 µg/kg bw. Other effects observed in this study was a greater frequency of missing molars was greater the earlier exposure was. Frequency of missing molars were 100%, 88% and 50% of the offspring exposed on GD11 and GD13 and GD19 respectively. Further effects in observed in female Dioxin sensitive line C rats were cariogenic lesions in the enamel of pup molars who received 0.03 µg/kg (the lowest tested dose. A NOAEL for this study was not obtained (Miettinen et al., 2006).

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

68. Final effects include tooth abnormalities in the offspring of female Rhesus Macaque monkeys that were exposed to TCDD at 300 ng/kg during gestation and lactation. A NOAEL for this study was not obtained (Yasuda et al., 2005).

Dioxin and DL-PCB toxicity in animals

Genotoxicity

69. Genotoxic effects such as chromosome aberrations were evident in buffalo cows with summed PCDD/Fs and DL-PCBs milk levels of 21.79 pg/g fat compared to the controls, with summed levels of 1.3 pg/g fat (Genuardo et al., 2012). Increases in chromosome aberrations and slight increases in sister chromatid exchange (SCE) in lymphocytes were also observed in buffalo cows. The sum of PCDD/Fs and DL-PCBs milk levels was 18.56 pg/g fat and 8.56 pg/g in farm A and B cows respectively, whereas levels in the controls were 1.75 pg/g fat (Iannuzzi et al., 2009; Di Meo et al., 2011).

Summary

TCDD

Humans

70. In humans, reproductive effects occurred in females that had median blood TCDD levels in the range of 13.4 – 62.75 pg/g fat, and in males with median blood TCDD levels between 96.5 - 210 pg/g fat at the time of environmental exposure. However, some males experiencing reproductive effects were born to mothers with median TCDD levels of 19 pg/g fat.
71. Endocrine mediated effects were observed in females with median TCDD levels between 0.70 pg/g fat in adipose tissue to 447 pg/g fat in blood. Children that experienced endocrine mediated effects (i.e. elevated b-TSH levels) and were born to mothers exposed to TCDD had median blood TCDD levels of 39 pg/g fat.
72. Carcinogenicity has been reported in males and females with median blood TCDD levels between 12.4 and 447 pg/g fat.
73. Immunotoxicity was observed in individuals with TCDD blood levels ranging between 3.5 and 90 pg/g fat. An increased risk of neurotoxicity was identified in children born to mothers with maternal TCDD blood levels of >38 pg CALUX-TEQ/g lipid.

74. Tooth defects were evident in both sexes of children, ultimately, children (under the age of 5 years) with a higher prevalence of enamel defects and hypodontia had median TCDD blood levels of 476 pg/g fat.

Animals

75. In female Sprague Dawley rats with altered clinical chemistry and haematological parameters no NOAEL body burden was identified, but effects occurred between 3 and 100 ng/kg bw per day.
76. Pregnant mice had reproductive toxicities corresponding with NOAEL body burdens between 9 and 25 ng/kg bw. As for rats mothers of male rat offspring that encountered reproductive effects had LOAEL body burdens between 42 and 50 ng/kg bw and NOAEL body burdens between 56.2 and 58.5 ng/kg bw. Additional reproductive effects were seen in male mice receiving TCDD at 400 ng/kg bw per week after an initial loading dose of 2000 ng/kg bw. However,
77. Signs of carcinogenicity such as increases in hepatocellular adenomas and cholangiocarcinomas were seen in female rats with NOAEL body burdens of 100 ng/kg bw/day

TCDD and PCDFs

Humans

78. Cancer occurred in males and females with mean TCDD blood levels of 108 and 110.5 ng/kg fat in males and females respectively, whereas mean PCDD/F blood levels of 142 and 62.7 ng TEQ/kg fat occurred in males and females respectively.

Dioxin and DL-PCBs

Humans

79. In humans, reproductive effects occurred in females aged 13-17 years with estimated median DL-PCBs blood levels of 32.1 pg BEQ/g fat. However, mothers with reproductive effects evident in their male and female children, had median PCDD/Fs and DL-PCBs maternal dietary intakes of 0.58 to 0.59 pg WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/kg bw/day respectively. Other reproductive effects were also evident in male and female children exposed to dioxins via breast milk in the mean range of 7.9 - 31.2 pg BEQ/g fat. Although, males exposed via

maternal blood had mean exposure levels between 10.93 and 41.98 pg TEQ/g fat. Furthermore, males aged 8 to 19 years had reproductive effects that were associated with mean and median blood levels between 1.5 and 21.1 pg WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/g, whereas total dioxin levels were reported as 25 pg WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/g.

80. Endocrine mediated effects in adult females were associated with mean and median PCDD/F and DL-PCB blood levels ranging between 2.92 – 26 pg WHO-TEQ/g fat. Whereas endocrine mediated effects occurring in both sexes of adolescents were associated with PCDD/F and DL-PCB blood levels between 32.1 and 108 pg BEQ/g fat. As for new-borns endocrine mediated effects were associated with mean transplacental levels of 16.2 pg WHO₁₉₉₈-TEQ/g fat. Additional endocrine effects occurring in children associated with exposure via breast milk, had a mean sum of PCDD/F and DL-PCBs of 21.5 pg WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/g fat levels and median PCDD/F and DL-PCB levels of 36.6 and 28.8 ng TEQ/kg fat respectively in girls. However, estimated median PCDD/F and DL-PCB levels in boys were 36 and 28.8 ng TEQ/kg fat respectively.
81. Increased risk of cancer in both sexes from PCDF and DL-PCB exposure has been reported alongside blood levels of >6.89 and 13.7 pg WHO₁₉₉₈-TEQ/fat respectively. Additionally, males with mean blood levels of 142 ng TEQO/kg and 62.7 ng TEQO/kg in females showed increased of cancer.
82. Immunotoxicity was observed in adults (males and females) exposed to PCDD/F and DL-PCBs with median blood levels at 16 pg WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/g fat. However, infants (male and female) displaying signs of immunotoxicity were exposed to median PCDD/F and DL-PCB levels in breast milk at 23 pg WHO₁₉₉₈-TEQ/g fat and PCDD/Fs at 32.6 pg I-TEW/g fat. Young male infants with increased risk of immunotoxicity had PCDD and PCDF blood levels of 6.92 and 2.38 pg WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/g fat respectively, whereas immunotoxicity in male and female adolescents was associated with DL-PCB levels of 2.2 pg WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/g fat, and mean sum of PCDD/F and DL-PCB levels between 32.1 and 108 pg BEQ/g fat.
83. Neurotoxicity was identified in children (male and female) aged 3 years who were born to mothers with maternal dietary PCDD/F and DL-PCB levels of >14 pg WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/kg bw. Other adverse effects include tooth development which was associated with mean PeCDF and HxCDF blood levels between 233 and 1780 pg TEQ/g fat.

Basis of the new TWI

Epidemiological data

84. The basis of EFSA's new TWI of 2 pg TEQ/kg bw/week was human epidemiological data on PCDD/T-TEQs and toxicokinetic modelling rather than animal data, which was used as supportive evidence.
85. Epidemiological data from the Russian children study that formed the basis of the TWI was the association between reduced sperm concentrations and blood PCDD/F-TEQ levels. Although, the association was no longer significant when taking into account the DL-PCB-TEQ blood levels, therefore EFSA considered it relevant to not only compare exposure to the total TEQ (i.e. sum of PCDD/Fs and DL-PCBs) with the TWI, but also PCDD/F-TEQ only.
86. Associations between exposure to TCDD during infancy/prepuberty and impaired semen quality were observed in three prospective studies (two after the Seveso incident and one from the Russian Children's Study). As described in section 3.1.8.1 of the [EFSA opinion](#) both studies had distinct differences but the Russian Children's study was selected over the Seveso study because it had more advantages such as the narrow age range (18–19 years) of participants, whereas the Seveso studies had broader age ranges, and adjusted for age. Semen samples were collected in a laboratory in the Russian Children's Study opposed to the Seveso studies in which the samples were collected at home. Additionally, not only TCDD was measured but other PCDD/Fs and DL-PCBs and the organochlorine pesticides; HCB, β -HCH and DDE were measured in the Russian Children's Study.
87. The Russian Children's Study showed effects at the lowest serum levels; EFSA considered the NOAEL to be 7 pg WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/g fat for the sum of PCDD/F TEQ, which was the median in the lowest quartile. However, no significant association was observed when including also the Co-PCB-TEQ (PCB-77, PCB-8-81, PCB-126 and PCB-169) which the Panel considered may be related to a much lower potency of PCB-126 in humans than expressed by the current WHO₂₀₀₅-TEF.
88. An additional possibility was effects of co-exposure to non-Dioxin Like PCBs, since the associations between TCDD or total TEQ and semen parameters became slightly stronger after adjustment for these, although there were no significant association between NDL-PCBs and semen parameters. Therefore, the CONTAM Panel only evaluated the association with PCDD/F-TEQ levels. For these levels, the median values in quartiles 2–4 were 10.9, 15.9 and 32.8 pg WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/ g fat, respectively. The mean sperm concentration in the lowest quartile (quartile 1) of PCDD/F-TEQ was 64

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

million/mL and the mean levels in quartile 2–4 were about 40 million/mL. This difference was considered biologically relevant.

89. In the Seveso studies, sperm concentrations differed between exposed and control groups with much higher estimated TCDD, PCDD/F-TEQ, and total TEQ levels with an apparent NOAEL level higher than the LOAEL level in the Russian Children's Study.
90. The CONTAM Panel decided to use the NOAEL of the Russian Children's study of a median serum level of 7.0 pg WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/g fat for the sum of PCDD/F TEQ in the lowest quartile as reference point for the HBGV and for derivation of the human exposure associated with this serum concentration at the age of 9 years.
91. Section 3.1.8.2 of the [EFSA opinion](#) discusses the toxicokinetic modelling used for human dietary exposure associated with the reference point for the HBGV. An age of 35 years for mothers was used in modelling, in order to cover a common age for having a first child. The first model for TCDD was the Edmond model developed by (Edmond et al., 2005) and evaluated by EFSA by transferring the ASLX codes into Berkeley-Madonna and then R. The adaptations for including a breastfeeding period were also evaluated but the model required further investigation. The CONTAM panel noted that there were several discrepancies between the calculations from the model and data reported on human levels.
92. The second toxicokinetic model developed for TCDD was the Concentration and Age-Dependent (CADM) model developed by (Carrier et al., 1995), optimised by (Aylward et al., 2005) and further adapted by (Ruiz et al., 2014) to include a growth curve and a breastfeeding period. The model estimates the TCDD levels in the fat compartment, liver and total body. However, blood levels were not predicted by the model but were assumed to be similar to those in adipose tissues when adjusted for lipid (CONTAM, 2018).
93. A number of issues were identified and the model was modified accordingly by the CONTAM Panel (Appendix E for model codes), regarding growth curves, adjustment of units for exposure after the breastfeeding period, milk intake when breastfeeding, absorption constant for infants, half-life in infants and body burden at birth.
94. Using the modified model and the NOAEL from the from the Russian Children's study, the CADM simulations indicated that following breastfeeding for 12 months, and a similar intake of sons after breastfeeding as for mothers, the intake should be below 0.3 pg TEQ/kg bw per day in order not to reach a serum concentration of 7.0 pg PCDD/F-WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/g fat at 9 years of age.

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

95. When taking into account 12 months breastfeeding followed by two-fold higher intake by boys than by adults, the intake by the mothers should be below 0.25 pg PCDD/F-WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/kg bw per day.
96. Considering the above, the Panel concluded that the data suggested that the long-term intake should remain below 0.25 pg WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/kg bw per day or 1.75 pg WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/kg bw per week to ensure that serum levels in boys remain below the NOAEL for effects on sperm concentrations of 7.0 pg WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/g fat, also when breastfed for 12 months. The value of 1.75 was rounded to 2 considering the uncertainty in the estimation of the critical serum level and corresponding daily intake. The Panel decided not to apply additional UFs, since the HBGV was based on a NOAEL obtained in a study with a relatively large number of boys (n = 133) and repeated semen sampling. As a result, the TWI of 2pg WHO₂₀₀₅-TEQ/kg bw per week was established.
97. It is important to note that the dietary exposure of breast infants should not be compared to the TWI. This is because the TWI was set to prevent a level in breast milk that would result in serum levels in children that have been associated with adverse effects. (CONTAM, 2018). In addition, the dietary exposures of toddlers and young children should not be directly compared to the TWI since an estimated two-fold higher exposure than mothers, to who the TWI applies, was already taken into account in the modelling used to establish the TWI.

Animal data

98. If the TWI were to be estimated based on LOAEL/NOAEL body burdens observed from animal data, EFSA estimated that it would have been 3 pg/kg bw per week, which is marginally higher than TWI of 2 pg TEQ/kg bw/week established by EFSA. The lowest body burden associated with adverse effects (LOAEL) was estimated to be 25 ng/kg bw estimated in the Faqi et al. (1998) study for effects on sperm concentration in male offspring. An uncertainty factor (UF) of 3.2 for extrapolating a LOAEL to NOAEL was applied and would have resulted in an estimated NOAEL body burden in the dams of 8.4 ng/kg bw. As a conservative approach, the default (UF) of 3.2 for interindividual toxicokinetic differences to account for interindividual toxicokinetic differences was applied on the NOAEL body burden, rather than the corresponding EDI leading to this body burden. CADM was used to estimate an EDI of 0.46 pg/kw bw per day which leads to this body burden in a pregnant woman after 35 years of exposure. The twofold higher exposure of a woman during childhood was not taken into account in these calculations, but this was shown to have a minor effect (CONTAM, 2018).
99. For effects on bone, the body burden at the lowest BMDL₀₅ was estimated to be 14 ng/kg bw, based on the study by Jämsä et al. (2001). Applying a UF of 3.2 to account for interindividual differences in toxicokinetics amongst humans

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

would give a body burden of 4.3 ng/kg bw for this second most sensitive endpoint, which is 1.7-fold higher than the 2.6 ng/kg bw derived for effects on semen quality in rats. As outlined in Annex 5 the COT, in 2001 set a TDI of 2 pg WHO-TEQ/kg bw to protect against effects on the developing male reproductive system resulting from the maternal body burden of dioxins (COT, 2001). This TDI was also considered protective against other possible effects of dioxins, such as cancer and cardiovascular effects. However, in 2004 a joint Scientific advisory committee on nutrition (SACN)/COT report giving advice on fish consumption established a higher guideline level of 8 pg TEQ/kg bw per day. This was to protect against non-developmental effects of dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs, which was applicable for males. This report is attached in Annex 6 of this review (COT/SACN, 2004).

Conclusion

100. The CONTAM panel concluded that based on the new TWI current exposure to PCDD/Fs and DL-PCBs are of concern as estimated intakes by the following consumer groups: Adolescents, Adults, Elderly and Very elderly exceed the new TWI (2 pg TEQ /kg bw per week) by up to a factor 15 .
101. However, the TWI is based on serum levels sampled from boys at the age of 8-9 years, and the critical window for the effects on sperm may actually be at younger age or during puberty. Furthermore, The TWI was considered protective for the general population and that it would prevent women from reaching a concentration in the blood that could lead to harmful pre- and postnatal effects. This could imply that a health-based guidance value higher than the TWI might be applicable to adult men and postmenopausal women.

Annexes to this paper

Annex 1: CONTAM opinion on the risk for animal and human health related to the presence of dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs in feed and food.

Annex 2: Discussion paper on the EFSA Opinion on “Risk for animal and human health related to the presence of dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs in feed and food”

Annex 3: Item 5: Discussion paper on the EFSA Opinion on “Risk for animal and human health related to the presence of dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs in feed and food.”

Annex 4: COT statement on FSA funded study investigating the developmental effects of dioxin (TCDD) in rats.

Annex 5: COT statement on the tolerable daily intake for dioxins and dioxin-like polychlorinated biphenyls

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

Annex 6: COT/SACN: Advice on fish consumption: risk and benefits

Questions for the committee

102. Members are asked to consider the following questions:

- i) Does the COT agree with the TWI of 2 pg WHO-TEQ/kg bw established by the CONTAM panel or should this be considered further?"
- ii) Does the Committee agree that dietary exposures of infants and young children should not be compared to the new TWI since it applies to mothers and already takes into account the higher exposures of their breast-fed infants and young children?
- iii) Are there any other population groups to which a health-based guidance value higher than the EFSA TWI might be applicable, e.g. men and postmenopausal women?
- iv) If any higher health-based guidance value were to be set for such population groups, what would be the critical health endpoint and what data should be used?

Secretariat

September 2020

Abbreviations

b-TSH	b-Thyroid stimulating hormone
β-HCH	beta-hexachlorocyclohexane
BEQ	Bioanalytical equivalent
CALUX	Chemical activated luciferase gene expression
CI	Confidence interval
CONTAM	The Panel on Contaminants in the Food Chain
DDE	Dichlorodiphenyldichloroethylene
DEN	Deep endometriotic (adenomyotic) nodules
DIE	Deep infiltrating endometriosis
DL-PCBs	Dioxin like-polychlorinated biphenyls
EFSA	European Food Safety Authority
F1	First filial generation
GD	Gestation day
HCB	Hexachlorobenzene
HR	Hazard ratio
HxCDDs	Hexachlorodibenzo-p-dioxin
IgG	Immunoglobulin G
i.p.	Intraperitoneal
i.m.	Intramuscular
I-TEQ	International Toxic Equivalent
LOAEL	Lowest observed adverse effect level
NOAEL	No observed adverse effect level
NHL	Non-Hodgkin's lymphoma
OR	Odds ratio
OvE	Ovarian endometrioma
PCB	Polychlorinated biphenyl
PCDD	Polychlorinated dibenzo-p-dioxins
PCDF	Polychlorinated dibenzofurans
PeCDF	Pentachlorodibenzofuran

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

PEND	Peritoneal endometriosis
PND	Postnatal day
POD	Point of Departure
RR	Relative risk
s.c.	Subcutaneous
SCE	Sister chromatid exchange
SMR	Standardised mortality ratio
SWHS	Seveso Women's Health Study
T4	Thyroxine
TBG	Thyroxine binding globulin
TCDD	2,3,7,8-Tetrachlorodibenzodioxin
TCDF	2,3,7,8-tetrachlorodibenzofuran
TEQ	Toxic equivalents
TEQO	international toxic equivalencies without TCDD
WHO	World Health Organisation
WHO-TE	World Health Organisation- toxic equivalent

References

- Alaluusua S, Lukinmaa PL, Torppa J, Tuomisto J and Vartiainen T. (1999). Developing teeth as biomarker of dioxin exposure. *Lancet*, 353, 206–206.
- Aylward LL, Brunet RC, Carrier G, Hays SM, Cushing CA, Needham LL, Patterson DG, Gerthoux PM, Brambilla P and Mocarelli P. (2005). Concentration-dependent TCDD elimination kinetics in humans: toxicokinetic modelling or moderately to highly exposed adults from Seveso, Italy, and Vienna, Austria, and impact on dose estimates for the NIOSH cohort.
- Baccarelli A, Pesatori AC, Masten SA, Patterson DG, Needham LL, Mocarelli P, Caporaso NE, Consonni D, Grassman JA, Bertazzi PA and Landi MT. (2004). Aryl-hydrocarbon receptor-dependent pathway and toxic effects of TCDD in humans: a population-based study in Seveso, Italy. *Toxicology Letters*, 149, 287–293.
- Baccarelli A, Giacomini SM, Corbetta C, Landi MT, Bonzini M, Consonni D, Grillo P, Patterson Jr DG, Pesatori AC and Bertazzi PA, 2008. Neonatal thyroid function in Seveso 25 years after maternal exposure to dioxin. *PLoS Med*, 5, e161.
<https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pmed.0050161>
- Bell DR, Clode S, Fan MQ, Fernandes A, Foster PMD, Jiang T, Loizou G, MacNicoll A, Miller BG, Rose M, Tran L and White S. (2007a). Relationships between tissue levels of 2,3,7,8-tetrachlorodibenzo-p-dioxin (TCDD), mRNAs, and toxicity in the developing male Wistar(Han) rat. *Toxicological Sciences*, 99, 591–604.
- Bell DR, Clode S, Fan MQ, Fernandes A, Foster PMD, Jiang T, Loizou G, MacNicoll A, Miller BG, Rose M, Tran L and White S. (2007b). Toxicity of 2,3,7,8-tetrachlorodibenzo-p-dioxin in the developing male Wistar(Han) rat. I: no decrease in epididymal sperm count after a single acute dose. *Toxicological Sciences*, 99, 214–223.
- Bell DR, Clode S, Fan MQ, Fernandes A, Foster PMD, Jiang T, Loizou G, MacNicoll A, Miller BG, Rose M, Tran L and White S. (2007c). Toxicity of 2,3,7,8-tetrachlorodibenzo-p-dioxin in the developing male Wistar(Han) rat. II: chronic dosing causes developmental delay. *Toxicological Sciences*, 99, 224–233.
- Burns JS, Lee MM, Williams PL, Korrick SA, Sergeyev O, Lam T, Revich B and Hauser R. (2016). Associations of peripubertal serum dioxin and polychlorinated biphenyl concentrations with pubertal timing among Russian boys. *Environmental Health Perspectives*, 124, 1801–1807.
- Carrier G, Brunet RC and Brodeus J. (1995). Modelling of the toxicokinetics of polychlorinated dibenzo-p-dioxins and dibenzofurans in mammals, including humans .1. Nonlinear distribution of PCDD/PCDF body burden between liver and adipose tissues.
- Caspersen IH, Haugen M, Schjolberg S, Vejrup K, Knutsen HK, Brantster AL, Meltzer HM, Alexander J, Magnus P and Kvale HE. (2016). Maternal dietary exposure to dioxins and polychlorinated biphenyls (PCBs) is associated with

language delay in 3 year old Norwegian children. *Environment International*, 91, 180–187.

Chao HR, Wang SL, Lin LY, Lee WJ and Papke O. (2007). Placental transfer of polychlorinated dibenzo-p-dioxins, dibenzofurans, and biphenyls in Taiwanese mothers in relation, to menstrual cycle characteristics. *Food and Chemical Toxicology*, 45, 259–265.

Collins JJ, Bodner K, Aylward LL, Wilken M, Swaen G, Budinsky R, Rowlands C and Bodnar CM. (2009a). Mortality rates among workers exposed to dioxins in the manufacture of pentachlorophenol. *Journal of Occupational and Environmental Medicine*, 51, 1212–1219.

Collins JJ, Bodner K, Aylward LL, Wilken M and Bodnar CM. (2009b). Mortality rates among trichlorophenol workers with exposure to 2,3,7,8-tetrachlorodibenzo-p-dioxin. *American Journal of Epidemiology*, 170, 501–506.

Committee on toxicity of chemicals in food, consumer Products and the environment. (2001). Statement on the tolerable daily intake for dioxins and dioxin-like polychlorinated biphenyls.

<https://webarchive.nationalarchives.gov.uk/20200803134655/https://cot.food.gov.uk/cotstatements/cotstatementsyrs/cotstatements2001/dioxinsstate>

Committee on toxicity of chemicals in food, consumer Products and the environment. (2007). FSA funded study investigating the developmental effects of dioxin (TCDD) in rats.

<https://webarchive.nationalarchives.gov.uk/20200803134951/https://cot.food.gov.uk/cotstatements/cotstatementsyrs/cotstatements2007/cot200702>

Croes K, Den Hond E, Bruckers L, Loots I, Morrens B, Nelen V, Colles A, Schoeters G, Sioen I, Covaci A, Vandermarken T, Van Larebeke N and Baeyens W. (2014). Monitoring chlorinated persistent organic pollutants in adolescents in Flanders (Belgium): concentrations, trends and dose-effect relationships (FLEHS II). *Environment International*, 71, 20–28.

Di Meo GP, Perucatti A, Genuardo V, Caputi-Jambrenghi A, Rasero R, Nebbia C and Iannuzzi L. (2011). Chromosome fragility in dairy cows exposed to dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs. *Mutagenesis*, 26, 269–272.

EFSA Panel on Contaminants in the Food Chain (CONTAM), Knutsen, H.K., Alexander, J., Barregård, L., Bignami, M., Brüschweiler, B., Ceccatelli, S., Cottrill, B., Dinovi, M., Edler, L. and Grasl-Kraupp, B. (2018). Risk for animal and human health related to the presence of dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs in feed and food. *EFSA Journal*, 16(11), p.e05333.

Eskenazi B, Warner M, Mocarelli P, Samuels S, Needham LL, Patterson DG, Lippman S, Vercellini P, Gerthoux PM, Brambilla P and Olive D. (2002). Serum dioxin concentrations and menstrual cycle characteristics. *American Journal of Epidemiology*, 156, 383–392.

- Eskenazi B, Warner M, Marks AR, Samuels S, Needham L, Brambilla P and Mocarelli P. (2010). Serum Dioxin Concentrations and Time to Pregnancy. *Epidemiology*, 21, 224-231.
- Flesch-Janys D, Steindorf K, Gurn P and Becher H. (1998). Estimation of the cumulated exposure to polychlorinated dibenzo-p-dioxins/furans and standardized mortality ratio analysis of cancer mortality by dose in an occupationally exposed cohort. *Environmental Health Perspectives*, 106, 655-662.
- Genualdo V, Perucatti A, Iannuzzi A, Di Meo GP, Spagnuolo SM, Caputi-Jambrenghi A, Coletta A, Vonghia G and Iannuzzi L. (2012). Chromosome fragility in river buffalo cows exposed to dioxins. *Journal of Applied Genetics*, 53, 221–226.
- Gray Jr LE and Ostby JS. (1995). In utero 2,3,7,8-tetrachlorodibenzo-p-dioxin (TCDD) alters reproductive morphology and function in female rat offspring. *Toxicology and Applied Pharmacology*, 133, 285–94.
- Halldorsson TI, Thorsdottir I, Meltzer HM, Strom M and Olsen SF. (2009). Dioxin-like activity in plasma among Danish pregnant women: dietary predictors, birth weight and infant development. *Environmental Reserach*, 109, 22–28.
- Hays LE, Carpenter CD and Petersen SL. (2002). Evidence that GABAergic neurons in the preoptic area of the rat brain are targets of 2,3,7,8-tetrachlorodibenzo-p-dioxin during development. *Environmental Health. Perspectives*, 110(Suppl 3), 369–76
- Heilier JF, Nackers F, Verougstraete V, Tonglet R, Lison D and Donnez J. (2005). Increased dioxin-like compounds in the serum of women with peritoneal endometriosis and deep endometriotic (adenomyotic) nodules. *Fertility and Sterility*, 84, 305–312.
- Humblet O, Williams PL, Korrick SA, Sergeev O, Emond C, Birnbaum LS, Burns JS, Altshul L, Patterson DG, Turner WE, Lee MM, Revich B and Hauser R. (2011). Dioxin and Polychlorinated Biphenyl Concentrations in Mother's Serum and the Timing of Pubertal Onset in Sons. *Epidemiology*, 22, 827-835.
- Iannuzzi L, Perucatti A, Genualdo V, Incarnato D, Peretti V, Rasero R, Nebbia C and Di Meo GP. (2009). Chromosome analyses in dairy cows exposed to dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs using the SCE test. *Italian Journal of Animal Science*, 8, 93–95.
- IARC (International Agency for Research on Cancer). (2012). IARC monographs on the evaluation of carcinogenic risks to humans. Chemical Agents and related occupations. Volume 100F. A review of human carcinogens.
- Ikeda M, Tamura M, Yamashita J, Suzuki C and Tomita T. (2005). Repeated in utero and lactational 2,3,7,8-tetrachlorodibenzo-p-dioxin exposure affects male gonads in offspring, leading to sex ratio changes in F2 progeny. *Toxicology and Applied Pharmacology*, 206, 351–355.
- Ishihara K, Warita K, Tanida T, Sugawara T, Kitagawa H and Hoshi N. (2007). Does paternal exposure to 2,3,7,8-tetrachlorodibenzo-p-dioxin (TCDD) affect the sex ratio of offspring? *The Journal of Veterinary Medical Science*, 69, 347–52.

Ishihara K, Ohsako S, Tasaka K, Harayama H, Miyake M, Warita K, Tanida T, Mitsuhashi T, Nanmori T, Tabuchi Y, Yokoyama T, Kitagawa H and Hoshi N. (2010). When does the sex ratio of offspring of the paternal 2,3,7,8-tetrachlorodibenzo-p-dioxin (TCDD) exposure decrease: in the spermatozoa stage or at fertilization? *Reproduction and Toxicology*, 29, 68–73.

Iszatt N, Stigum H, Govarts E, Murinova LP, Schoeters G, Trnovec T, Legler J, Thomsen C, Koppen G and Eggesbo M. (2016). Perinatal exposure to dioxins and dioxin-like compounds and infant growth and body mass index at seven years: a pooled analysis of three European birth cohorts. *Environment International*, 94, 399–407.

Jämsä T, Viluksela M, Tuomisto JT, Tuomisto J and Tuukkanen J. (2001). Effects of 2,3,7,8-tetrachlorodibenzo-p-dioxin on bone in two rat strains with different aryl hydrocarbon receptor structures. *Journal of Bone and Mineral Research*, 16, 1812–1820. doi:10.1359/jbmr.2001.16.10.1812

Kattainen H, Tuukkanen J, Simanainen U, Tuomisto JT, Kovero O, Lukinmaa PL, Alaluusua S, Tuomisto J and Viluksela M. (2001). In utero/lactational 2,3,7,8-tetrachlorodibenzo-p-dioxin exposure impairs molar tooth development in rats. *Toxicology and Applied Pharmacology*, 174, 216–24.

Korrick SA, Lee MM, Williams PL, Sergejev O, Burns JS, Patterson DG, Turner WE, Needham LL, Altshul L, Revich B and Hauser R (2011). Dioxin exposure and age of pubertal onset among Russian boys. *Environmental Health Perspectives*, 119, 1339–1344.

Lam T, Williams PL, Lee MM, Korrick SA, Birnbaum LS, Burns JS, Sergejev O, Revich B, Altshul LM, Patterson Jr DG, Turner WE and Hauser R. (2014). Prepubertal organochlorine pesticide concentrations and age of pubertal onset among Russian boys. *Environment International*, 73, 135–142.

Lam T, Williams PL, Lee MM, Korrick SA, Birnbaum LS, Burns JS, Sergejev O, Revich B, Altshul LM, Patterson Jr DG and Hauser R (2015). Prepubertal serum concentrations of organochlorine pesticides and age at sexual maturity in Russian boys. *Environmental Health Perspectives*, 123, 1216–1221.

Leijts MM, Koppe JG, Olie K, van Aalderen WM, Voogt P, Vulsma T, Westra M and ten Tusscher GW, (2008). Delayed initiation of breast development in girls with higher prenatal dioxin exposure; a longitudinal cohort study. *Chemosphere*, 73, 999–1004.

Li B, Liu HY, Dai LJ, Lu JC, Yang ZM and Huang L. (2006). The early embryo loss caused by 2,3,7,8-tetrachlorodibenzo-p-dioxin may be related to the accumulation of this compound in the uterus. *Reproductive Toxicology*, 21, 301–306.

Lukinmaa PL, Sahlberg C, Leppäniemi A, Partanen AM, Kovero O, Pohjanvirta R, Tuomisto J and Alaluusua S. (2001). Arrest of rat molar tooth development by lactational exposure to 2,3,7,8-tetrachlorodibenzo-p-dioxin. *Toxicology and Applied Pharmacology*, 173, 38–47.

Ploteau S, Cano-Sancho G, Volteau C, Legrand A, Venisseau A, Vacher V, Marchand P, Le Bizec B and Antignac J-P. (2017). Associations between internal exposure levels of persistent organic pollutants in adipose tissue and deep infiltrating endometriosis with or without concurrent ovarian endometrioma. *Environment International*, 108, 195–203.

Mably TA, Bjerke DL, Moore RW, Gendron-Fitzpatrick A and Peterson RE. (1992a). In utero and lactational exposure of male rats to 2,3,7,8-tetrachlorodibenzo-p-dioxin. III Effects on spermatogenesis and reproductive capability. *Fundamental and Applied Toxicology*, 114, 108–116.

Mably TA, Moore RW, Goy RW and Peterson RE. (1992b). In utero and lactational exposure of male rats to 2,3,7,8-tetrachlorodibenzo-p-dioxin. 2. Effects on sexual behavior and the regulation of luteinizing hormone secretion in adulthood. *Toxicology and Applied Pharmacology*, 114, 108–17.

Mably TA, Moore RW and Peterson RE. (1992c). In utero and lactational exposure of male rats to 2,3,7,8-tetrachlorodibenzo-p-dioxin. 1. Effects on androgenic status. *Toxicology and Applied Pharmacology*, 114, 97–107.

Manuwald U, Velasco Garrido M, Berger J, Manz A and Baur X. (2012). Mortality study of chemical workers exposed to dioxins: follow-up 23 years after chemical plant closure. *Occupational and Environmental Medicine*, 69, 636–642.

Martínez-Zamora MA, Mattioli L, Parera J, Abad E, Coloma JL, van Babel B, Galceran MT, Balasch J and Carmona F. (2015). Increased levels of dioxin-like substances in adipose tissue in patients with deep infiltrating endometriosis. *Human Reproduction*, 30, 1059–1068.

Miettinen HM, Alaluusua S, Tuomisto J and Viluksela M. (2002). Effect of in utero and lactational 2,3,7,8-tetrachlorodibenzo-p-dioxin exposure on rat molar development: the role of exposure time. *Toxicology and Applied Pharmacology*, 184, 57–66.

Miettinen HM, Sorvari R, Alaluusua S, Murtomaa M, Tuukkanen J and Viluksela M, (2006). The effect of perinatal TCDD exposure on caries susceptibility in rats. *Toxicological Sciences*, 91, 568–75.

Mínguez-Alarcón L, Sergeyev O, Burns JS, Williams PL, Lee MM, Korrick SA, Smigulina L, Revich B and Hauser R. (2017). A longitudinal study of peripubertal serum organochlorine concentrations and semen parameters in young men: the Russian Children's Study. *Environmental Health Perspectives*, 125, 460–466.

Miyashita C, Sasaki S, Saijo Y, Washino N, Okada E, Kobayashi S, Konishi K, Kajiwara J, Todaka T and Kishi R. (2011). Effects of prenatal exposure to dioxin-like compounds on allergies and infections during infancy. *Environmental Research*, 111, 551–558.

Mocarelli P, Gerthoux PM, Ferrari E, Patterson DG, Kieszak SM, Brambilla P, Vincoli N, Signorini S, Tramacere P, Carreri V, Sampson EJ, Turner WE and Needham LL.

(2000). Paternal concentrations of dioxin and sex ratio of offspring. *Lancet*, 355, 1858-1863. doi:10.1016/S0140-6736(00)02290-X

Mocarelli P, Gerthoux PM, Patterson DG, Milani S, Limonta G, Bertona M, Signorini S, Tramacere P, Colombo L, Crespi C, Brambilla P, Sarto C, Carreri V, Sampson EJ, Turner WE and Needham LL. (2008). Dioxin exposure, from infancy through puberty, produces endocrine disruption and affects human semen quality. *Environmental Health Perspectives*, 116, 70-77.

Mocarelli P, Gerthoux PM, Needham LL, Patterson DG, Limonta G, Falbo R, Signorini S, Bertona M, Crespi C, Sarto C, Scott PK, Turner WE and Brambilla P. (2011). Perinatal exposure to low doses of dioxin can permanently impair human semen quality. *Environmental Health Perspectives*, 119, 713–718.

Nagayama J, Kohno H, Kunisue T, Kataoka K, Shimomura H, Tanabe S and Konishi S. (2007a). Concentrations of organochlorine pollutants in mothers who gave birth to neonates with congenital hypothyroidism. *Chemosphere*, 68, 972–976.

NTP (National Toxicology Programme). (2006). Technical report on the toxicology and carcinogenesis studies of 2,3,7,8-tetrachlorodibenzo-p-dioxin (TCDD) (CAS NO. 1746-01-6) in female Harlan Sprague-Dawley rats (gavage studies). NTP TR 521. NIH Publication No. 06-4468. National Institutes of Health. Public Health Service. U.S. Department of Health and Human Services.

Nakamoto M, Arisawa K, Uemura H, Katsuura S, Takami H, Sawachika F, Yamaguchi M, Juta T, Sakai T, Toda E, Mori K, Hasegawa M, Tanto M, Shima M, Sumiyoshi Y, Morinaga K, Kodama K, Suzuki T, Nagai M and Satoh H. (2013). Association between blood levels of PCDDs/PCDFs/dioxin-like PCBs and history of allergic and other diseases in the Japanese population. *International Archives of Occupational and Environmental Health*, 86, 849–859.

Phadnis-Moghe AS, Chen W, Li J, Crawford RB, Bach A, D'Ingillo S, Kovalova N, Suarez-Martinez JE, Kaplan BLF, Harrill JA, Budinsky R, Rowlands JC, Thomas RS and Kaminski NE. (2016). Immunological characterization of the aryl hydrocarbon receptor (AHR) knockout rat in the presence and absence of 2,3,7,8-tetrachlorodibenzo-p-dioxin (TCDD). *Toxicology*, 368, 172–182.

Ruiz P, Aylward LL and Mumtaz M. (2014). Application of pharmacokinetic modelling for 2,3,7,8-tetrachlorodibenzo-p-dioxin exposure assessment. *SAR and QSAR in Environmental Research*, 25, 873–890.

Scientific advisory committee on nutrition (SACN)/ Committee on toxicity of chemicals in food, consumer products and the environment (COT). 2004. Advice on fish consumption: benefits & risks.

<https://cot.food.gov.uk/sites/default/files/cot/fishreport200401.pdf>

Simsa P, Mihalyi A, Schoeters G, Koppen G, Kyama CM, Den Hond EM, Fuelleop V and D'Hooghe TM. (2010). Increased exposure to dioxin-like compounds is associated with endometriosis in a case-control study in women. *Reproductive Biomedicine Online*, 20, 681–688.

Steenland K, Deddens J and Piacitelli L. (2001). Risk assessment for 2,3,7,8-tetrachlorodibenzo-pdioxin (TCDD) based on an epidemiologic study. *Am J Epidemiol*, 154, 451-458.

Stolevik SB, Nygaard UC, Namork E, Haugen M, Kvaalem HE, Meltzer HM, Alexander J, van Delft JHM, van Loveren H, Lovik M and Granum B. (2011). Prenatal exposure to polychlorinated biphenyls and dioxins is associated with increased risk of wheeze and infections in infants. *Food and Chemical Toxicology*, 49, 1843–1848

Stolevik SB, Nygaard UC, Namork E, Haugen M, Meltzer HM, Alexander J, Knutsen HK, Aaberge I, Vainio K, van Loveren H, Lovik M and Granum B. (2013). Prenatal exposure to polychlorinated biphenyls and dioxins from the maternal diet may be associated with immunosuppressive effects that persist into early childhood. *Food and Chemical Toxicology*, 51, 165–172.

Tsukimori K, Uchi H, Mitoma C, Yasukawa F, Chiba T, Todaka T, Kajiwara J, Yoshimura T, Hirata T, Fukushima K, Wake N and Furue M. (2012). Maternal exposure to high levels of dioxins in relation to birth weight in women affected by Yusho disease. *Environmental International*, 38, 79–86.

Wang SL, Chen TT, Hsu JF, Hsu CC, Chang LW, Ryan JJ, Guo YLL and Lambert GH. (2003). Neonatal and childhood teeth in relation to perinatal exposure to polychlorinated biphenyls and dibenzofurans: observations of the Yucheng children in Taiwan. *Environmental Research*, 93, 131–137.

Wang SL, Su PH, Jong SB, Guo YL, Chou WL and Papke O. (2005). In utero exposure to dioxins and polychlorinated biphenyls and its relations to thyroid function and growth hormone in newborns. *Environmental Health Perspectives*, 113, 1645–1650.

Warner M, Eskenazi B, Mocarelli P, Gerthoux PM, Samuels S, Needham L, Patterson D and Brambilla P. (2002). Serum dioxin concentrations and breast cancer risk in the Seveso Women's Health Study. *Environmental Health Perspectives*, 110, 625–628.

Warner M, Mocarelli P, Samuels S, Needham L, Brambilla P and Eskenazi B. (2011). Dioxin exposure and cancer risk in the seveso women's health study. *Environmental Health Perspectives*, 119, 1700–1705.

Winneke G, Ranft U, Wittsiepe J, Kasper-Sonnenberg M, Furst P, Kramer U, Seitner G and Wilhelm M. (2014). Behavioral sexual dimorphism in school-age children and early developmental exposure to dioxins and PCBs: a follow-up study of the Duisburg Cohort. *Environmental Health Perspectives*, 122, 292–298.

van den Berg M, Birnbaum LS, Denison M, de Vito M, Farland W, Feeley M, Fiedler H, Hakansson H, Hanberg A, Haws L, Rose M, Safe S, Schrenk D, Tohyama C, Tritscher A, Tuomisto J, Tysklind Walker N and Peterson RE, 2006. The 2005 World Health Organization re-evaluation of human and mammalian toxic equivalency factors for dioxins and dioxin-like compounds. *Toxicological Sciences*, 93, 223–241.

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

Vreugdenhil HJI, Slijper FME, Mulder PGH and Weisglas-Kuperus N. (2002). Effects of perinatal exposure to PCBs and dioxins on play behavior in Dutch children at school age. *Environmental Health Perspectives*, 110, A593–A598.

Yasuda I, Yasuda M, Sumida H, Tsusaki H, Arima A, Ihara T, Kubota S, Asaoka K, Tsuga K and Akagawa Y. (2005). In utero and lactational exposure to 2,3,7,8-tetrachlorodibenzo-p-dioxin (TCDD) affects tooth development in rhesus monkeys. *Reproductive Toxicology*, 20, 21–30.

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

TOX/2020/43/Annex 1

**COMMITTEE ON TOXICITY OF CHEMICALS IN FOOD,
CONSUMER PRODUCTS AND THE ENVIRONMENT**

**CONTAM opinion on the risk for animal and human health related to the
presence of dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs in feed and food.**

This can be accessed at:

<https://efsa.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/pdf/10.2903/j.efsa.2018.5333>

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

TOX/2020/43/Annex 2

COMMITTEE ON TOXICITY OF CHEMICALS IN FOOD, CONSUMER PRODUCTS AND THE ENVIRONMENT

Discussion paper on the EFSA Opinion on “Risk for animal and human health related to the presence of dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs in feed and food”

This can be accessed at:

<https://cot.food.gov.uk/sites/default/files/tox201944furtherdiscussiononefsa.pdf>

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

TOX/2020/43/Annex 3

COMMITTEE ON TOXICITY OF CHEMICALS IN FOOD, CONSUMER PRODUCTS AND THE ENVIRONMENT

Item 5: Discussion paper on the EFSA Opinion on “Risk for animal and human health related to the presence of dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs in feed and food.”

This annex contains the minutes of the dioxins item that was discussed on the 17th September 2019.

This can be accessed at:

<https://webarchive.nationalarchives.gov.uk/20200803163214/https://cot.food.gov.uk/cot-meetings/cotmeets/2019/cot-17-september-2019>

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

TOX/2020/43/Annex 4

COMMITTEE ON TOXICITY OF CHEMICALS IN FOOD, CONSUMER PRODUCTS AND THE ENVIRONMENT

COT statement on FSA funded study investigating the developmental effects of dioxin (TCDD) in rats.

This annex contains the COT's 2007 statement on FSA funded study investigating the developmental effects of dioxin (TCDD) in rats.

This can be accessed at:

<https://webarchive.nationalarchives.gov.uk/20200803165015/https://cot.food.gov.uk/sites/default/files/cot/cotstatementdioxins200702.pdf>

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

TOX/2020/43/Annex 5

COMMITTEE ON TOXICITY OF CHEMICALS IN FOOD, CONSUMER PRODUCTS AND THE ENVIRONMENT

COT statement on the tolerable daily intake for dioxins and dioxin-like polychlorinated biphenyls

This Annex contains the COT's 2001 statement on the tolerable daily intake for dioxins and dioxin-like polychlorinated biphenyls.

This statement can be accessed at:

<https://webarchive.nationalarchives.gov.uk/20200803134655/https://cot.food.gov.uk/cotstatements/cotstatementsyrs/cotstatements2001/dioxinsstate>

This is a background paper for discussion.
It does not reflect the views of the Committee and should not be cited.

TOX/2020/43/Annex 6

**COMMITTEE ON TOXICITY OF CHEMICALS IN FOOD,
CONSUMER PRODUCTS AND THE ENVIRONMENT**

COT/SACN: Advice on fish consumption: risk and benefits

This annex contains the 2004 SACN/COT report on “Advice on fish consumption: benefits & risks”

This statement can be accessed at:

<https://cot.food.gov.uk/sites/default/files/cot/fishreport200401.pdf>